

U.S. COMMISSION ON CIVIL RIGHTS

+ + + +

MEETING

+ + + +

FRIDAY, JANUARY 16, 2009

+ + + +

The Commission convened in Room 540 at 624 Ninth Street, Northwest, Washington, D.C. at 9:30 a.m., Gerald A. Reynolds, Chairman, presiding.

PRESENT:

GERALD A. REYNOLDS, Chairman
ABIGAIL THERNSTROM, Vice Chairman
TODD GAZIANO, Commissioner
GAIL L. HERIOT, Commissioner
PETER N. KIRSANOW, Commissioner (by teleconference)
ARLAN D. MELENDEZ, Commissioner
ASHLEY L. TAYLOR, JR., Commissioner
MICHAEL YAKI, Commissioner

MARTIN DANNENFELSER, Staff Director

STAFF PRESENT:

DAVID BLACKWOOD, General Counsel
CHRISTOPHER BYRNES, Chief, Programs Coordination Unit
DEBRA CARR, Associate Director
DEMITRIA DEAS
PAMELA A. DUNSTON, Chief, ASCD
LATRICE FOSHEE
MAHA JWEIED
ROBERT LERNER, Assistant Staff Director
SOCK-FOON MacDOUGALL
TINA LOUISE MARTIN, Director of Management
EMMA MONROIG, Solicitor
LENORE OSTROWSKY
KIMBERLY TOLHURST
VANESSA WILLIAMSON
AUDREY WRIGHT
MICHELE YORKMAN

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

COMMISSIONER ASSISTANTS PRESENT:

TIM FAY
DOMINIQUE LUDVIGSON
RICHARD SCHMECKEL
KIMBERLY SCHULD

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

TABLE OF CONTENTS

AGENDA	PAGE
I. APPROVAL OF AGENDA	5
II. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF DECEMBER 12, 2008 MEETING	9
III. ANNOUNCEMENTS	15
IV. STAFF DIRECTOR'S REPORT	16
V. PROGRAM PLANNING	48
- FUTURE BRIEFING TOPICS	48
- BRIEFING REPORT ON THE DEPARTMENT	70
OF JUSTICE'S ENFORCEMENT OF VOTING RIGHTS IN THE 2008 PRESIDENTIAL ELECTIONS	
VI. STATE ADVISORY COMMITTEES	105
- RECHARTERING ALABAMA SAC	105
- COMMISSIONER INVOLVEMENT IN SACS	111

Adjourn

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 P-R-O-C-E-E-D-I-N-G-S

2 (9:36 a.m.)

3 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: This meeting is of the
4 U.S. Commission on Civil Rights. The time is 9:37 on
5 January 16th, 2009. The meeting is being held at 624
6 Ninth Street, Northwest, room 540 in Washington, D.C.

7 All commissioners are present with the
8 exception of Peter Kirsanow. Commissioner Kirsanow is
9 on the line. Pete, please confirm that you are on the
10 line.

11 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Confirmed.

12 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Thank you.

13 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Mr. Chairman, since
14 Commissioner Kirsanow is not here, I move that we ask
15 him to conduct his business outside in his front yard
16 as penance for not being here today.

17 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Is there a second?

18 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I second it.

19 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Wait, wait. Pete,
20 how do we know you're not in Hawaii? He could be in
21 Hawaii, and that could be a blessing.

22 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: I am in Cleveland.
23 I've got my swimsuit on. I've on my front yard. I'm
24 making a snowman.

25 (Laughter.)

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 COMMISSIONER YAKI: That is an image I can
2 now live without.

3 **I. APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

4 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: I move to amend the
5 agenda to add a discussion of the deputy staff
6 director position. Under this motion, discussion of
7 the deputy staff director position will take place
8 immediately after the Staff Director's report. Is
9 there a second?

10 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Second.

11 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Discussion?

12 (No response.)

13 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: All in favor, please
14 say, "Aye."

15 (Whereupon, there was a chorus of "Ayes.")

16 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Any in opposition?

17 COMMISSIONER YAKI: No.

18 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Any abstentions?

19 (No response.)

20 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Please let the
21 record reflect that all commissioners with the
22 exception of Commissioner Melendez voted in favor of
23 the motion. Commissioner Melendez abstained.

24 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: What?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Let me back up. How
2 did you vote?

3 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Didn't you hear my big
4 "No"?

5 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Commissioner
6 Melendez?

7 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: I will vote no
8 also.

9 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. I'm curious.

10 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: They did not want
11 to have a discussion. So why ask them why they don't
12 want to have --

13 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: I'm curious. I may
14 regret this, but you don't want to discuss the topic?
15 Is that --

16 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: If they don't, then
17 I might change my vote to no.

18 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: I was going to say
19 --

20 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I thought this was
21 for their benefit.

22 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Yes. I thought we
23 put it on the agenda for them.

24 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Well, that was the
25 idea.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Okay. Then I vote
2 no.

3 COMMISSIONER YAKI: My question back is,
4 what are we going to be discussing about the topic?
5 Is this a continuing --

6 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Well, I assume that
7 folks will have questions.

8 COMMISSIONER YAKI: If it's a continuation
9 of the discussion that we had last time, then I would
10 vote yes. If it is, however, to take any action on
11 it, then I would vote no. So the question is, is this
12 an action item or a discussion item?

13 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Discussion
14 sometimes leads to --

15 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: The motion speaks
16 for itself.

17 COMMISSIONER YAKI: The motion does not
18 speak for itself.

19 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Let's try this
20 again from the top. Who opposes the motion?

21 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Point of inquiry.
22 Point of information.

23 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Yes, Commissioner
24 Yaki?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Is this a discussion
2 item or an action item?

3 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: We don't know yet.

4 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: The motion speaks
5 for itself, I mean.

6 COMMISSIONER YAKI: To the extent that
7 it's a discussion item, I would vote yes.

8 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: I vote no.

9 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Todd, where are
10 you?

11 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: I am confused.

12 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: So am I. So am I.
13 Okay.

14 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: The motion is that
15 we should discuss. What are other --

16 COMMISSIONER YAKI: If the motion is to
17 discuss, I vote yes.

18 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I vote no, then.

19 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: That is my reason
20 for --

21 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Life should be
22 simpler.

23 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: We have got a no
24 vote here.

25 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: I vote yes for
2 discussion.

3 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Yes for discussion?
4 Commissioner Taylor?

5 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: No.

6 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Vice Chair
7 Thernstrom?

8 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: No.

9 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: I will join the nos.
10 The motion does not carry. Strange world.

11 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: This is a whole
12 new logical world, it seems to me.

13 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Bear with me
14 while I regain my bearings. This is Richard's fault.

15 (Laughter.)

16 **II. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF**

17 **DECEMBER 12, 2008 MEETING**

18 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: The second item on the
19 agenda is the approval of the minutes held on December
20 12th, 2008. May I have a motion to approve the
21 minutes?

22 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: Yes. So moved.

23 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. A second?

24 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Second.

25 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Discussion?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 (No response.)

2 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. I just want to
3 point out that, yes, I did participate by phone, but
4 it was only for a portion of the meeting. So please
5 revise the minutes that it reflects the fact that I
6 didn't participate for the entire meeting.

7 Okay. With that amendment, all in favor?

12 || CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Marty?

13 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: We can do
14 that. I'm just wondering about for future precedent
15 if a commissioner is out for any portion of the
16 meeting, like if there are ten topics and he's away
17 for one topic, did we note that in the minutes?

18 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Yaki and
19 I participated by phone and only for a portion. How
20 long were you out of the meeting?

21 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I left after the
22 briefing.

23 || CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Oh. Okay.

1 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Actually, my presence
2 isn't reflected other than I would like the fact that
3 my presence was here for the briefing.

4 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. So we don't we
5 make a distinction between the meeting and the
6 briefing. And we would have to make that distinction
7 to reflect that.

8 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: I think that's --

9 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: I would leave it to
10 the discretion of the commissioners whether they
11 missed a significant enough portion that that should
12 be noted or not. And I think that's relevant. I
13 think Commissioner Yaki's point --

14 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I'm so glad you do,
15 Todd.

16 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: It sounded like he
17 was asking a question.

18 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Let's make the
19 amendments to reflect the facts that Commissioner Yaki
20 just put on the table.

21 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: And we will
22 note that Commissioner Yaki attended the briefing. It
23 will note whoever. It will note all of the
24 commissioners who attended the briefing.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I also would like to
2 amend the minutes. I think that the minutes should
3 also reflect that before I left, I objected to the
4 inclusion of the matter brought in at the last minute
5 regarding the deputy staff director position that we
6 had not been notified about it until basically as that
7 meeting was about to begin.

8 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: I don't remember
9 you objecting on that.

10 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I most certainly did
11 object.

12 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Did you object on
13 the record?

14 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Well, that would be
15 reflected in the transcript.

16 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Well, then we need
17 to consult the transcript. I don't remember that.

18 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Well, then go ahead
19 and do that, Todd. I'm sure you would love to do that
20 in your spare time.

21 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Are we going to
22 start up? Maha, I think you are going to lose the
23 bet. I could be wrong. In any event, we are going to
24 review the transcript. But with the other undisputed

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 amendments, I suggest that we vote. All in favor,
2 please say, "Aye."

3 (Whereupon, there was a chorus of "Ayes.")

4 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Any objections?

5 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I oppose.

6 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: No.

7 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Any abstentions?

8 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I abstain.

9 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Todd, how did you
10 vote?

11 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: No.

12 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay.

13 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: I don't
14 understand. What is controversial about this? I am
15 sorry. I was not paying sufficient attention. What
16 was the motion?

17 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: We are just trying to
18 approve the December 12th minutes.

19 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: Yes. So why --

20 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: We don't know what
21 they are going to say yet. So I am voting no because
22 I don't know what they are going to say yet.

23 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. I would like to
24 amend the motion. Let's postpone voting on the
25 December 12th meeting until after we have reviewed the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 transcript, made the suggested changes, circulated the
2 document in the hopes that we can reach a consensus.
3 That's my motion. May I have a second?

4 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Second.

5 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: Second it.

6 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Do we need to discuss
7 the motion?

8 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: No.

9 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: All in favor, please
10 say, "Aye."

11 (Whereupon, there was a chorus of "Ayes.")

12 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Any objections?

13 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I will abstain.

14 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. All right.

15 Commissioner Yaki abstained. The remaining
16 commissioners voted to approve the motion. The motion
17 passes. Okay.

18 **III. ANNOUNCEMENTS**

19 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Next Tuesday marks the
20 inauguration of the first black President of the
21 United States: Barack Obama. This is of historic
22 significance.

23 In the not too distant past, we had a
24 racial caste system in this country. And in what is,
25 comparably speaking, a short period of time, we have

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 gone from an oppressive society, where the positions
2 of blacks in society were decided for them to where we
3 have our first black President. This is a fabulous
4 cause to celebrate.

5 The inauguration significance is
6 underscored by the fact that we have just celebrated
7 Dr. Martin Luther King's birthday, which is a federal
8 holiday, as everyone knows, that he was one of the
9 main leaders of the civil rights movement.

10 He was a Baptist minister by training. He
11 became a civil rights activist early in his career,
12 leading the Montgomery bus boycott and helping to
13 found the Southern Christian Leadership Conference.

14 Dr. King's "I Have a Dream" speech
15 delivered at the 1963 march on Washington is one of
16 the speeches. It's a speech for the ages. Dr. King
17 was assassinated on April 4th, 1968 in Memphis,
18 Tennessee.

19 Dr. Martin Luther King Day was established
20 as a national holiday in 1986. Today we honor the
21 principles of liberty, equality, and nonviolent social
22 change espoused by Dr. King.

23 At this point, Mr. Staff Director, please
24 discuss your report.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: Thank you,
2 Mr. Chairman.

3 **IV. STAFF DIRECTORS'S REPORT**

4 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: First, I
5 would ask that commissioners welcome two interns from
6 Michigan State University College of Law who started
7 in the Office of General Counsel this week. Bear with
8 me if I have trouble with pronunciation of the names.
9 I did get some help on this. Andrzej Brzoznowski, a
10 second year law student who is also a graduate of
11 Northern Michigan University, and Corwin Eversley, a
12 third year law student is also a graduate of the
13 University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill. They will
14 both be at the Commission through the end of April.
15 And I believe they are both sitting in the audience
16 here this morning.

17 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Welcome aboard.

18 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: On the issue
19 of briefing reports, the briefing report on the No
20 Child Left Behind Act and supplemental education
21 services will likely be sent to commissioners for
22 review today. Comments will be requested by February
23 22nd. This review period is a week longer than usual
24 to accommodate participation in the upcoming inaugural
25 festivities.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 We are also anticipating a modification
2 today for the commissioners' statement that was
3 submitted for the census briefing report. The report
4 will then be prepared for submission to GPO.
5 Editorial and legal sufficiency reviews have been
6 completed for the covert wiretapping and illegal
7 immigration briefing reports. Appropriate changes are
8 being incorporated so that those two reports can soon
9 be sent to commissioners.

10 The briefing report on the Multiethnic
11 Placement Act was sent for editorial and legal
12 sufficiency review on January 15th. The Title IX
13 briefing report is being reviewed by the writer-editor
14 for submission to the Office of the Staff Director.

15 OCRE staff is completing a draft of the
16 briefing report on discrimination against Native
17 Americans in border towns. And then that will
18 subsequently be reviewed by the writer-editor and
19 within the Office of the Staff Director.

20 A draft of the Blaine amendments briefing
21 report is being finalized by OGC and will soon be sent
22 to the Staff Director. The briefing report on
23 encouraging minority students to pursue careers in
24 science, engineering, technology, and mathematics, the
25 STEM briefing, is being prepared by the Attorney

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 Adviser in the Office of the Staff Director. A draft
2 will likely be submitted to the Staff Director by next
3 week.

4 The statutory report on enforcing
5 prohibitions of religious discrimination in prisons.
6 This was posted on the Commission's Web site. Compact
7 discs with copies of the report were sent to Congress,
8 and printed copies have now been received. And we can
9 make those available to commissioners if they would
10 like to have copies of those.

11 Regarding the 2009 statutory report, we
12 will have some further discussion on this shortly.
13 But, just in general, staff sent interrogatories to 11
14 pertinent agencies. Staff has now met with
15 representatives of the U.S. Department of Housing and
16 Urban Development, the Federal Housing Finance Agency,
17 the Federal Trade Commission, the Office of the
18 Comptroller of the Currency, Freddie Mac, and the
19 Federal Reserve System.

20 The staff members continue to engage in
21 background research and are developing an annotated
22 outline for a draft report, which will be available
23 within about the next ten days and be sent to
24 commissioners for their review.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 OGC met with the four commissioner
2 assistants this week to provide a status report on the
3 2009 statutory report and to receive recommendations
4 from them.

5 In the area of complaints processing,
6 during the monthly reporting report, OCRE received 94
7 written complaints, 18 e-mail complaints, 3 facsimile
8 complaints, and 80 telephone complaints, of which 33
9 were repeat calls. In total, staff received and
10 processed 195 complaints during this reporting period.

11 With respect to the Web site, there were
12 40,579 visits to the Web site for 2008 from 844
13 different domains. A detailed breakdown of 2,000
14 domain names is available in the report that we
15 received. And that is my report for now.

16 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay.

17 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: I have a question.

18 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Vice Chair Thernstrom?

19 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: Mr. Staff
20 Director, could we get -- maybe we've got it and I'm
21 just missing seeing it. I would like a list, actual
22 list, with a timetable of these briefing reports. I
23 am obviously very eager to get these things out the
24 door. Too many that have been sitting around for too
25 long. So just I would like something in writing, what

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 our expectations are as to when we're getting what
2 done.

3 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: Okay. We
4 will prepare that for you.

5 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Yaki?

6 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Yes. I have a
7 question. I would like to know an answer of the
8 status report on the questions regarding the deputy
9 staff director position from the Judiciary Committee
10 and what the status of our responses is to that
11 committee and whether since the time of our last
12 response, if any, have we updated them with any new
13 additional information regarding that position.

14 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: We sent a
15 letter of response on January 13th to the two members
16 of the Judiciary Committee who inquired about the
17 deputy staff director position. And that was sent to
18 all of the commissioners along with the attachments
19 that were sent to the congressmen.

20 The letter was dated December 23rd. We
21 received a copy on January 8th from OPM. And then
22 several days later a written copy was delivered to my
23 office. So we did note in the letter to them that we
24 had just received it on January 8th. But we have not
25 received any response from them at this point in

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 response to that letter. We did share a copy of that
2 letter with OPM as well.

3 COMMISSIONER YAKI: So just to follow up,
4 looking at this letter dated January 13th, is there
5 any additional information that we should be aware of
6 with regard to the filling of this position? I read
7 somewhere that part of this requires the convening of
8 an SES QRB. Where are we with regard to that?

9 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Yaki, I
10 just want to point out that you voted against the
11 motion where this information would have been covered.

12 COMMISSIONER YAKI: No. Actually, I voted
13 for it.

14 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay.

15 COMMISSIONER YAKI: And, in fact, that was
16 for a separate discussion.

17 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: He voted against it
18 before he voted for it.

19 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I would like to state
20 that the fact is that under the Staff Director's
21 report, as the Staff Director is the person running
22 this, this is certainly with the ambit of that report.
23 So that's why I'm asking.

24 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. I am not
25 suggesting that we not continue with the conversation.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 I'm just pointing out what I see to be an
2 inconsistency.

3 COMMISSIONER YAKI: The inconsistency is
4 that I wanted clarification for this discussion or
5 action item. When the word "discuss" was used, I
6 voted for it. The majority did not. That being the
7 case, as a simple discussion item, that did not carry.

8 However, as a discussion item under the
9 purview of the Staff Director, who is running this
10 particular part of the show and as part of his duties,
11 I do not see any such restriction on what I can or
12 cannot ask with regard to that position.

13 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Yaki, no
14 one suggested that there be a restriction placed on
15 the questions.

16 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Then I reiterate my
17 question. What have we done? Have we convened a QRB?
18 And where are we with regard to that process?

19 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: An SES panel
20 met yesterday and reported seven finalists, if you
21 will, the best qualified candidates. We had 95
22 applications initially, of which 24 were considered
23 qualified by our HR Department with respect to people
24 who submitted complete applications and who were at
25 least minimally qualified for the position.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 The QRB, the Qualifications Review Board,
2 with respect to OPM is something that would be
3 necessary if the person selected is someone who is not
4 currently in the career SES. So that --

5 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Can I have a
6 clarification, then? So they found seven what? Seven
7 of them --

8 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: Seven that
9 they --

10 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: -- could be
11 possibly qualified? What is the significance of the
12 seven?

13 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: The panel
14 said that the seven were those that they deemed to be
15 the best qualified of the remaining 24 that they
16 reviewed.

17 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Are we obligated to
18 pick only from that seven if we pick at all?

19 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: That is my
20 understanding, yes.

21 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Okay. Of the seven,
22 what, then, is the next step?

23 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: To schedule
24 interviews with the seven candidates, which I would
25 anticipate beginning those interviews next week.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 COMMISSIONER YAKI: My next question has
2 to do with just within those seven, are there issues
3 of budgetary impact in terms of some would come in at
4 one level, some would come in at another level
5 depending on who has picked?

6 I'm not asking for any specifics,
7 obviously, but the reason I ask is that I know that
8 part of how this is being funded is consolidating
9 several other extant unfulfilled positions, budgetary
10 authority -- and correct me if I am wrong -- to fill
11 this position, which, as you know, has been vacant for
12 many years and, indeed, in 2000 was simply abolished.

13 But, that being as it may, it continues to
14 be a source of concern for me given the fact that we
15 are cannibalizing two or three -- I don't know how
16 many -- other positions to fund this. And where we
17 are doing the cannibalization has some concern for me.

18 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: Well, the
19 range, the salary range, that was in the job posting
20 was \$117,787 up to \$162,900. So that's about a
21 \$45,000 range from high to low.

22 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Do we know
23 historically if that was the range for the previous
24 deputy staff director? It has been obviously adjusted
25 for inflation or step increases, what have you, but

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 was that through a GS or SES range where the previous
2 deputy staff director's salary was paid that or was it
3 paid significantly lower?

4 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: Well, I
5 believe it would have been significantly lower
6 because, at least the high end of that range,
7 increases, potentially increases with inflation on a
8 year-to-year basis.

9 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Maybe I am not being
10 clear. What I am asking is that when you look at the
11 differential between staff director and deputy staff
12 director, I assume that there has been a differential
13 that has existed historically for budgetary or rank or
14 whatever reasons beyond time.

15 I am just wondering if that delta is
16 consistent in the way that you are budgeting for the
17 new deputy staff director position between the staff
18 director and here. I mean, is that delta consistent
19 or is there not much of a delta at all?

20 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: Well, for
21 purposes of budgeting, I think we anticipate the
22 possibility of paying the maximum amount. And then if
23 we wind up paying less than that, things related to
24 salary history come into play.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 Several years ago, there used to be
2 several different tiers within the SES, but those were
3 abolished. And now they have just one wide range.
4 And salary history could be a factor in determining
5 what that salary would be for that person.

6 COMMISSIONER YAKI: So it's conceivable
7 that the staff director and the deputy staff director
8 can make the exact same amount of money?

9 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: That's
10 conceivable. If the person who is chosen for the
11 deputy staff director had a salary history at that
12 level or higher, that is possible.

13 COMMISSIONER YAKI: And given that there
14 is by my calculation a \$45,000 difference in the range
15 that you just said between 117 and 162, are we
16 factoring that at all into our considerations as to
17 who or why or whether we should go through with this
18 given the fact that 45,000 is an FTE? That delta
19 alone could be one FTE in entry-level position in
20 different departments in this agency.

21 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Well, at this point, I
22 just want to jump in just to point out the obvious
23 that the ultimate impact to our budget will not be
24 known until we get a little further down the process.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 Some of these questions are premature, and it requires
2 the Staff Director to speculate.

3 COMMISSIONER YAKI: But shouldn't we at
4 least be thinking about the fact that as an agency
5 that has done what it can to cut its budget or keep
6 the cost down or where we have continued a policy of
7 not hiring special assistants for years, that a
8 \$45,000 gap between the high and low is something that
9 should be considered given that essentially that is an
10 entry-level FTE for this agency in some areas where we
11 may need it?

12 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Well, again --

13 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I mean, do we just
14 say, "Whatever," and if it consumes all of our
15 resources, so be it? I mean, I don't think that we
16 should be so cavalier.

17 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: It is not going to
18 consume all of our resources, assuming --

19 COMMISSIONER YAKI: We don't have very
20 many resources, Mr. Chair, if you recall, --

21 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Kind sir --

22 COMMISSIONER YAKI: -- to the point where
23 --

24 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Kind sir, I did not
25 interrupt you during your questioning, at least for

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 the most part. In any event, let me finish the
2 thought. If you are talking about \$45,000, that is
3 not going to cause financial stress at this agency.
4 And, quite frankly, we need some additional help at
5 the agency in terms of management. I think that it is
6 money well-spent.

7 Commissioners may disagree, and it's fine.
8 And I suspect that you disagree.

18 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner?
19 Commissioner?

23 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Yaki, you
24 have sucked up quite a bit of time on this issue.

1 COMMISSIONER YAKI: It is an important
2 discussion because --

3 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: It is not a -- that's
4 the problem.

5 COMMISSIONER YAKI: In 2005, when I first
6 came here, we were under intense scrutiny by GAO, by
7 others within the Executive and within the Legislative
8 Branches. Numerous documents and budget documents
9 were flowing to the House Judiciary Committee, which
10 at that time, as you know, was controlled by the
11 Republicans at the time. We were concerned about
12 issues regarding the cost of auditors that varied in
13 the tens of thousands between one and another in who
14 we chose and how we selected them.

15 I know that Commissioner Kirsanow was part
16 of how we selected those auditors. And cost factors
17 and what that would do to our budget was very
18 important.

19 Yes, you know, we realized we had to spend
20 some of that to get our house in order. Now that we
21 have gotten our house in order, for an agency that has
22 stated and continues to state in its budget
23 submissions that we are short personnel, that we need
24 personnel and various others, the fact that we would
25 create a position that essentially eats the equivalent

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 sum total of three potential FTEs I think is
2 completely irresponsible and why I objected to the
3 fact that it was brought up at the last minute at the
4 December meeting and why it is perfectly appropriate
5 under the Staff Director's report to continue talking
6 about this in a way because I don't think there is any
7 particular --

8 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Yaki, the
9 Staff Director has exercised his discretion in terms
10 of filling positions, in terms of allocating limited
11 resources within this agency.

12 Some commissioners may disagree. You may
13 feel that we should hire secretaries. You may feel
14 that we should hire attorneys. You may feel that we
15 should hire fill in the blanks. If there is a
16 majority of commissioners that support your views, if
17 your arguments after you marshal your facts and make
18 your arguments, if you persuade a majority of
19 commissioners that your suggestion is the better
20 choice, fine.

21 COMMISSIONER YAKI: The problem, Mr. Chair
22 -- and I understand the logic of what you are saying,
23 but let's take that logic to its conclusion, which is
24 that the Staff Director is someone I believe who works
25 for the agency, someone who works for us. We ratify

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 his or her appointment. If I recall, this was not a
2 discussion brought up in the initial 2009 budget
3 submission that we had for the agency and, in fact,
4 was, as I say, sprung up on us at the December
5 meeting. So that is one of my concerns.

6 That apart, the unwillingness of people to
7 discuss this is their choice. And I understand that

8 --

9 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Mr. Chairman, I
10 think we are discussing it. And I want to discuss it
11 further.

12 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Well, hold on.
13 Commissioner Yaki, I would suggest you recheck the
14 budget submission. This issue was discussed. I don't
15 have a problem with conversation, never have. We're
16 talking about it right now.

17 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Yes.

18 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: You have not had any
19 limitations placed on your abilities to express your
20 views.

21 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Mr. Chairman?

22 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. You had someone
23 in front of you. Commissioner Melendez?

24 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Yes. I guess I
25 still have a concern on the timing of the whole

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 proposed hiring process of a deputy director. My main
2 concern is -- let me ask this question because it's
3 kind of -- you know, as you know, the issue on making
4 these changes, as I went up, Director Marcus was with
5 us.

6 When he left, I know that he didn't really
7 recommend this position, which I thought he had a good
8 handle as to the capital plan, human resources,
9 meaning that in that plan, which encompasses to a
10 certain extent whether or not we think that we should
11 restructure to a certain extent the agency.

12 You know, it's one thing to hire people
13 who have left the organization and fill those spots,
14 but when we start to talk about deputy directors, I
15 think it kind of leads into to a certain extent a
16 restructuring to those duties and who is going to do
17 what. And so that has been my concern.

18 The other question is this. You know,
19 because of the timing -- and I know that it's almost
20 as if we are on a fast track to do this. And, as I
21 mentioned, with the new President coming on board,
22 it's just not a good timing to do this. I know that
23 we could have -- advertising a position, we did that
24 really hastily. I think we did two weeks. We could
25 have basically done three, as described in the AI 236.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 Let me ask this question. Sometimes I
2 always get the impression that somebody is lined up
3 for the job, -- you know what I mean? -- somebody's
4 friend. And I ma not saying that is true, but let me
5 ask this question. To your knowledge, Mr. Staff
6 Director, did any current agency employee discuss the
7 hiring of a deputy staff director with anyone not a
8 current Commission employee prior to the job posting
9 being made public? If so, who would that be? If you
10 can just answer it for the record?

11 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Well, that is a
12 question for the oversight hearing that will be coming
13 up this spring. Unless you have some reason to
14 believe that we have violated an agency rule, I think
15 that it's inappropriate.

16 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: I don't think
17 that's inappropriate. I think he can just answer
18 "Yes" or --

19 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Can I ask for a
20 clarification, Commissioner Melendez?

21 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Well, hold on. Hold
22 on. Hold on.

23 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: No. I just want a
24 clarification of the --

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: I asking the Staff
2 Director. I'm not asking the commissioners to answer
3 for the Staff Director. He's the Staff Director.

4 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Yes, but I am a
5 participant here. I just want to --

6 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Gentlemen, we need
7 some order here. I want to finish up the discussion
8 with Commissioner Melendez.

9 Let's go back. First, there is no
10 restructuring of the agency underway. That is how you
11 characterized this hiring. We are filling a position
12 that hasn't been filled in some years. That to my
13 mind is not a restructuring of the agency, number one.

14 Number two, you are suggesting that
15 something untoward has occurred during the hiring
16 process. That for me is serious. If you believe that
17 something has been done in an inappropriate manner, I
18 would appreciate it if we could have a discussion
19 about it.

20 If you believe that we have violated some
21 type of rule, I mean, you have done so in the past.
22 You have communicated with me, indicating when you
23 felt that there was something inappropriate. And we
24 had conversations about it.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 So in this particular instance, why do you
2 believe that someone has been preselected?

3 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: I just asked the
4 question to the Staff Director. If it hasn't
5 happened, then just say "No."

6 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: You are questioning
7 folks' integrity and --

8 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: I am not
9 questioning anybody's integrity. I am just saying
10 maybe people around here don't understand. If there
11 is a rule, then just say there is a rule that you
12 can't contact anybody prior to the job announcement
13 going out. That is all you have to say. And that
14 hasn't been done. It's very simple.

15 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Mr. Staff Director,
16 please answer Commissioner Melendez's question.

17 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: I am not
18 aware of contact that was made to anybody of
19 encouraging them to apply for a position that hadn't
20 been announced or anything.

21 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Okay. That is all
22 I asked.

23 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Was that the
24 question?

25 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. My --

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Wait, wait, wait,
2 wait. I am not sure what the question was. I thought
3 it was contacting anybody.

4 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: I thought it was
5 preselected, has anyone been preselected. I thought
6 that was the revised question. But that is why I want
7 to ask my question of clarification.

8 We discussed this in December, in a public
9 meeting. We then received a transcript. I might have
10 mentioned the possibility that this position was open.
11 I have no idea whether anyone -- would that have been
12 wrong, Commissioner Melendez, in your view if I
13 discussed the possibility that we may be listing a
14 job? I am sincerely asking.

15 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: I am asking the
16 same question. I am asking if there is any rule or
17 law that says that a commissioner can't. Before we
18 posted it, if I had a friend and I said, "You know, we
19 have got a position that is going to be coming up as a
20 deputy director," what I'm asking at the same time is,
21 would it be wrong for me to do that?

22 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: As
23 Commissioner Gaziano mentioned, in a December 12th
24 meeting, we had a very public discussion about the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 likelihood of a deputy staff director position being
2 announced.

3 I don't think it would be inappropriate
4 for someone to report on that public discussion, that
5 the Commission had had a public discussion of hiring a
6 deputy staff director. That is a topic that is in the
7 public domain.

8 And there were certainly Commission staff.
9 There were Commission staff sitting in the room who
10 would know that. And perhaps if that gave them any
11 advance notice over somebody else in the public who
12 wasn't sitting in the room, they knew that as well.

13 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: All right. That
14 is all I asked. Thank you.

15 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Gaziano?

16 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Yes. Since I think
17 I am the only commissioner who consistently wanted to
18 discuss this topic, I want to ask a few questions but
19 first a few minor other housekeeping matters.

20 I think that several of us would also
21 appreciate the same kind of list that Vice Chair
22 Thernstrom asked for on the briefing reports. I
23 assume you would probably send it to all of us as
24 well, but I am just suggesting that at least I would
25 like that and others.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 With regard to the Web site, I continue to
2 be pleased with the kind of reporting. One thing that
3 I would probably like in the future that we have done
4 with other sorts of written requests, if it is
5 possible to list the three or five -- I don't know if
6 it is, but I assume it is -- most visited Web pages or
7 if you have download kind of capabilities and a
8 number. If there are 40,579 visits, you know, whether
9 it's this report, that report, or my bio, I think that
10 might be helpful.

11 Now, with regard to the deputy staff
12 director, I think once this process has begun -- and I
13 continue to think it sounds like a sound position to
14 fill. I just want a little bit more clarification on
15 what the steps are ahead.

16 The QRB board may have included some who
17 are already career SES. They may have included some
18 that aren't. So that might affect your --

19 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: Well, I
20 think you might be mixing the QRB board with the SES
21 panel.

22 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Okay. I probably
23 am. Please help me clarify.

24 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: The group
25 that met yesterday was three SES people who reviewed

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 the applications. And then the QRB is something that
2 is organized by OPM in the event that the person who
3 is ultimately selected for the position is not a
4 member of the career SES. Anybody who is not a member
5 of the career SES has to go before this Qualifications
6 Review Board and have their credentials analyzed and
7 to make the case to that board as to why they are a
8 suitable candidate to join the SES for that particular
9 position.

10 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Okay. Well, with
11 that in mind because there are different classes of
12 people who may be in the group that you're proposing
13 to interview, what timing might you have in making
14 your recommendation?

15 As I read RAIs -- and I just want to state
16 my understanding of it -- we then have 30 days after
17 your recommendation to take action to reject someone
18 for that position, but certainly we can ratify your
19 decision and cut the 30 days short.

20 So I would hope that we would have a
21 meeting, whether we are going to have any telephonic
22 meeting -- we have a meeting on February 20, March 20,
23 where if you were able to make a recommendation to us
24 before then, we would have the ability under the AI to

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 ratify that. And the person could begin sooner than
2 the expiration of the 30 days.

3 What do you think your time frame is going
4 to be in making that recommendation to us?

5 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: I anticipate
6 to begin scheduling meetings next week. Next week is
7 a short week with the Martin Luther King holiday and
8 the inauguration. And there is some discouragement, I
9 believe, from OPM and others about having people come
10 into the city even on Wednesday, the 21st.

11 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Okay. That's fine.

12 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: So,
13 realistically, probably the Thursday, the 22nd would
14 probably be the first day of scheduling interviews.

15 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Okay. But just
16 sketching out, I mean, maybe you decide someone who is
17 already SES is the one you want to recommend, maybe
18 not. I mean, this is maybe too speculative. If it
19 is, please let me know.

20 What do you think the contingency would be
21 for you completing the process or the timing for
22 completing the process under those different
23 contingencies and making a recommendation to us?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 And I am not going to try to hold you to
2 this, but I certainly think it is worthy of filling
3 sooner, rather than later.

4 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: Well, I
5 guess it would depend on what comes out of the
6 interviews or there are some additional questions
7 about a person's background that would require further
8 checking with references and others just to verify
9 someone's application says they did this and so on,
10 did we want to get some verification that that is
11 accurate but some other independent people would agree
12 with the way someone described their background and
13 the degree of their responsibilities and so on. So
14 that would at least go into the next week, I assume,
15 so perhaps towards the middle or the end of the next
16 week, the 29th, 30th, somewhere in that area.

17 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Okay. Well, that's
18 not --

19 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: Again, I
20 think it's relative to the degree of further checking
21 that would seem appropriate.

22 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Okay. Well, let me
23 just clarify my remarks earlier. After the December
24 12th meeting, I don't remember that I certainly asked
25 anyone to even stand ready to apply for the position,

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 but I certainly mentioned that we might be listing the
2 position at some point in the future.

3 I have no idea also whether that led to
4 anything, but I certainly don't think there was
5 anything wrong with me discussing the fact that we
6 might be listing a position. And I would like any
7 commissioner who disagrees with that to let me know
8 right now.

9 I would also like any commissioner who
10 disagrees with my reading of the AI so that we have
11 some clarity on that --

12 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Folks, let's take a
13 15-minute recess. Let's make that 20 minutes.

14 (Whereupon, the foregoing matter went off
15 the record at 10:22 a.m. and resumed at 11:53 a.m.)

16 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: We are back on the
17 record. Mr. Staff Director, are you finished with
18 your report?

19 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: Yes, Mr.
20 Chairman.

21 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Are there any
22 additional questions or concerns?

23 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: Yes.
24 Commissioner Melendez had some.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: I have a question
2 about just in general, I had read the complaints, that
3 section that has complaints, and you list the number
4 of how many complaints.

5 What is the current procedure if the
6 agency receives a letter or a phone call that alleges
7 someone's right to vote was violated because of
8 discrimination? You give us a report as to how many
9 of those are there, but is there some report as to
10 what actually gets investigated?

11 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: Well, since
12 we don't have enforcement powers at the Commission, we
13 refer that complaint to the appropriate agency for
14 their investigation.

15 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: So we don't
16 actually do it ourselves? It's all farmed out, right?

17 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: Yes.

18 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Okay. The other
19 thing was I know that we had communicated back and
20 forth about some -- there were 24 interrogatories that
21 I received that I had asked for. But just to point
22 out for the record, those weren't actually something
23 where it all came up at once.

24 What I sent on a number of questions was
25 actually an accumulation of questions I asked over the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 course of a year. So when those 24 supposed
2 interrogatories were referred to in a memo I received
3 from General Counsel, just for the record, it was
4 actually my question asking for a response that was
5 accumulated, you know, that number 24.

6 So, just for the record, it wasn't really
7 intimidation or anything like that as maybe some
8 people think that I want --

9 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Melendez,
10 I am shocked. I am shocked that you would think that
11 anyone would accuse you of trying to intimidate us.

12 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: For the record, I
13 did receive some responses to some of those. And the
14 real question was, I know the General Counsel's
15 response to me at one point was there are some things
16 that the real question from my point of view is, what
17 things can we ask for? You know, are there
18 limitations as to what information is more
19 confidential that we can't really get an answer to.

20 My only point would be that if, for some
21 reason, it's too confidential, you feel that, "Just
22 answer me back so that at least I get a response and
23 say that it's confidential and we can't answer it for
24 a citing." One of the AIs, I believe -- was it 2-9 or
25 something? Is that section 2-9?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: Well, there
2 are some things that are not necessarily that you
3 absolutely can't get, but it's a matter of for the
4 Commission to decide whether that's something they
5 want to release. And if so, do they want to release
6 it in an open setting or in perhaps an executive
7 session?

8 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Okay. And the
9 other question I had, another question, what is the
10 status of the General Counsel's appointment? Now, the
11 last time that we had the meeting, you said that, I
12 believe, it has to do with whether or not we're -- if
13 that's a position that we have to fill also because I
14 thought that the General Counsel's last day was
15 January 2nd. But has that been extended or something
16 for a period of time?

17 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: No. A job
18 offer was extended, but the agency reconsidered that
19 appointment, at least for the time being.

20 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Oh, so he's not
21 leaving, then?

22 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: No.

23 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Okay. Yes. I
24 didn't know where we stood with that. What public
25 service announcements or advertising campaigns is the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 Commission now doing? And how much money is planned
2 for that in 2009?

3 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: We don't
4 have any underway at the moment, but we are going to
5 consider some.

6 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: I think one of the
7 questions I had asked was, because we're in the first
8 quarter already, which started October 1st, that there
9 was going to be an update as to the budget
10 expenditures during the first quarter to us at some
11 point?

12 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: Yes. We'll
13 get an update together. I did have a conversation
14 with the Director of the Office of Management. And we
15 get reports periodically from GSA. But at times they
16 overstate or understate where we actually are.

17 In this most recent one, it didn't count
18 an entire payroll period that did involve, I believe,
19 about \$190,000. So it skewed the number very
20 significantly.

21 So we're wanting to go back to them to try
22 to get clarification on some of those numbers when
23 they factor in at least the really big ticket items
24 that need to be considered.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Okay. That's all
2 I have, Mr. Chairman.

3 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Gaziano?

4 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Yes. I had the
5 floor when the recess was called. So I just want to
6 finish up the two, I think, final questions. I didn't
7 hear any other commissioner disagree with my
8 interpretation of the AI. That gives us the option,
9 of course, to ratify any deputy staff director nominee
10 and cut the 30 days short. Is that your understanding
11 or maybe I should ask that of the General Counsel?

12 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: I can answer
13 it. And the General Counsel if he believes I am
14 stating it inaccurately or would like to expand upon
15 it, I think we would invite him to do so. The
16 Commission, both with the General Counsel position and
17 with the deputy staff director position, should be
18 given an opportunity to act on the Staff Director's
19 decision to select the particular person for that
20 position. If the Commission does not act within 30
21 days, then the Staff Director can proceed to fill the
22 position, to go through the administrative processes
23 to fill the position.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 It is my view that if the Commission does
2 act, the Commission can act to veto it, which would
3 stop --

4 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: But if we
5 affirmatively ratify --

6 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: But if the
7 Commission acted within that 30-day period by
8 affirmatively ratifying the Staff Director's decision
9 that the Staff Director at that point could then move
10 forward.

11 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Yes, certainly. I
12 think that is the only correct interpretation. I was
13 just glad you were proceeding on that. If there were
14 some question, then maybe we would pursue some sort of
15 decision.

16 And also no commissioner has told me in
17 response to my question that it was improper if I in
18 discussing with a few folks said that the agency might
19 be listing the deputy staff director position. I
20 would still appreciate hearing from any other
21 commissioner if they think that was improper just from
22 my own personal standpoint.

23 Thank you.

24 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: Thank you.

25 **V. PROGRAM PLANNING**

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Next up is a
2 discussion of program planning, which will include
3 future briefing topics and update of the staff
4 progress on our 2009 statutory report and a briefing
5 report of the Department of Justice's enforcement of
6 voting rights in 2008, the 2008 presidential election.

7 Mr. Staff Director?

8 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: Thank you,
9 Mr. Chairman.

10 - FUTURE BRIEFING TOPICS

11 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: As I advised
12 in my memorandum of January 8th, 2009, I believe we
13 should decide soon on the briefings we will take up in
14 the third quarter of this fiscal year and beyond. I
15 attach a list of the proposed F.Y. 2009 briefing
16 report topics that received votes during the
17 commissioners' rankings of the topics in September
18 2008.

19 We had a good discussion at the September
20 meeting and subsequently approved the concept paper
21 for the December briefing. This list may serve as a
22 reference point for discussion at this business
23 meeting as commissioners consider topics for the third
24 quarter and later in the fiscal year.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

I recommend that the Commission have a briefing in March that will help inform our preparation of the 2009 statutory report. We can also consider a new topic for a briefing to be held in April, May, or June and that the consensus can be reached on the third quarter briefing topic during this meeting. The Commission could then be in a position to consider a concept paper on that topic in February.

CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Questions?

COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: I move that we do have a hearing in March in support of the statutory report.

COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Hearing or briefing?

COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: I am sorry. Briefing in support of the statutory report and that our discussion of the next item on the agenda will help inform us and staff on the focus of that briefing.

CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. I second the motion. Discussion?

COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Discussion. I know that one of the issues was to narrow down the report further. Are you saying that we would discuss narrowing it down at the February meeting?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: I hope that we
2 narrow it down as the next item on our agenda today
3 and that based on that discussion, it will help one or
4 more of us draft a concept paper for the briefing.

5 And if there is a reason to have a
6 telephone meeting to adopt a concept paper before our
7 February 20 meeting --

8 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Pete, are you on the
9 line? Pete? Frank?

10 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: I'm sorry. I had
11 it on mute. I'm sorry.

12 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Well, it sounds
13 like you are tussling in your office.

14 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Not quite.

15 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: If staff tells us
16 that a month -- our next meeting is February 20.
17 After that is March 20. If a month is difficult to
18 pull off, then maybe we could try to get the concept
19 paper drafted and approved prior to February 20.

20 But I do think the next order of business
21 will be to see whether people want to focus on the
22 statutory report. Based on that, we can then turn to
23 trying to narrow the topic down.

24 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Vice Chair Thernstrom?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: I am confused.
2 Don't we already have a concept paper for the
3 statutory report?

4 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: Yes, we do.
5 So we don't need another concept paper to hold the
6 briefing for the statutory report. The question would
7 be for a future briefing topic beyond the briefing on
8 the statutory report. If there can be some consensus
9 that might develop today, if there is a discussion
10 among commissioners, and as there was in September,
11 that perhaps that could help guide the staff in the
12 development working with commissioners in the
13 development of a concept paper that could be
14 considered in February so that we could plan for
15 another briefing in April, May, or June?

16 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Okay. Well, that
17 is a good clarification, Madam Vice Chair. Do we need
18 another concept paper for a briefing if the briefing
19 is in aid of the statutory report?

20 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: No.

21 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: We still do need to
22 narrow it down.

23 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Right. Okay. So do
24 you want to have that conversation now?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Should we vote
2 first on whether that should be our March --

3 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: In my view, it
4 should be our March program only if we narrow it down.

5 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Okay. That is
6 fine. I will postpone vote on the motion.

7 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. All right. How
8 would we narrow the topic down?

9 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Could we have a
10 discussion with Dr. Lerner and Mr. Blackwood?

11 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Sure.

12 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: I would like to
13 hear from them on what their thoughts are, what their
14 meetings at the agency --

15 MR. BLACKWOOD: Let me give you an
16 overview first. Then we can talk about that specific
17 issue about narrowing. One, what we have been doing
18 and the staff had already mentioned, we have been
19 collecting a great deal of information.

20 We have been meeting with a variety of
21 federal agencies that he outlined. And, frankly, we
22 are getting a great deal of cooperation from those
23 agencies. The only entity that we are having a little
24 bit of difficulty with at this stage, although it
25 appears that they are beginning to realize we are not

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 going away, is Fannie Mae. Freddie Mac we already met
2 with, but Fannie Mae has due to the press of business
3 not had an opportunity to meet with us yet. That is
4 being corrected.

5 Up to this stage, we have spent the bulk
6 of our time collecting the information. We have
7 obviously talked among ourselves, "What are we
8 finding?"; et cetera. But it is a recognition I think
9 that is pretty uniform among staff that we do need to
10 narrow the scope of the project and focus it to a
11 greater degree.

12 Now, I wish I could tell you today exactly
13 how I think that should be done. Unfortunately, aside
14 from the recommendation that it needs to be sharpened
15 and focused, I can't tell you where I would cut.

16 Part of that is we are waiting to see --
17 by way of example, we are meeting with the Fed three
18 different times because we have a variety of different
19 topics. The Fed has been very, very cooperative.

20 But, for example, our next meeting I
21 believe Bob is focusing on credit-scoring issues,
22 although we did talk about credit scoring the first
23 time, our first meeting.

24 Yes? Go ahead.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 DR. LERNER: Actually, we did indeed focus
2 on credit scoring at the first meeting. It was most
3 illuminating and instructive. I will be glad to go
4 into detail about exactly what that means.

5 But to get to David's point, the next
6 meeting is going to focus on what is called HMDA data,
7 which is the data that is used for compliance,
8 mortgage lending compliance, investigations by a wide
9 variety of public agencies as well as federal agencies
10 as part of their enforcement tasks.

11 It's a complicated, not so easy to use
12 data set. The Fed has used it and is very familiar
13 with it, and we are going to get a briefing, in part,
14 on that. That's what the second briefing is going to
15 be about in some considerable part, but we have
16 already had the credit-scoring briefing. Except for a
17 few questions that are follow-ups from the report
18 itself, some things that are not clear from either the
19 presentation or the report, I think we are pretty much
20 all set with what we're going to --

21 MR. BLACKWOOD: I would say that most of
22 the data is publicly available. That's one of the
23 things that we found out in this process. This is not
24 a question of we have too little. It is going to be a
25 question of synthesizing what we have. The

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 interrogatories are going to be outstanding, but we
2 don't need the interrogatories. They are not going to
3 delay us is my point of view.

4 We have talked with several of the
5 agencies about the scope of our interrogatories,
6 narrowing them, having the conversation about how to
7 get the information that we require, what information
8 they do have. At this stage, we have not had any
9 difficulty that I would highlight as far as any of
10 those agencies being uncooperative. If anything, I
11 would highlight that the Fed has been incredibly
12 cooperative, even producing some materials for us on a
13 special basis to address some of the topics we have
14 had.

15 Now, in ten days or so, our outline is due
16 to you. And we are using that process, which began a
17 few days ago, to narrow the topic. Where we think the
18 topic can be narrowed I am going to highlight that to
19 you, but I am not in a position right today to say
20 that.

21 I do think it has to be narrowed for us to
22 hit the time constraints, to hit our deadlines, but to
23 still address the topics you have all outlined for us,
24 I need to spend more time.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 The staff is very conscious of the fact
2 that at some point we have to pinch it. It is too
3 sprawling as it is. But what I anticipate is, one,
4 giving you the outline; two, perhaps on a separate
5 memorandum, some form, saying, we think this might
6 need to be a topic. You know, this is going to be an
7 issue, especially with regard to time constraints, and
8 maybe give some indication where the process itself is
9 going.

10 That was the purpose of meeting with the
11 special assistants this week. And I would say we gave
12 them a variety of links to the articles and types of
13 materials that we are looking at.

14 I made a promise that I would point out
15 that, Commissioner Yaki, because you did not have a
16 special assistant there, if you want us to send that
17 to you separately, we can do that.

18 Aside from narrowing the topic, that is
19 our biggest issue. The outline process should have
20 that result. And, unfortunately, I wish I could have
21 told you that, where I was going, today. I just can't
22 do that.

23 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Commissioner
24 Gaziano?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Thank you for the
2 update. And we can discuss about commissioner input
3 once you have the narrowing to us, but I wanted to ask
4 Dr. Lerner a few more questions.

5 As I recall from the last business
6 meeting, you were also uncertain whether the data set
7 -- and I hope it is the same one that I am trying to
8 remember, whether you could run, whether you could get
9 them and trust them to run certain data inquiries, or
10 whether we needed to take the data in the Commission's
11 computer and have you --

12 DR. LERNER: Yes.

13 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: What is your
14 thought on that?

15 DR. LERNER: In point of fact, we will not
16 have to get the data from them to run it. In fact,
17 much of what we need, perhaps all of it, but certainly
18 a good deal of it, we can repackage from the reports
19 that they have either given us or they submitted
20 publicly. So it is not necessary for there to be a --

21 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Explain repackage
22 to me. I don't know what that means. I hope we're
23 doing something original --

24 DR. LERNER: It's original as --

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: -- or is analysis
2 at least.

3 DR. LERNER: Not necessarily. This is an
4 important study. This is a study that is not
5 well-known. We would highlight some things
6 differently perhaps than the Fed has done. We might
7 if we have time analyze things in a somewhat different
8 way, maybe use some somewhat unconventional and not so
9 well-known statistical techniques to report their
10 data. And it's possible that it might be feasible to
11 do otherwise or have them do otherwise.

12 By "repackaging," I mean just that. This
13 is such an important study. And it is simply
14 something that the Commission can do well, to
15 highlight it. To replicate the kind of work that they
16 did is impossible given our time/logistical
17 constraints. To replicate even a portion of it would
18 be extraordinarily time-consuming, again given our
19 time constraints. However, if a mention has been
20 provided in a report and with perhaps some small
21 additions, it will be extraordinarily valuable. And
22 they have agreed that they will --

23 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: So the small
24 additions are willing to --

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: This is not original
2 research, then. Is that --

3 DR. LERNER: That is right.

4 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: It is not original
5 research?

6 DR. LERNER: That is correct.

7 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Okay.

8 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: And we may want to
9 pursue whether there is something else we can do
10 originally, but these additional -- well, you call
11 them additions. They would run them?

12 DR. LERNER: Yes.

13 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Can you describe
14 what they might be for someone who --

15 DR. LERNER: Oh, yes.

16 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: -- for the social
17 scientists here who do know what that might mean and
18 to the dabbler like me?

19 DR. LERNER: Okay. Well, the thing that I
20 had in mind -- and we haven't had a chance to discuss
21 it yet -- would be the way the data is presented in
22 the report itself, it is a publicly available link.
23 Anybody can download it.

24 It uses a statistical test that is not
25 particularly well-known to most people. It is a

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 statistical test that is not particularly powerful,
2 although it is commonly used in the industry; that is,
3 in the credit-scoring industry.

4 The repackaging that I had, running that I
5 had in mind would be to use a more standard multiple
6 regression, general linear model, statistical
7 techniques for estimating this stuff. It is
8 comparable to studying --

9 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: That seems original
10 to me. Maybe you don't --

11 DR. LERNER: Okay. Well, then,
12 Commissioner Gaziano, I am glad to accept your
13 recommendation. I'm not sure what --

14 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Well, I'm asking
15 for comment. I'm not the serious social scientist
16 some of the other commissioners are.

17 DR. LERNER: It would be original. In the
18 sense that it is not exactly copying it, yes, it's
19 original. Original in the sense that I would expect
20 to find things radically different or in another way
21 vary the procedures except for the point that I'm
22 making, no.

23 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: A study that is not
24 accepted as statistically significant to serious
25 scholars is a different kind of study. whether it's

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 the same result or not, it is statistically
2 significant and done in a very robust and valid way.

3 DR. LERNER: Well, their findings are
4 indeed statistically significant. And I would be
5 really startled if using a somewhat different
6 technique, that we would find things that are not
7 statistically significant. In fact, if anything, it
8 would be the other way around. So I don't expect any
9 change on that at all.

10 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Okay. What other
11 data sets have you been considering looking at since
12 --

13 DR. LERNER: Well, there are a variety of
14 data sets that we have looked at for descriptive
15 purposes. Some of the background material that we
16 hope to include is in things like trends in minority
17 home ownership over time, trends in minority credit,
18 obtaining of mortgages and credit, especially when we
19 have some information perhaps on subprime mortgages.
20 We're looking at more general information on things
21 like interest rates and things like that. We're also
22 looking at information on things like default and
23 foreclosures for different minority groups over time
24 where they exist.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 We have actually got sources for all of
2 those things. Many of them; in fact, they are all,
3 publicly available in some form or another. It is a
4 matter of bringing them in. We are, in fact, doing
5 some of that now.

6 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Okay. And then I
7 think this is the last. I hope that when we get the
8 report in ten days we have a hypothesis or two that
9 you all are going to try to be testing.

10 One of the hypotheses is the one that I
11 think Commissioner Yaki asked. And that is whether
12 there was sort of intentional racial animus in the
13 lending industry that led to a certain type of
14 predatory lending.

15 So I would like you to try to figure out
16 what kind of hypothesis you are going to form and how
17 you are going to test that. The other hypothesis is
18 something about whether government action that may
19 have led to relaxed credit standards caused certain
20 aspects of the financial crisis.

21 So those are the two hypotheses that come
22 to my mind. And the more we can focus on stating
23 those crisply and understanding what the data sets
24 will be, the better in my mind.

25 DR. LERNER: May I respond?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Sure.

2 DR. LERNER: Yes. These are, in fact, the
3 two primary things that David and my staff and I,
4 David and I have been putting together in terms of a
5 coherent outline. We have been wrestling with the
6 things you have pointed out for quite some time.
7 Those are precisely the subjects.

8 I can tell you right now on predatory
9 lending, it is going to have to take a somewhat
10 different approach than some of the others because
11 there is no federally accepted definition of what
12 predatory lending is and a statutory definition of
13 what predatory lending is. And from the data
14 perspective, worse yet, therefore, because there is no
15 federally accepted definition, there are no statistics
16 as such.

17 Having said that, there are various
18 research studies done by various groups of people.
19 And those are some of the kinds of things we are going
20 to look at.

21 I have got a bunch of them. I have read
22 through some of them. We are still in the process of
23 digesting them.

24 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: That's a good
25 qualification that maybe "predatory" is more

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 pejorative than meaningful but whether we still can
2 form a hypothesis whether there is racial animus in
3 the lending that caused a certain type of lending or
4 certain type of financial loss, foreclosures, and
5 such, correct?

6 DR. LERNER: Absolutely, yes, and the
7 other one as well. We have a good deal of data. That
8 concept paper, as you will recall, that you folks
9 approved discusses that at some length.

10 We have a lot of data and a lot of sources
11 of a lot of different sorts that bear on that as well.
12 And yes, both of those are very much part of the
13 outline; in fact, all versions of the outlines that we
14 have been wrestling with.

15 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: My final question
16 is -- this is more to you, Mr. Blackwood -- can we
17 know at this point what kind of witnesses are going to
18 be the best kind? What kind of schedule can you
19 suggest for us to give input on the witnesses for a
20 March hearing?

21 You may not know today what the best
22 witnesses are, but we want to be able to look at the
23 narrowing, hopefully approve that, and then say, hey,
24 if that is what we are examining, we want the head of
25 the Fannie Mae or Fed or --

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 MR. BLACKWOOD: I can tell you we have
2 talked generally in terms. I mean, I would see,
3 although the topic would narrow, I could actually see
4 the panels being fairly large because we have a large
5 number of government entities that would testify on
6 their own panel.

7 I mean, the big three are HUD and the Fed
8 and I would say probably the FTC. You also have
9 Fannie and Freddie, which depending on how the study
10 is targeted, may take on their own panel because there
11 would also be witnesses who would testify what they
12 think about Fannie and Freddie and their practices.

13 There are the advocacy groups that we have
14 contacted on the fair housing issue and the predatory
15 lending focus, such as the NCRC, National Community
16 Reinvestment Corporation, and also the fair housing.
17 I forget the name of it but the one that became
18 national, which is a coalition, a fair housing
19 coalition, I believe. I read a report on the state of
20 fair housing, which had a section on predatory
21 lending. And then you would tie in also for that
22 panel perhaps DOJ and HUD in its enforcement role in
23 the fair housing section.

24 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: But if our focus is
25 going to be some small subset, then I think that -- I

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 will just speak for myself. I would prefer to have
2 more time on just the officials that might illuminate
3 our oral inquiry, rather than all of the --

4 MR. BLACKWOOD: What I have done before
5 and I would propose to do again is to send around a
6 proposed list of the types of witnesses that we're
7 thinking. And I didn't even touch the credit-scoring
8 issue. So it would be a variety of witnesses on that
9 topic as well. So we would send that around. The
10 idea is also to solicit suggestions from you all as
11 well about who you would like to hear and see.

12 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Assuming you sent
13 it to us before February 20, is February 20 enough
14 time if we then comment and discuss and refine the
15 witness list or do you think we need to refine and
16 discuss and whatever the witness list before February
17 20?

18 MR. BLACKWOOD: It may be that a telephone
19 conference will be necessary at some point. I think
20 the outline will spur hopefully comments. And I will
21 make my suggestions with Dr. Lerner about where we
22 think it could be narrowed.

23 But obviously we don't decide that. And
24 we'll continue to follow the project outline until you
25 tell us we can narrow it. So we would like to get

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 that to you as soon as we can because, yes, it will
2 save us time, too, going forward and the same thing
3 with the witness-proposed project outline, not outline
4 but the types of witnesses we would anticipate having.

5 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Taylor?

6 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: So it is your
7 expectation that we will receive an outline and then
8 you would like to hear from us or it's more of a
9 question to you?

10 MR. BLACKWOOD: Absolutely. Under RAI,
11 you are supposed to. In the past, it has been
12 somewhat frustrating we don't hear comments much back
13 from commissioners. We would welcome.

14 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: Okay.

15 MR. BLACKWOOD: Tell us where you want to
16 go. Of course, if Commissioner A says, "Do this" and
17 Commissioner C says, "Do the exact opposite," you all
18 have to decide, acting as a body, where we would go.

19 And that may be why we would need a
20 telephone conference. But we could certainly gather
21 the comments, distribute them, and then say, "We need
22 a telephone conference. You have to decide, which of
23 these do you want us to pursue?"

24 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: I guess then my only
25 recommendation would be, Mr. Chair, that when the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 staff receives the comments, they should indicate
2 whether they feel comfortable proceeding because they
3 feel like they can work through the comments or if
4 they need a teleconference to make a decision.

5 I just don't want the comments to come
6 back and you all to feel frozen. So tell us if you
7 feel frozen. If you don't, frankly, you know,
8 incorporate the comments and proceed.

9 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: I would rather in
10 an affirmative Commission approve because I don't know
11 -- I might disagree with their view that they should
12 proceed with all the comments.

13 So my question was -- and I am glad to
14 defer to whether we need to do it in a telephone
15 conference before February 20 or on February 20. But
16 I would rather us come back and collectively refine.

17 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Dr. Lerner?

18 DR. LERNER: Mr. Chairman, may I make a
19 comment? Only that from the point of view of the
20 staff perspective in planning the briefing, the sooner
21 the better that we have a decision because it is so
22 easy to line up speakers. Now, it's true insofar as
23 we have federal agency folks who are in D.C. It's not
24 necessarily a problem, but it's also possible you
25 might want to avoid a divergent set of views.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 For example, the second hypothesis that
2 Commissioner Gaziano refers to, this business about
3 relaxed lending standards, that has been widely
4 debated among economists.

5 Many of them are outside D.C. For
6 example, there is an economist at the University of
7 Texas at Dallas named Stan Leibowitz, whose work was
8 mentioned in the concept paper, one. There is a whole
9 bunch of others with quite divergent perspectives who
10 can bring in, in fact, an economist's perspective on
11 some of that, too, which is not strictly an
12 enforcement perspective but might be very
13 illuminating, especially if we were to narrow our own
14 approach.

15 This would cast light on those more
16 general, broad subjects that perhaps they are in a
17 better position to investigate than we are, as opposed
18 to the things that we can investigate better than
19 they. I just look for that as an addition.

20 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: All else being
21 equal -- and I know it's all else being equal -- it's
22 better if we not wait until February 20. Are other
23 commissioners open to a teleconference?

24 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Sure. I'm speaking
25 for myself. Commissioner Melendez?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: That's fine.

2 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. So I think that
3 we have a framework for proceeding. So unless there
4 are additional questions, we will move on. Gentlemen,
5 thank you.

6 **- BRIEFING REPORT ON THE DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE'S**
7 **ENFORCEMENT OF VOTING RIGHTS IN THE**
8 **2008 PRESIDENTIAL ELECTIONS**

9 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Next step, I move that
10 the Commission approve for publication along with any
11 concurring and dissenting statements submitted by any
12 commissioner by January 30th, 2009 part A of the
13 report produced by staff and reflecting commissioner
14 and panelist input on the briefing the Commission held
15 on June 6th, 2008 on the Department of Justice's
16 enforcement of voting rights in the 2008 U.S.
17 presidential election.

18 Part A as distributed in draft form to
19 commissioners on January 8th, 2009 contains the
20 following: a brief overview and summary of the issue
21 and why the Commission chose to conduct this briefing;
22 a summery of the proceedings, consisting of synopses
23 of the panelists' oral statements during the briefing
24 and a synopsis of the question and answer session and
25 copies of the panelists' written statements.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 Under this motion, if a majority of the
2 Commission votes to adopt part A of the briefing
3 report, the Commission will then open discussion on
4 part B. If part A fails to obtain a majority of
5 votes, discussion of part B becomes moot. This
6 bifurcated vote is taken pursuant to the policy
7 adopted by the commissioners at the April 13th, 2007
8 business meeting.

9 Is there a second?

10 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Mr. Chairman, I just
11 have a problem with that. And that is if we don't get
12 to make the motion in that form, I would want to amend
13 it to include the right to respond to commissioner
14 statements.

15 And if we end up not getting the findings
16 and recommendations done today, then the schedule in
17 the motion will work because people can't do their
18 statements until they know what the findings and
19 recommendations are going to be.

20 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Well, how about this?
21 Let's get a second and discuss this.

22 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Well, I would move
23 to amend to include because I won't vote for it unless
24 there is also the right to respond. So I would move
25 to amend your motion to include and then a two-week

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 period during which commissioners can respond to each
2 other's statements.

3 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Well, wouldn't
4 we be able to accomplish that during the discussion
5 period working out the schedule, having a discussion?

6 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: But you built the
7 schedule into your motion.

8 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. We will have
9 the amendment sooner, rather than later, under your
10 approach. We would have it on the front end.

11 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Well, the
12 alternative is to move to --

13 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Discuss it.

14 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: -- amend your motion
15 but not to include the schedule for when the responses
16 will be due.

17 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Your approach
18 works. That's fine.

19 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: We can do a motion
20 like that after we know where we are.

21 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay.

22 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Why don't you just,
23 a friendly amendment to your motion, back out the part
24 about the schedule for responses?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: And that's the only
2 change?

3 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Because otherwise
4 there's not much to it. There is really nothing to
5 agree or not agree on at that point.

6 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Eventually we are
7 moving to adopt part A.

8 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes, move to adopt
9 part A.

10 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. With that
11 amendment, is there a second?

12 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Second.

13 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Discussion?

14 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I think I did have a
15 few glitches in it, though.

16 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: I think your motion
17 did allow glitches to be corrected, did it not?

18 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Yes.

19 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Are the glitches
20 significant enough you need to mention them here or --

21 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I am not sure.
22 Well, some are very minor. And some would require
23 that somebody actually sit down.

24 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Are we talking
25 about typos?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

(202) 234-4433

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

www.nealgross.com

1 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes, some are typos.

2 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Assuming they
3 don't change the meaning -- do you want to run through
4 the list?

5 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Let me just run
6 through the list.

7 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay.

8 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: On page 7, in the
9 description of Daniel Tokaji as Associate Director of
10 Election Law at Moritz, it makes it sound like he is
11 the Associate Director of Election Law. He is
12 Associate Director of this thing called Election Law @
13 Moritz, with an @ sign, instead of the word "at," and
14 it should be italicized because otherwise it sounds
15 like he directs the law.

16 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Any concerns
17 about the proposed change?

18 (No response.)

19 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Next?

20 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Second one, you
21 know, we've got the summary of proceedings that is
22 supposed to be readable. But we don't actually say
23 what these sections --

24 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Which page are you on?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Page 11. You know,
2 if you've got somebody who is not knowledgeable about
3 election law, they don't know what these sections
4 mean. We should draw up a footnote that just makes it
5 clear which sections we are talking about and what is
6 in those sections.

7 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. I am sorry. I
8 was being rude by being distracted by my gizmo.

9 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: That's all right.
10 Page 13.

11 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: Well, is
12 there something on page 11?

13 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes. We need
14 footnotes that state what those sections are.

15 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: Which
16 sections are you referring to?

17 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Section 5, section
18 2, section 2.08.

19 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: Okay.

20 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Page 13 we need a
21 space between the two paragraphs at the bottom.

22 Page 41, middle of the page, should say,
23 "African American," not "Africa American."

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 Page 45, line 5, similar, "HAVA litigation
2 was has." We don't need both of those words there.
3 That's the end of my typo list.

4 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Do you have any
5 substantive issues?

6 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: The footnotes.

7 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. So are we done?
8 Additional questions, comments?

9 (No response.)

10 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Are we ready to vote?
11 Okay. All in favor of part A, please say, "Aye."

12 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: With those changes.

13 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Yes, as amended by
14 Gail.

15 (Whereupon, there was a chorus of "Ayes.")

16 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Any objections?

17 (No response.)

18 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Abstentions?

19 (No response.)

20 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: The motion passes.

21 Okay. This was a bifurcated vote. Next up we will
22 have a discussion of the findings and recommendations.

23 Under this motion, the Commission will vote
24 individually on each finding and recommendation.

25 Those findings and recommendations receiving a

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 majority vote will be included in the report with a
2 vote tally and a sentence explaining each opposition
3 vote for that item.

4 I move that the Commission approve finding
5 one, which reads as follows, "Two sections of the
6 Department of Justice play an important role in
7 enforcing the voting rights of U.S. citizens. The
8 voting section of the Civil Rights Division enforces
9 such statutes as the Voting Rights Act, the Help
10 America Vote Act, the Uniform Overseas Citizens
11 Absentee Voting Act, and the National Voting
12 Registration Act. The voting section plays a
13 proactive role to prevent violations of voting rights
14 and is responsible for election day programs run by
15 DOJ."

16 Is there a second? Is that a yes or --

17 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: I will second so
18 that I can make another motion that we discuss whether
19 refinements to all the findings and recommendations
20 can be made in a short period of time prior to our
21 maybe teleconference in two weeks.

22 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay.

23 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: And I can explain
24 that.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. So we have a
2 second. Discussion?

3 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: I would like to
4 offer an amendment or just to propose another motion
5 if someone wants to clarify the motion that some of
6 these look quite good, but I think that the first two
7 don't seem like they're necessary for us to make as
8 sort of findings of fact. But there are some others,
9 particularly the --

10 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: Wait a minute. I
11 thought we were just discussing at the moment one on
12 the table.

13 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: I would like to
14 offer a motion that would allow us all to offer
15 modifications. I will explain a few that I have in
16 mind for another couple of week period or whatever
17 time frame commissioners are comfortable with. And
18 then we can perhaps adopt revised findings and
19 recommendations at that teleconference that we are
20 going to schedule.

21 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Todd, there is a
22 pending motion now because you seconded it. So now
23 you have to move to amend that motion to do what you
24 want to do. You should --

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: And I don't
2 understand why we're not just going through these. I
3 mean, you can propose amendments.

4 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: It is a little hard
5 to do like off the top of one's head.

6 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I will second
7 Commissioner Gaziano's reworded motion of his amended
8 motion.

9 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: Well, the reworded
10 motion runs how? I'm sorry.

11 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: That we essentially
12 refrain from voting on part B, the commissioners be
13 given additional time to --

14 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Well, let's at least
15 discuss it.

16 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Yes. And then we
17 could discuss why.

18 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: You shouldn't have
19 seconded the motion if you didn't want that.

20 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Sorry.

21 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. So there is a
22 second. All of those in favor, say, "Aye."

23 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Motion to what now?

24 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Commissioner
25 Yaki, Todd, explain your motion so that Gail --

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Can you withdraw
2 your motion so that we don't have to do a --

3 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Yes. Withdrawn.

4 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Okay. The motion is
5 withdrawn. Now make a motion.

6 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: I move that we
7 postpone final consideration of the findings and
8 recommendations at today's meeting, that we discuss
9 whether there are some ideas to tighten them a little
10 bit and that we then be given a short period of time,
11 say two weeks, to send in our revisions and that we
12 then schedule that to be adopted at the teleconference
13 in the next few weeks.

14 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Second. Okay.
15 Discussion? Yes?

16 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Particularly in
17 findings 5 through 8, for example, I think we did have
18 testimony that would support these findings. They
19 raise questions about state compliance with federal
20 laws.

21 I think the evidence that we received was
22 substantial, but we didn't have state witnesses to
23 defend them. And I would be more comfortable, as an
24 example, maybe tightening them, saying that the
25 Commission received substantial evidence that the DOJ

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 was not requiring states to do X or the Commission
2 received substantial evidence that the states were not
3 doing Y.

4 And then when we get to the
5 recommendations, we could, you know, just urge the DOJ
6 to do so.

7 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes. The
8 recommendations are nice in the sense that they are
9 all focused on DOJ. This is what DOJ should do. But
10 some of the findings suggest that we're suggesting
11 that the states didn't do a good job when, really,
12 what we heard was people either from DOJ or who had
13 been associated with DOJ. We didn't hear anybody from
14 the states saying, "Know what we're doing is just
15 right."

16 So I hate to come down hard on states here
17 without having given them an opportunity to say,
18 "We're doing it just fine."

19 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Melendez?

20 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Yes. Would it be
21 in the best interest of all of us to actually vote on
22 these recommendations at the next business meeting,
23 then?

24 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: I believe that the --

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Is that what we're
2 saying here?

3 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: I believe what was on
4 the table was voting at the --

5 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Because I don't
6 know how much time we actually need, whether it will
7 run right up to the next meeting.

8 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes. That is why it
9 is a good idea to talk about them one by one now and
10 then do them on the telephone conference.

11 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: Has a telephone
12 conference been scheduled?

13 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: No, I don't believe we
14 have selected a date yet.

15 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: We should. We
16 should do it.

17 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: We should before
18 the end of the meeting, maybe the next order of
19 business.

20 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes. Should we go
21 once --

22 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Let's continue.

23 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: And then what I
24 thought about one and two is that they are
25 unnecessary. I mean, nobody disputes these facts.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: Yes. They are
2 still worth restating for --

3 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I don't think so.

4 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: -- people who are
5 just going to read the beginning and end of a
6 document.

7 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I don't have any
8 objection to doing it, but I don't think they are
9 necessary. I am not going to fight you on that one.

10 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: Yes.

11 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I mean, my vote is
12 with you, Abby.

13 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: Okay. I mean,
14 most people look at the beginning and end of a report.
15 That is information they should have.

16 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Finding 3, any
17 comments?

18 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I thought 3 was
19 fine.

20 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Four?

21 PARTICIPANT: If there were numbers in the
22 testimony -- and right now I don't remember, I would
23 probably prefer that, but otherwise I don't have any
24 -- did this substantially increase?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: Yes. I second
2 that. I want real numbers.

3 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Five?

4 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Mr. Chair, I have
5 got to sign off. Take care, everybody.

6 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay.

7 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: Take care, Pete.

8 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: I might, you know,
9 prefer saying that we receive substantial evidence or
10 testimony to this effect or maybe the other
11 commissioners can convince me it's fine to make
12 findings. This seemed to concern me a little bit less
13 than some of the others.

14 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I think it has the
15 problem; for example, you know, the failure of certain
16 states to main up-to-date computerized statewide voter
17 registration. You know, it could be that each state
18 has their story about why what they're doing is
19 exactly right. So I would like the "We have received
20 substantial evidence."

21 Also, when we use terms like "certain
22 states," it sounds like we know which states it is,
23 but we're not telling. It should be "some states."

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: I agree. And the
2 "for instance" should be very concrete, "For instance,
3 Ohio did" X or --

4 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: If we've got that.

5 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: If you've got
6 that.

7 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Or at least "We have
8 received substantial evidence."

9 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: Yes.

10 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Ohio should be a
11 different sentence.

12 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: I hate sentences
13 like that, "Certain states."

14 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Finding 6?

15 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Can I say one more
16 thing about finding 5, though? Another problem that I
17 worry about generally is that we fail to use statutory
18 language. So it sounds like the failure to maintain
19 up-to-date computerized statewide, you know, blah blah
20 blah, you know, are they required to do that by law or
21 not? And if they are, we should be tracking the
22 language of the statute.

23 If they are not required, we need to make
24 sure that we don't suggest that there is some
25 requirement that is being violated here.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: The one word I care
2 about is "computerized." They are, states are,
3 required to maintain up-to-date statewide voter
4 registration rules. I am not sure whether they are
5 required --

6 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: You know, I want to
7 see the statutory language that says that so that
8 we're not using --

9 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: Right. And the
10 statutes in these various findings should be
11 specifically named.

12 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes.

13 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: That is, this is
14 not a Voting Rights Act violation.

15 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: It is a HAVA.

16 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes.

17 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: It is HAVA. And
18 that should be specifically said so readers know what
19 the hell we're talking about.

20 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Exactly.

21 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: But, for example,
22 federal observers and monitors, that is Voting Rights
23 Act. So, I mean, you know, let us mention a specific
24 statute we are talking about.

25 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Yaki?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Yes. Before we go to
2 it further down the list, as the person who asked for
3 this hearing to be held, I have a pretty good
4 recollection of exactly the direction and manner in
5 which it was done.

6 This was primarily a hearing for the
7 purposes of looking at DOJ preparation for the
8 November '08 election. It was meant to be broad to
9 the extent that -- you recall I asked a lot of
10 questions about how monitors were supposed to work and
11 how they interacted with election officials. And a
12 lot of comments were made about that, none of which,
13 by the way, find their way in the findings and
14 recommendations.

15 That aside, it was a briefing rooted with
16 a specific purpose. And that purpose was to provide
17 information to the public, to interested parties, and
18 to the Commission about what DOJ was doing for the '08
19 election. We did not really touch at all upon HAVA.
20 We did not really touch at all about which states were
21 doing this or that.

22 If we start going into that realm, we are
23 going way outside what the record was. And if we are
24 doing that, then we might as well say that if we are
25 going to have any findings and recommendations

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 regarding preparations for the November '08 election,
2 then we need to measure what the impacts of some of
3 the statements made by DOJ, in particular, or by some
4 of the witnesses, what realities occurred on the
5 ground.

6 I mean, we can all add anecdotal evidence
7 from those interesting months prior to November '08
8 with regard to the Ohio situation and the lawsuit in
9 Ohio, with regard to the Colorado issues, with regard
10 to Montana. I myself was in a lot of those states
11 during the last part of the election and have my own
12 fair knowledge, but that is not really what the point
13 of this hearing was.

14 That is a long way of saying in many ways,
15 I see no reason for findings and recommendations for
16 this particular report as it was essentially an
17 informational briefing frozen in time for the purposes
18 of an election occurring a few months later. If we
19 want to do a postmortem on how these issues or how
20 these preparations really play out with regard to the
21 election and then whether or not anything that they
22 talked about did or did not succeed and what
23 proscriptions or prescriptions should result from
24 that, I would be glad to do that.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 But I just don't know if this is a very
2 productive exercise and use of our time given that, by
3 its very nature, it was general, it was specific, very
4 general, not very specific, there are specifics that I
5 cared about, quite frankly, and which I talked about a
6 lot with regard to what the powers and rights of
7 monitors versus the other category, which,
8 unfortunately, my fluid brain can't get into right
9 now, what their abilities to interact with election
10 officials were, what the powers were, how they were
11 going to select people to go out, et cetera, I just
12 don't see that it's -- I think it would be a good
13 utility for historical records and for anyone who
14 wants to do 20/20 hindsight to have the report out as
15 section 8. But I don't know how much utility is going
16 to be with B, especially when we talk about a lot of
17 recommendations, for which there is very, very little
18 testimony and even fewer specifics.

19 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Vice Chair Thernstrom?

20 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: Well, I certainly
21 don't want to go outside the record. And I personally
22 would have to go back to the record to refresh my
23 understanding of what was in it.

24 And I don't care whether you eliminate
25 things, but what I don't want is vague statements

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 suggesting wrongdoing without a factual basis for
2 making such assertions.

3 And so that's why I was saying, "Okay.
4 This is the statute. And we heard testimony on these
5 problems in the following states" or whatever, but I
6 just don't want --

7 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I don't disagree with
8 you, Commissioner Thernstrom. In fact, it plays into
9 my same old sad little song I sing about this, which
10 is that you have in the two hours that we had very
11 little in terms of hard data with which to make more
12 general conclusions to come from this.

13 If you make a statement about Maryland,
14 for example, how does that relate to Virginia? How
15 does that relate to Ohio? Pennsylvania? And I don't
16 even believe that any of the testimony on Maryland had
17 anything very specific in it other than a general
18 statement about Maryland HAVA, et cetera.

19 I mean, I agree that we should not be in
20 the position of casting aspersions on anyone or
21 conclusions without a very adequate record. And I
22 think part of the problem is that that wasn't the
23 intent of this briefing at all. It is more about what
24 are you guys doing, how are you preparing. If we want

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 to go into that kind of analysis, that is a different
2 issue with a different record.

3 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: Right. And if we
4 were to talk about, say, like Maryland, for instance,
5 we would have to say we have no evidence. You know,
6 this is what we heard about Maryland. We have no
7 evidence about whether it took place in Virginia,
8 North Carolina, whatever.

9 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: But we are not
10 making statements about Maryland here.

11 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: I understand that,
12 but --

13 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I think this could
14 be worth --

15 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: -- I this is too
16 vague.

17 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes. I agree. I
18 think that Todd's suggested fix, to say, you know, "We
19 received substantial evidence on some of these
20 things," would work just fine.

21 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: And if we did
22 receive substantial evidence, you know, I would have
23 to go back to the record.

24 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I don't think we did.

25 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Mr. Chairman?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: Pardon me?

2 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I don't think we did.

3 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: Well, I would want
4 to go back. I don't know. I would have to go back to
5 the record. But I am not willing to go with
6 statements. We received substantial evidence if, in
7 fact, actually, we didn't receive --

8 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Okay. Well, I think
9 --

10 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Gaziano?

11 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: We might not get
12 the majority, but that's why we should continue to
13 work on it. First of all, I think that findings 3 and
14 4 are very important because there it was very
15 important for this Commission to help educate the
16 public that the DOJ, for example, has been increasing
17 each year.

18 These are based on the facts we knew last
19 summer, the number of observers. There were some
20 false stories, false stories we can refute with that
21 finding. If we put in the number of Voting Rights Act
22 claims, I think that is helpful.

23 With regard to the 5 through 8, I think
24 they help support the recommendations, which is,
25 regardless of exactly how we phrase it, whether it was

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 substantial evidence or significant evidence, we had
2 certain experts, certain scholars who testified, for
3 example, about illegal noncitizen voting that crossed
4 many state lines.

5 And that testimony, if I remember
6 correctly, said it's hard to know exactly how much is
7 out there. But based on what we know, we think that
8 the witness said he thought it was a significant
9 problem. So it is important for us --

10 COMMISSIONER YAKI: That was one witness.
11 I mean, how do we --

12 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Please don't
13 interrupt me. I didn't interrupt you. I didn't
14 interrupt you.

15 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I mean, how do we draw
16 a broad conclusion from one witness?

17 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Sir, I didn't
18 interrupt.

19 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Michael, let him
20 finish.

21 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: We received
22 significant, important, whatever of what one scholar
23 believed was evidence of a widespread problem.
24 Admittedly, he said -- and we had some back and forth
25 between the commissioners and the DOJ witnesses, where

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 we said, "Do you expect this is under-reported? Well,
2 is this the tip of the iceberg, the kind of
3 prosecutions you bring? Is that just the tip of the
4 iceberg?"

5 So I think that all does support a finding
6 that there was substantial evidence. And then that --

7 COMMISSIONER YAKI: What?

8 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Then that supports
9 the recommendation --

10 COMMISSIONER YAKI: One person?

11 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner.

12 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Sorry.

13 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: There were several
14 witnesses that said that the kind of evidence that is
15 known strongly suggests that there are a lot more
16 problems out there and that that would then support
17 the recommendation, for example, in number 4 that the
18 DOJ should be careful to enforce the requirements that
19 noncitizens were allowed to register to vote in the
20 general election.

21 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: At this point
22 Commissioner Yaki I suspect has something to say.

23 COMMISSIONER YAKI: No. I mean, I think
24 the statements speak for themselves. The fact that
25 you can try and extrapolate from one witness --

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: So that was a yes.

2 COMMISSIONER YAKI: -- extrapolate from
3 one witness to a broad general statement given the
4 fact that if we were to look at what happened in
5 November in 2008, I mean, it's ridiculous. It's just
6 completely, totally ridiculous. If people want to try
7 and justify who they were and what they did, they can
8 use some other forum than the Civil Rights Commission.

9 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Vice Chair Thernstrom?

10 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: Let us agree to go
11 back to the record here because I do not want
12 statements in the findings and recommendations that
13 are very dicey extrapolations from one witness. So
14 let us go back to see whether we have got the evidence
15 because no going out on limbs here.

16 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Remember, the
17 proposal isn't that we draw conclusion from the
18 evidence, simply that we state that we have such
19 evidence.

20 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: Well, but if the
21 --

22 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: You know, we can
23 negotiate on whether or not we should say this is --

24 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: The question is
25 whether we do have it. And let us look carefully at

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 exactly what we have here because I am not going to be
2 satisfied with -- I mean, you can find witnesses to
3 say anything.

4 So if we have one witness that says
5 something and we don't have anything more than that,
6 then if we want to say something about what that
7 witness testified to, we have to make it clear one
8 witness and we don't know, you know --

9 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I am confused. I
10 had been told that you drafted these. Is that not so?

11 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: You know, by this
12 time, Gail, there's so much water under the bridge I
13 have no idea.

14 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay, folks. Next up.
15 We have agreed that we are going to review the record
16 to make sure that the record supports the findings and
17 recommendations.

18 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I have other
19 comments to make about the recommendations.

20 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Are you sure?

21 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes.

22 (Laughter.)

23 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: All right. We are up
24 to 6.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: We don't have to go
2 through. Those are findings. I think we have got the
3 basic point with the findings. And that is we don't
4 want to be accusing people of wrongdoing unless we
5 have got it in the record. And we don't want to draw
6 conclusions from the facts, but we want to simply say
7 we have such evidence. Whether it's persuasive or not
8 is for another day.

9 The recommendations themselves need to
10 focus on what the statute requires and what it doesn't
11 require, like we say with citations, "DOJ should take
12 steps to ensure that states maintain up-to-date
13 computerized state voter registration rules." Well,
14 only if federal law requires that. And so we need to
15 have that nailed down. What does the statute say?
16 And what's what DOJ should do, not something else,
17 using statutory language and citing to the statute
18 because DOJ should not be making up requirements on
19 their own. And we certainly should not be making up
20 requirements for them.

21 The last one, number 4, "DOJ should
22 enforce the requirement that noncitizens not be
23 allowed to register to vote," I doubt that there is a
24 statute that says states must not allow noncitizens to

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 vote in federal elections. It probably says something
2 a little different from that.

3 I want to see what the statute says and
4 quote from that statute and cite the statute. That's
5 what DOJ should be doing, enforcing the law, not
6 something other than the law.

7 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Anything else? Any
8 specific provision you want to discuss?

9 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: No.

10 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Any other?
11 Commissioner Melendez?

12 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: My concern is that
13 I don't mind having conference calls or over the
14 telephone if we're kind of close to agreement. Where
15 I don't like conference calls is if we're in different
16 points of view and it's almost as if we're not in
17 agreement. Then we're trying to do it over the phone.
18 I would rather have us face to face at the next
19 meeting, going through all of these things --

20 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: That's a good point.

21 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: -- and hashing it
22 out, because if we try to do this over the phone, some
23 people are going to be there. It's inaugural week.
24 We're not going to have enough time.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 So I'm suggesting we just bring this back
2 on the agenda, work everything out up to that point,
3 and let's just either have recommendations or not.
4 And that will give us adequate time. I just don't
5 feel comfortable on the --

6 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: Yes. I second
7 that. I hate these phone conversations. I need to
8 see people face to face and go back and forth.

9 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: I also agree. If
10 we're close, fine. But if there is going to be debate
11 --

12 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Considering that we
13 still have to look at the record, I would say we're
14 not close.

15 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: There is no
16 disagreement on that point. Todd?

17 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: I accept that
18 friendly amendment that we vote on these February 20,
19 which means that it's incumbent upon us to get some
20 language to each other so that we can consider it
21 ahead of time and then only make tweaks February 20.

22 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. We sound like
23 we have an agreement. Next step is the State Advisory
24 Committee issues.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Are we still going
2 to have some sort of conference call to have a general
3 discussion on the narrowing the statutory --

4 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Yes. That was not --

5 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Okay. Are we going
6 to try to set that right now before we move on to SAC?

7 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. So that would
8 be --

9 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: Is that something
10 that can be done really promptly, Mr. Chairman, over
11 the phone.

12 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: I don't know that
13 we will need to vote on it. If the staff hears what
14 seems to be emerging from our collective discussion,
15 then that probably would be enough.

16 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Yes. It risks turning
17 into one of our food fights, but I don't think that
18 that is going to happen. We are trying to narrow the
19 scope. I didn't hear too much disagreement on the
20 point.

21 COMMISSIONER YAKI: That is because I am
22 sick.

23 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay.

24 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: So, as I
25 understand, the General Counsel will get us some

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 thoughts and recommendations. Do you know an exact
2 date?

3 MR. BLACKWOOD: No.

4 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: It's ten days?

5 MR. BLACKWOOD: Ten days to get the
6 outline together.

7 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Can't that include
8 some recommendations on narrowing?

9 MR. BLACKWOOD: Hopefully.

10 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Give us a date
11 you are comfortable with. Let's start from there. In
12 terms of getting the paperwork in order and --

13 MR. BLACKWOOD: I would certainly hope
14 within two weeks. I believe that the process of
15 producing the outline will also bring about some kind
16 of agreement from staff about where we need to focus
17 and where we need to limit. So I would say shortly
18 after that. I don't have a calendar in front of me.

19 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Today is the 16th.
20 Two weeks is the 30th.

21 MR. BLACKWOOD: The 30th.

22 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: So you will get us
23 something in writing on the 30th?

24 MR. BLACKWOOD: Correct.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Someone throw out a
2 date for the --

3 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Question. When we
4 receive those, do we have a week or so to review
5 those?

6 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: You have to have
7 time to review them.

8 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Okay.

9 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: So someone throw out a
10 date. Does the 6th work?

11 COMMISSIONER YAKI: No.

12 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Ninth?

13 COMMISSIONER YAKI: No.

14 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. The 5th?

15 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes, depends on the
16 time.

17 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Let's see if
18 the date works first.

19 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I may be traveling
20 across country, either the 5th or the 6th. So I
21 really can't commit to either day because that puts me
22 out of pocket on one end or the other.

23 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Is the 4th
24 workable? That gives us the weekend and a few days.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Mr. Chair, that week
2 is difficult for me because I will be in meetings.
3 And getting away to do a phone call during that -- I
4 will be in meetings starting Tuesday through either
5 Thursday or Friday and then on a plane. And trying to
6 put the signal in -- some of these meetings are rather
7 fluid -- is going to be rather difficult for me. The
8 following week is a little better.

9 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. The 7th?

10 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: The 7th is a
11 Saturday, right?

12 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Yes.

13 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: The 7th I can do.

14 It's a Saturday.

15 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: The 7th is a weekend.
16 I would prefer non-weekend and we have to have staff
17 on the phone.

18 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: The 9th doesn't work
19 for me.

20 Michael?

21 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: The 10th doesn't
22 work for me.

23 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: We should have allowed
24 Michael to put the kibosh on that date.

25 Any time in February?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I think all we need
2 is a quorum. This is not official. It's not
3 controversial.

4 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Any time in February
5 or March that work for you?

6 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: The 20th.

7 (Laughter.)

8 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Arlan, that was pretty
9 good.

10 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: All we need is a
11 quorum.

12 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: What happened to
13 the 11th?

14 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Yes.

15 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: What happened to
16 the 11th?

17 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Any objections?
18 Commissioner Melendez?

19 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Eleven is fine
20 with me.

21 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. The 11th it is.

22 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Not too early on
23 the West Coast. 11:00 o'clock Eastern?

24 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: That works for me.

25 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: 11:00 a.m.?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Yes. Is that too
2 early for you, Gail?

3 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: No. That is fine.
4 11:00 works fine.

5 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: 2:00 o'clock Eastern?

6 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: I thought you were
7 going to ask whether it was too early for me.

8 It might be.

9 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Okay. If I'm not on
10 the call, just call and wake me up.

11 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Good. February
12 11th, 11:00 Eastern Standard. Okay.

13 **VI. STATE ADVISORY COMMITTEES**

14 **- RECHARTERING ALABAMA SAC**

15 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: At this point, unless
16 we want to continue this particular discussion, I
17 would like to move on to the SACs. I move that we
18 recharter the Alabama State Advisory Committee. Under
19 this motion, the Commission appoints the following
20 individuals to that committee based on the
21 recommendations of the Staff Director: David Beito,
22 Valerie Askew, Lulu Bridges, Margaret Brown, Richard
23 Finley, Ed Haden, Randy Kelly, Shana Kluck, Raphael
24 Maharaj, Harriet Means, Byron Perkins, Mary Peters,
25 Maurice Shevin, and L'Tryce Slade. I also move that

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 the Commission reappoint David Beito as the Chair of
2 the rechartered State Advisory Committee. These
3 members will serve as uncompensated government
4 employees.

5 Under this motion, the Commission
6 authorizes the Staff Director to execute the
7 appropriate paperwork for the appointment. Is there a
8 second?

9 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: Second.

10 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Discussion?

11 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Yes, a discussion.
12 Commissioner Melendez. There was I think a notion
13 that we had reached out to the congressional district
14 of this state, but we had received some information
15 that Congressman Arthur Davis' office was not
16 contacted as far as congressional people if we stated
17 they were all contacted.

18 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Marty? Who is the
19 appropriate person to respond?

20 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: We were told
21 by the regional office that they had reached out to
22 the entire congressional delegation.

23 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Okay. You might
24 let them know that at least his office, Mr. Davis,
25 apparently they didn't receive any notification.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: We will look into it.

2 Any other comments?

3 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Would that mean
4 also that the opportunity for his office to submit a
5 name is not going to happen, then?

6 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: Can he still submit
7 a name?

8 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: You can charter a
9 SAC and then add somebody later.

10 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Unless it is full,
11 unless it is full. Is this a full slate, Chris?

12 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: We can do that, but
13 you just make a recommendation, right, that there is
14 no guarantee that the individual will be selected.

15 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: What is the number?
16 I should count.

17 PARTICIPANT: Fourteen.

18 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Okay. Then we can
19 add. Then we can add. What's the max?

20 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Nineteen.

21 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes. Let him submit
22 and see. If the selection goes up to 15, it goes up
23 to 15. But we can approve this now, have a chartered
24 SAC.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: We can add three
2 more at least.

3 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: If we don't do two
4 SACs a meeting, then we will never get through the --

5 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: We added
6 some numbers to another SAC at a previous meeting.

7 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Melendez,
8 you had --

9 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: The question is,
10 have we adequately reached out? That has been one of
11 our issues all along as far as chartering of these
12 SACs. Have we totally reached out to everybody that
13 --

14 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: I think that the
15 overall effort is a good one. You have identified a
16 potential problem. If, in fact, we did not contact
17 that office, that is a problem. We were informed that
18 we did. But I don't believe that that taints the
19 process unless you have additional examples where we
20 have gotten faulty information from staff.

21 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: I think also
22 if you consider having worked in a congressional
23 office the volume of correspondence and phone calls
24 and so on, that sometimes contact is made that is not
25 captured in that particular office, but we will

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 certainly go back and try to make sure that that
2 contact is made.

3 If you have a particular name of a person
4 that you believe we should reach out to in that
5 office, please let us know. We would be happy to do
6 that.

7 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: All right.

8 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay.

9 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: I have a question
10 not on the SACs. Can I --

11 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: Can we call the
12 question, then?

13 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes. Let's call the
14 question.

15 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: Okay.

16 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: All in favor, please
17 say, "Aye."

18 (Whereupon, there was a chorus of "Ayes.")

19 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Objections?

20 (No response.)

21 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Abstentions?

22 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Abstain, one.

23 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Melendez
24 abstains.

25 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I abstain.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioners Melendez
2 and Yaki abstain. The motion passes.

3 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: Sorry. I forgot
4 there was a motion on the table.

5 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Do you have
6 something?

7 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: I mean, actually,
8 Commissioner Yaki would be the most likely person to
9 know. And I'm not sure how to pronounce the last
10 name, S-a-e-n-z. Saenz is it, Thomas Saenz?

11 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Where?

12 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: Pardon me? This
13 is the Legal Times say she's going to head the Civil
14 Rights Division, counsel to Los Angeles Mayor.

15 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Interesting.

16 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: You don't know who
17 he is?

18 COMMISSIONER YAKI: No.

19 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: Okay.

20 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay.

21 - **COMMISSIONER INVOLVEMENT IN SACS**

22 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Next up Commissioner
23 Melendez has expressed some concerns about
24 commissioners serving on state advisory committees.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 So I open up the floor to Commissioner Melendez to
2 discuss his concerns.

3 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Yes. I had, I
4 believe. I think there have to be some just
5 recommendations as to how the Commission gets involved
6 with the SACs. As you know, we have had a question as
7 "Does it become a conflict of interest being a
8 commissioner and also chairing the SAC or even being
9 on the SAC?"

10 I e-mailed. I think you e-mailed me that
11 you had some recommendations yourself as you thought
12 about it, maybe limiting that issue.

13 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Yes, but I just wanted
14 you to articulate your concerns. I have had an
15 opportunity to think about it, but the other
16 commissioners have not. So I just wanted to make sure
17 that they have a full flavor of your concern.

18 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: My concern has
19 always been and even though there were some things
20 that -- when I came on the Commission a few years ago,
21 I wasn't real sure what the rules on our interaction
22 with the SACs were in even influencing appointments to
23 the SAC.

24 I mean, people sometimes will contact you
25 and ask. Because I am a commissioner and I'm from the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 State of Nevada, they will actually ask me what is
2 happening with the state advisory committee. And I
3 will say, "Well, you know, you can send your name into
4 the regional director, Western Region, you know, and
5 see how he can put you in the pool to be elected."

6 But, then, those were questions I had when
7 I first came on. But then after we started having
8 commissioners that were actually chairing the SAC,
9 then I wondered what the rules were doing that.

10 Otherwise if I knew that you could do
11 that, then maybe at some point to just jump-start the
12 SAC in Nevada, I would basically become the chair
13 myself and then basically if that's the intention.
14 But I didn't know at that time whether or not we were
15 prohibited from doing that or whether that becomes a
16 conflict of how the whole issue works of we're the
17 Commission and we're in some way kind of over the
18 SACs, you know, or some way appointing them, does that
19 become kind of like you're doing both things, which
20 may not be best for the Commission?

21 I'm not saying it's wrong or right. Maybe
22 it's kind of maybe there just aren't any rules as to
23 what we are supposed to be doing here. Maybe it is
24 reason for us to discuss it openly as commissioners as
25 to where should we go with this or does everybody that

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 comes in really not know what the ground rules are, so
2 you have some people doing it and some people not? So
3 I just wanted us to at some point maybe talk about
4 that so we know what we could recommend for the
5 future.

6 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. The SACs are
7 independent from the Commission. We have two
8 commissioners who are currently serving on SACs. They
9 were on the SACs before they were appointed to the
10 Commission. Speaking for myself, I would not support
11 a sitting commissioner being appointed to a SAC.

12 In our e-mail exchange, you raised an
13 issue that I thought warranted further discussion or
14 at least special consideration. And that is if a
15 commissioner is on a state advisory -- well, my
16 initial position was that the individuals who serve on
17 SACs are independent and that it was unlikely that
18 they would be cowed by a commissioner serving on a
19 SAC. And to date I received no evidence that anyone
20 has a concern with it.

21 But there was one hypothetical that I
22 toyed around with. And that is if there were a
23 disagreement between a SAC member and a SAC member who
24 was also a sitting commissioner, that individual might
25 moderate their view if they were worried that that

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 commissioner would not support that person being
2 reappointed the next time the SAC was rechartered.
3 And that's why I asked you about my proposal, which is
4 to prevent sitting commissioners from voting on the
5 SACs where they are members of the SAC.

6 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Because the issue
7 also had to do with presenting -- you know, for
8 example, out of my state or any of the states,
9 California or wherever, the real question would be how
10 much influence should the Commission have as far as
11 putting forth names? I think in the State of Nevada,
12 in my state, I could pick up 12 people that I want to
13 be on the Nevada SAC because, really, through the --

14 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I think you should
15 submit those names.

16 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: But, see, the
17 problem is I don't even have -- and that's why
18 fulfilling the Western Region with a director -- we
19 had Tom Pilla at one time. Now we've got a secretary
20 who is out there. That's why I have always been
21 adamant about making sure that these regional offices
22 are adequately staffed by somebody other than a
23 secretary that would really take the brunt of me
24 submitting my name to him, I mean.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 But then I kind of feel funny about, well,
2 how much influence is he going to have because I am a
3 commissioner, he is a regional director?

4 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Melendez,
5 we have encouraged all commissioners to submit
6 recommendations. We have been consistent on this
7 point. And I would encourage you. If you know of
8 good people to serve on SACs, I would encourage you to
9 submit those names.

10 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: But, see, that is
11 really the question. Sometimes, whereas, the
12 influence as to who actually gets -- let's say I
13 submit 12 of them and they all get submitted because
14 of my influence as a commissioner. Is that okay or
15 should it be Tom Pilla, the Regional Director, and I
16 kind of stay out of that picture completely?

17 It's just discussion, and I just need more
18 commissioners to weigh into this because I never
19 really knew what we were actually doing.

20 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. A quick
21 comment. Then Commissioner Heriot. Are you saying
22 that you believe that the process has been influenced?

23 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: I mean, you could
24 if there are really no set ground rules. And I am not
25 saying it is right or wrong. I'm just saying that --

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Is this an
2 intellectual exercise? Then we have a problem.

3 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: There is actually a
4 legal answer to this question.

5 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Heriot?

6 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Okay. We have got
7 two different issues here. One is submission of names
8 for SACs. And the other --

9 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Right.

10 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: -- is Commission
11 members serving on SACs. Let's deal with the first
12 one.

13 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Okay.

14 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: The notion that you
15 could have an inappropriate influence on the staff
16 member, we are the appointing body for the SACs, not
17 the staff. I believe that each one of us is not only
18 justified in making proposals, but it is your duty to
19 make those proposals. We are the ones who are
20 supposed to come up with these people.

21 So I think you should, by all means. If
22 you have anyone in any state that you think should
23 serve on a SAC, submit it to the Staff Director. If
24 you are worried about making a member of the lower
25 staff feel put out, submit it to the Staff Director.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 But my impression is that we are not
2 turning out SACs fast enough. If we are going to
3 charter 50 states, we have got to average about 2 per
4 meeting. And we are not doing that. We need more
5 names, not fewer. So give any name that you possibly
6 have. And let the staff try to put together a
7 balanced SAC.

8 But ultimately we are the decision-makers
9 on who sits on the SACs, not the staff. So you should
10 not feel the least bit reticent about making as many
11 suggestions as you would like. In fact, it would make
12 me very happy if you would turn out more suggestions
13 so that we could charter these SACs more quickly.

14 On the second issue, we have again the
15 problem of not chartering the SACs quickly enough.
16 What we had here is two members who were appointed
17 after they were already SACs. You don't want to just
18 explode the California SAC on a day that a new
19 commissioner is appointed so that we have to go back
20 and recharter.

21 So I think the best way to deal with it is
22 simply when you have got somebody who is on a SAC and
23 they have been appointed to the Commission, let them
24 stay there until the expiration of that SAC, which
25 will be no more than two years and probably less

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 because usually the SAC will already have been going
2 along for a while before they get appointed.

3 I don't have any objection to a rule that
4 after one is on the Commission, one no longer serves
5 on the SAC after the expiration of that SAC.

6 On the other hand, if our concern is undue
7 influence, this is not going to solve that problem at
8 all because we have already got a rule that
9 commissioners can attend any SAC meeting they want to
10 anywhere across the country. And whether they are a
11 voting member of that SAC or not, if you are worried
12 that SAC members are going to feel like, "Uh-oh. I
13 had better do the right thing because the commissioner
14 is here," they're going to think that whether you are
15 a voting member of the SAC or not.

16 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Gaziano?

17 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Yes. I was a
18 member of the Virginia SAC 11 months ago, when I was
19 appointed. The Virginia SAC hasn't met since I have
20 been on the Commission unless I missed some notice. I
21 have received a few e-mails.

22 But I really do want to follow up on what
23 Commissioner Heriot said. I don't understand the
24 possibility of undue influence. I wanted to attend a
25 SAC meeting of the D.C. when Michele Rhee was here. I

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 understand it was a fascinating hearing. I was unable
2 to attend.

3 But whether I am on the Virginia SAC or
4 not, I might also be very interested to attend,
5 particularly interested in my home state, the Virginia
6 SAC meetings. If I can do it, I will attend other
7 meetings.

8 If there is any question, I will abstain
9 from voting while I remain on the SAC. If you can
10 convince me there is any impropriety whatsoever in me
11 remaining on the Virginia SAC, I will resign right
12 now.

13 No one has made any kind of argument that
14 is at all rational to me that it is proper for us to
15 attend SAC meetings when we are not a member but it is
16 improper for us to attend SAC meetings when we were a
17 member before our appointment.

18 So please met me know. I will resign
19 right now if you can tell me what possible difference
20 does it make.

21 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Yaki?

22 COMMISSIONER YAKI: In theory, I think
23 that there is much, much merit to I think both sides.
24 The one thing I think that we need to do, though, for
25 the purposes of the appearance of impropriety -- and I

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 think that is just as important as whether there is
2 impropriety there itself -- is to have stronger -- I
3 won't say "stronger" because we don't have any --
4 conflict of interest guidelines. And by this I mean
5 the following. I do not believe that any person who
6 sits on a SAC should be allowed to make
7 recommendations to that SAC while he or she is a
8 member, number one, because --

9 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Can you explain
10 why?

11 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: Why?

12 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Can you explain
13 why? Because I can do that if I am attending the
14 Virginia SAC after I quit.

15 COMMISSIONER YAKI: That is fine. Then
16 you have quit.

17 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: How is the
18 appearance issue at all different? Give me a logical
19 argument.

20 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I believe that if you
21 are a member of that committee and you are a member of
22 the appointing body of that committee, I think that to
23 me creates an irreconcilable appearance of a conflict
24 of interest.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: That is what
2 subcommittees always are. That happens routinely.

3 COMMISSIONER YAKI: It is not a
4 subcommittee.

5 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Explain the logic.

6 COMMISSIONER YAKI: It is not a
7 subcommittee.

8 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Lower your voices.

9 COMMISSIONER YAKI: You just called it a
10 separate entity. It's not a subcommittee.

11 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes. But why should
12 it be treated any differently?

13 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: You just restated
14 your argument. I want to know if there is any logic.
15 Give me a logical argument, rather than restating the
16 ridiculous point.

17 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioners.

18 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Let's see. You want a
19 logical argument, Commissioner Gaziano? Okay. Here
20 we go. You are on the Virginia SAC. You are just
21 regular Todd Gaziano on the SAC. I am Commissioner
22 Yaki on the Virginia SAC. No. Let's put it this way.

23 You are not even on the SAC. I do not
24 know why. I do not know why. I don't think it is
25 proper for me to be in a position as a member of that

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 SAC to decide who I am going to recommend to that SAC
2 and then also vote on it at the same time. I think
3 that creates an --

4 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: It is our duty to
5 recommend people for all SACs.

6 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I don't think you --

7 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: It is our duty to
8 attend SAC meetings when we can.

9 COMMISSIONER YAKI: First of all, first of
10 all, let me say -- look, let me just say this. First
11 off, let me say this.

12 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: There is a --

13 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Folks, enough. Lower
14 your voices.

15 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: You know what? That
16 is a good thing.

17 (Laughter.)

18 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: One at time, folks. I
19 mean, we have loose rules here, but lower your voices.
20 Let the other person finish. Extend the common
21 courtesies that you would expect.

22 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I agree. Let me speak
23 in a calm and clear voice. I think we have a problem
24 if we are the -- and, in fact, there are GSA rules
25 that talk about this, that talk about the fact that

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 you have problems of appearances of impropriety under
2 undue influence if you are someone who has power,
3 influence over that person with whom you sit. So I
4 think that if you also serve on the Commission and are
5 recommending people for the state SAC upon which you
6 sit, I think that creates the impropriety.

7 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Yaki, did
8 you read the motion that I circulated, --

9 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Yes.

10 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: -- the draft motion?
11 Does that fix the problem?

12 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Not quite. Let me
13 just say this. It may be I do not know if it is our
14 duty to recommend people to the SAC. I think it is
15 something that we can and should do if we want to.

16 However, when we adopted the lean six
17 sigma process, we also adopted a body of criteria by
18 which SACs were supposed to be balanced. I do not
19 know, and I can speak for myself. I think that is the
20 issue that Commissioner Melendez raised.

21 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Well, let Mr. --

22 COMMISSIONER YAKI: No, no, no. But I
23 think this is what he was trying to say, that we are
24 not in a position to engage in that balancing act the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 entire time when we are recommending who or what we
2 want to say. So when we are recommending --

3 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: He is right here.

4 COMMISSIONER YAKI: -- a large amount of
5 people --

6 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: He never brought that
7 particular issue up. Now, he's --

8 COMMISSIONER YAKI: No. He did. He did.

9 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Balance?

10 COMMISSIONER YAKI: When you talk about
11 the different -- not about balance, the criteria.

12 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: The Commission balance
13 --

14 COMMISSIONER YAKI: There is different
15 criteria that we look for in whom we recommend and
16 appoint. And the staff in the process that we adopted
17 is responsible for making sure those different
18 criteria are met.

19 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: And how does this link
20 up to Commissioner --

21 COMMISSIONER YAKI: This goes to the
22 separate question of an issue.

23 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Well, I want to finish
24 this. I want to finish this. I mean, okay. Now
25 balance has been brought into, I mean, put on the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 table. So if I understand I don't know who now. Who
2 owns this balance issue?

3 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: The balance issue
4 has always been discussed by us about how many. You
5 know, we have done a good job. And it was the gender
6 at one point. It was whether or not there were
7 independents, Republicans, or Democrats.

8 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: And how does that
9 relate to --

10 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Well, I mean, the
11 issue would be if you are having me from the -- let's
12 say I have a whole bunch of friends and they're all
13 Democrats. Somebody on the Commission is going to go
14 "What did Chairman Melendez recommend to Tom Pilla?"
15 Well, he sent 4 or 12 Democrats unless you're saying
16 that I should -- I mean, there is certain influence I
17 am going to have because the most --

18 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: I suspect that with
19 each SAC package, --

20 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: And that's --

21 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: -- we will review them
22 and we look for balance.

23 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: But that's the
24 reason why I kind of look more towards having the
25 regional people kind of do most of these submittals.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Are you asking
2 commissioners to withdraw from --

3 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: No, I'm not saying
4 that.

5 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: -- the process? If
6 you're asking the commissioners no longer make
7 recommendations, let's just put it on the table. We
8 can have a vote on it.

9 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Mr. Chairman, I
10 hereby resign from the Virginia SAC. I now possess
11 the exact same responsibility and power over the
12 Virginia SAC that I did five minutes ago --

13 COMMISSIONER YAKI: No, you don't.

14 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: -- with regard to
15 rechartering. And I hope that I will continue to
16 attend meetings of the Virginia SAC in particular. I
17 hope that I can attend meetings of the D.C. SAC since
18 it's convenient to me. And I will have the exact same
19 power with regard to D.C. and Virginia with regard to
20 rechartering.

21 I think it was ridiculous to raise this
22 issue. And I think that the aspersions are both
23 illogical and unsupported.

24 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Gaziano,
25 I believe it was ridiculous for you to resign based on

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 what was placed on the table. I understand the game,
2 but to take up time with this, I mean, this is petty.

3 If you have some examples of some
4 wrongdoings, put them on the table. This is truly a
5 waste of time.

6 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Just to clarify --

7 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: And I will oppose
8 your motion because I don't think that it is
9 necessary.

10 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Heriot?

11 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I am going to make a
12 separate motion. Is there a pending motion?

13 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Who knows?

14 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Well, let me --

15 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Does anybody remember?
16 Does anybody remember?

17 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: -- make just a
18 motion, a clarification of commissioner duties. I
19 move that commissioners be urged to make as many
20 recommendations for the SAC as possible so that we can
21 charter these SACs as efficiently as possible, that in
22 making a recommendation, commissioners should not be
23 required to consider balance because that has to be
24 considered all at the same time.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 If I make extra recommendations, I
2 recommend too many lawyers, it's because I know
3 lawyers. I figure that the staff under the direction
4 of the Staff Director is going to cast out some of
5 those lawyers and is going to come up with a balanced
6 SAC for each state.

7 But I think that as individual
8 commissioners, we should be urged to make as many
9 proposals as possible. And that is my motion.

10 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Is there a second?

11 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Second.

12 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Discussion?
13 Commissioner Yaki?

14 COMMISSIONER YAKI: During the discussion
15 in the lean six sigma process, -- and I need to go
16 back into the record to pull it out for certain --
17 there was actually some concern expressed over the
18 fact that if commissioners made too many
19 recommendations and without regard to the criteria for
20 qualifications, distribution of qualifications, et
21 cetera, that are part of it, that staff would feel
22 that there would be some pressure to do that anyway.

23 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: But this actually
24 clarifies that by making it --

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Does that concern come
2 to fruition?

3 COMMISSIONER YAKI: If you would like me
4 to go back into the SACs and start pulling out what my
5 concerns are, sure.

6 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: We're making it --

7 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I mainly have --

8 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Well, no. You can go
9 back --

10 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I mainly have
11 abstained from the votes on these SACs, precisely
12 because I have had these concerns about how these
13 recommendations have --

14 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: So why are we doing
15 this? If you have withdrawn yourself from the process
16 on this particular issue and we have discussed --

17 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Because Commissioner
18 Melendez has brought it up.

19 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Yes. Again, this is
20 not the first time that this has been discussed. We
21 have discussed it in the past. We have discussed it
22 today. We have discussed it offline. You have
23 elected not to participate when we vote for SACs.
24 What is the point? I mean, what are we trying to
25 accomplish here?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I deliberately elect
2 not to ratify a process that I believe is not truly
3 representative and diverse.

4 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: No. I understand
5 that.

6 COMMISSIONER YAKI: That is a totally
7 different situation.

8 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: I understand that, but
9 this conversation --

10 COMMISSIONER YAKI: To say that I have
11 withdrawn from the process is I think a
12 mischaracterization, Mr. Chair.

13 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. The
14 communication that we are having now, this discussion,
15 we have had it before. We are having it today.

16 COMMISSIONER YAKI: And we will probably
17 have it again.

18 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Why? I mean, what is
19 the point?

20 COMMISSIONER YAKI: The point is that
21 Commissioner Melendez and myself --

22 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Well, the point --

23 COMMISSIONER YAKI: -- continue to believe
24 that the makeup of the SACs is not truly
25 representative and diverse enough, period.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Why didn't you say
2 that?

3 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I have been saying it
4 for three years.

5 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: No, no, no. No, no,
6 no. That's been put on the table now.

7 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I was the first -- Mr.
8 Chair, remember --

9 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: What has been placed
10 on the table --

11 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Remember who brought
12 --

13 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: -- is the
14 participation of commissioners on SACs. That was the
15 issue. That is how we opened up this conversation.

16 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Mr. Chair?

17 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: We have gone from that
18 to balance and --

19 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: And I want lunch.

20 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Well, we're
21 dealing with two issues.

22 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: Lunch.

23 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Well, just to move
24 on and close this, you know, the --

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: We have a pending
2 motion.

3 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Well, do you want
4 to take care of the motion first? Because I want to
5 go to the other issue of whether or not we can, a
6 commissioner can, sit on the SAC. Your motion right
7 now has to do with the other part of it.

8 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay.

9 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: The motion was my
10 motion. The motion is that commissioners be urged to
11 submit as many names as --

12 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: All in favor, please
13 say, "Aye."

14 (Whereupon, there was a chorus of "Ayes.")

15 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Objections?

16 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Objection.

17 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: No. Wait a
18 minute. You are objecting to commissioners being
19 urged to submit names?

20 Is that possible?

21 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Yes.

22 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: No. The question
23 could be even presented further as to what is the
24 limit. You know what I mean? I mean, at some point
25 --

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: There is no limit.

2 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Maybe there should
3 be.

4 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: The discussion is
5 over. We are voting now.

6 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Okay.

7 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: We did vote.

8 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: You objected.
9 Commissioner Yaki, I didn't catch your vote.

10 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I abstain.

11 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay.

12 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Did we get Pete's?
13 Is Pete still on?

14 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: No.

15 Okay. One abstention, one objection, and
16 the remaining commissioners voted in favor. It
17 passes.

18 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Okay. We now have
19 clarified the --

20 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: And, as I
21 understand, what we have passed is simply that we urge
22 commissioners to submit names.

23 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: And we have also put
24 it on the record that we are grownups and we
25 understand that not all of our proposals will get

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 through because of the need for balance. And we
2 ultimately vote on a SAC package.

3 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Even though it is
4 after the fact and we have already voted, my concern
5 was of a limitation on how many we should be able to
6 submit. You know what I mean? I don't have a problem
7 with being able to submit a few, but I think if you go
8 overboard and I send 20 -- maybe there should be --

9 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Then send 20.

10 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Maybe there should
11 be a limit.

12 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Send 20.

13 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: You have already
14 voted it.

15 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Send 40.

16 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Is this --

17 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: I think some
18 people submit a lot more than what I think is --

19 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: At the end of the --

20 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: What is a lot more?
21 Some people vote --

22 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Ask the Staff
23 Director how many we --

24 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Well, no. No. I am
25 trying to see. I mean, if you believe that there is a

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 problem and, I mean, if you have examples of
2 commissioners submitting the overwhelming majority of
3 the recommendations and those recommendations being
4 adopted, then I think that your argument is on firm
5 ground. Now, if this is --

6 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I don't think so.

7 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Fine. We
8 disagree. But if this is a theoretical problem and
9 you can't point to any --

10 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: I am saying
11 Commissioner Heriot submitted a whole bunch of names
12 for the California SAC. Ask her how many. Ask the
13 Staff Director. And I think it's just --

14 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: What is a whole bunch?

15 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: Wait a minute.
16 It's up to us what we accept.

17 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Well, that is what
18 I am saying. I just think in the general discussion,
19 there should be a limitation as to how many.

20 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I think you should
21 ask the Staff Director how many names I submitted for
22 the California SAC.

23 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Do we have an
24 answer? Do we have an answer?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Are we talking about
2 the SAC that we haven't chartered yet, upcoming
3 California SAC?

4 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: I don't know. Let's
5 ask --

6 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: It is my
7 understanding that we have not received any
8 recommendations from Commissioner Heriot.

12 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: I hope you do,
13 Commissioner Heriot.

14 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I will now. I will
15 come up with some now.

18 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Why are we talking
19 about this, though? I mean --

20 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: I just think that
21 --

22 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: -- I take her at her
23 word. She says that she has not submitted any names.

24 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: It wasn't my word.
25 It was Marty's word.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: But I hope she
2 submits dozens. So to me, it's irrelevant whether
3 she's done it yet or is going to do so in the future.

4 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: It is my job to
5 submit recommendations, but, as a matter of fact, I
6 haven't done it. I apologize for having failed to
7 make more suggestions for the California SAC.

8 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: I think we need a
9 little more information. Maybe you can provide that.

10 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: I think you need to
11 get more information before putting this on the table.

12 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: You haven't given
13 me the information. Every time I ask for information,
14 you stand on "That is privileged information." I have
15 a whole --

16 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I just begged you to
17 ask him what --

18 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: You said that she
19 submitted a bunch of names. Where does that come
20 from? Either your information was faulty or you made
21 it up.

22 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: Should I
23 speak to this topic?

24 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: Yes, speak to it.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: Not if we
2 don't have to.

3 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Are we talking about
4 the previous SAC? I was not a member of the
5 Commission when the previous SAC was put together.

6 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Does that make a
7 difference?

8 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Move to adjourn.

9 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: I didn't start this.
10 Oh, no. No. If we can keep a quorum?

11 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I am here for the
12 long haul.

13 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: I am not.

14 (Laughter.)

15 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Someone go get Abby a
16 sandwich.

17 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: I need a drink.

18 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: I needed one earlier.

19 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: That was at 8:00 in
20 the morning.

21 (Laughter.)

22 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: These are trying
23 times.

24 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: I don't think we
25 have the information right now. I don't think it's

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 divulged to us fully. I think we can find that out,
2 but we have heard that.

3 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Can I just note --

4 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: I will state on the
5 record that there is nothing wrong with her submitting
6 names.

7 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: That's fine. Then
8 we --

9 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Well, no. It sounds
10 like we're even saying that an ordinary citizen who is
11 not a commissioner cannot submit names because,
12 remember, when the SAC was chartered, the one that
13 exists now, I was not a member of the Commission. So
14 what is all this talk about conflict of interest?

15 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: With respect
16 to people who get appointed to the SACs, we send out a
17 list. You know, we explain the outreach. And then in
18 terms of each member, we tell the commissioners where
19 that recommendation came from.

20 And there have been a number of cases
21 where Commissioner Heriot, Commissioner Thernstrom,
22 and some others have recommended people and we put
23 that in there. So I don't know if Commissioner Heriot
24 has recommended -- I don't believe she has recommended

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 more than two that have gotten appointed in any
2 particular SAC.

3 And I can recall a situation where she did
4 recommend two people in one state and we accepted one
5 of them because they did have similar backgrounds. So
6 we were looking for some more diversity. So we only
7 accepted one of them.

8 But we can have that. Again, we can go
9 back and look over the forms that we sent to the
10 commissioners, but it could be in that case that she
11 submitted some additional names that didn't get there.
12 But certainly in terms of the names that are appointed
13 --

14 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: This level of
15 detail --

16 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: -- whoever
17 recommended them we --

18 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: This level of
19 detail is inappropriate to me.

20 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: -- provide
21 them to the commissioners.

22 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: The thing is,
23 though, you can't say a commissioner should recommend
24 no more than one because when a recommendation is

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 being made, I don't know whether the person will
2 accept a position.

3 So the whole thing is just completely
4 silly. We have such a difficult time chartering these
5 SACs. The notion that we should be decreasing the
6 number of recommendations that commissioners or anyone
7 else makes seems utterly inappropriate and a general
8 waste of time of this Commission.

9 Moreover, if we're talking about the
10 previous California SAC, again, I was not a member of
11 the Commission at that time. I don't think that we're
12 sending out letters to congressmen saying, "Please
13 recommend no more than one person for a commission
14 because we don't want more than one recommendation
15 from you. We want as many recommendations as we can
16 get, not just from commissioners but from everyone."

17 We are not suffering from an excessive
18 number of persons who want to be on SACs. Remember,
19 this is an unpaid position. And we are very lucky to
20 get the people that we get.

21 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Melendez,
22 unless you have something else, I will second
23 Commissioner Yaki's motion to adjourn.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Well, I thought we
2 had the other issue and whether or not we should be
3 able to sit as commissioners on state advisory --

4 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: We have now got a
5 pending motion to adjourn.

6 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: After listening, I
7 withdraw my motion.

10 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Actually, I didn't
11 make my motion. So --

12 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: It was never made.

13 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: What was your
14 motion?

15 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: It would have been,
16 well, the same motion that I sent to you where
17 commissioners who were sitting on SACs would not be
18 allowed to vote to recharter that particular SAC.

19 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I will withdraw my
20 motion to adjourn to put that motion on the table if
21 that's what --

22 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Which motion?
23 Commissioner Melendez talked about a motion. I don't
24 support either, but I want to know which motion we're
25 --

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: There weren't
2 actually motions that were actually agendized. What
3 it was was discussion. And motions came out of the
4 discussion.

5 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Gentlemen. Gentlemen,
6 I've got to say the way this issue has unfolded -- I
7 try to work with you. I believe that you have raised
8 a legitimate issue.

9 And I am going to make the motion. I am
10 going to support the motion because I think that the
11 arguments associated with that particular issue have
12 some weight. But you lose credibility when you throw
13 nonsense up. I mean, to say that she submitted a
14 bunch of names and it turns out that that is not the
15 case, that is a problem for me.

16 There was the suggestion that she had done
17 something that was inappropriate. And then it turns
18 out that so far, there is no evidence to support the
19 --

20 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: It also turns out
21 that if the allegation were true, that it was
22 beneficial and it was praiseworthy. That is what we
23 have established here today by our vote.

24 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Let me read the
25 motion, then, so we can get out of here. I move that

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 the Commission adopt a policy whereby commissioners
2 who serve as members of a state advisory committee
3 would be precluded from voting on rechartering that
4 committee.

5 Under this motion, a commissioner serving
6 on a state advisory committee would be precluded from
7 participating in both the discussion of the recharter
8 of that committee and the vote on the recharter of
9 that committee. The Staff Director shall prepare an
10 administrative instruction to implement this policy.

11 Is there a second?

12 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: Second.

13 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Heriot?

14 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Again I don't think
15 you have dealt with the problem that you have
16 identified.

17 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Which? There have
18 been so many.

19 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: You were talking
20 about the possibility of there being some undue
21 influence, people are going to --

22 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Is there a --

23 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Hold on. Hold on.
24 Let me finish.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: -- hole in the logic?

2 Yes, there is. I can see that.

3 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: It's not a hole.

4 It's like there's no logic there. And if you are
5 trying to deal with the possibility that SAC members
6 will be fearful that commissioners will not vote to
7 renew them if they don't do what the commissioner
8 wants, that is a problem from allowing commissioners
9 to attend SAC meetings. That is not a problem from
10 being a member of the SAC. So this does not take care
11 of that problem.

12 There have been allegations of bullying of
13 SAC members, but they have not been on the SACs that
14 commissioners have been members of. There have been
15 allegations of that sort. And if we want to deal with
16 that, then we have to deal with that.

17 But this doesn't deal with that. This
18 just keeps us from lunch is what it does.

19 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Gaziano,
20 then Commissioner Yaki and --

21 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: Is there a motion
22 on the table to adjourn?

23 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: No. It has been
24 withdrawn.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I move to substitute
2 for the current motion a motion to adjourn.

3 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: I second that.

4 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: All in favor?

5 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: We have a motion
6 on the floor that's --

7 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: But we have made a
8 motion to substitute.

9 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: You need to take
10 action on that motion already on the floor.

11 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: The motion to
12 substitute does that.

13 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: There has been a
14 second. All in favor, please say, "Aye."

15 (Whereupon, there was a chorus of "Ayes.")

16 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Now we have got to
17 vote on the motion to adjourn. We have only
18 substituted. We have got to do it right. Now. Call
19 the question on the motion to adjourn.

20 COMMISSIONER YAKI: There was only a voice
21 vote on that, and there was not a call for the yeas
22 and nays. All I heard were "Ayes," and there was no
23 division of the "Ayes," of the "Yeas" and "Nays."

24 VICE CHAIR THERNSTROM: Let's do a count.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 COMMISSIONER YAKI: You don't have to do
2 that. Just "All in favor, say, 'Aye,'" "All in favor,
3 say, 'Object.'" That's all.

4 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Just call for the
5 nays.

6 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Who objects?

7 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I do.

8 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: And Commissioner
9 Melendez also objects. Any abstentions?

10 (No response.)

11 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Okay. Now we vote
12 on the motion to adjourn.

13 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. I move to
14 adjourn. Is there a second?

15 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: No, no. That motion
16 is already there. It was substituted out. We just
17 have to vote on it.

18 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. All in favor,
19 please say, "Aye."

20 (Whereupon, there was a chorus of "Ayes.")

21 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Any objections?

22 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Object.

23 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Yes.

24 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Commissioner
25 Melendez and Commissioner Yaki object. The remaining

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 commissioners voted in favor. Let's go. Let's leave.

2 Let's leave quickly.

3 (Whereupon, the foregoing matter was
4 concluded at 1:50 p.m.)

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com