Page 1

U.S. COMMISSION ON CIVIL RIGHTS

+ + + + +

TELEPHONIC MEETING

+ + + + +

FRIDAY, OCTOBER 30, 2009

+ + + + +

The Commission convened telephonically at 11:30 a.m. Eastern Daylight Time, GERALD A. REYNOLDS, Chairman, presiding.

PRESENT:

GERALD A. REYNOLDS, Chairman TODD F. GAZIANO, Commissioner GAIL L. HERIOT, Commissioner PETER N. KIRSANOW, Commissioner ASHLEY L. TAYLOR, JR., Commissioner MICHAEL YAKI, Commissioner MARTIN DANNENFELSER, Staff Director

Page 2

STAFF PRESENT:

DAVID BLACKWOOD, General Counsel, OGC CHRISTOPHER BYRNES PAMELA A. DUNSTON, Chief, ASCD ROBERT LERNER, Asst Staff Director for OCRE EMMA MONROIG, Solicitor LENORE OSTROWSKY EILEEN RUDERT KIMBERLY TOLHURST AUDREY WRIGHT

COMMISSIONER ASSISTANTS PRESENT:

TIM FAY DOMINIQUE LUDVIGSON KIMBERLY SCHULD JOHN MARTIN ALISON SCHMAUCH

|       |                                     | Page 3 |
|-------|-------------------------------------|--------|
|       | TABLE OF CONTENTS                   |        |
| AGEND | DA ITEM                             | PAGE   |
| I.    | Approval of Agenda                  | 5      |
| II.   | Approval of Minutes of September 3, | 33     |
|       | September 11, September 24,         |        |
|       | October 8, and October 16 Meetings  |        |
| III.  | Management and Operations           | 26     |
|       | - Approval of Calendar of 2010      |        |
|       | Commission Meetings                 |        |
| IV.   | Program Planning                    | 7      |
|       | - Update on Proposed Hearings for   | 7      |
|       | FY 2010 Enforcement Report          |        |
|       | - Update on FY 2010 Project on Sex  | 38     |
|       | Discrimination in Higher Education  |        |
|       | Admissions                          |        |
|       |                                     |        |
|       |                                     |        |
|       |                                     |        |
|       |                                     |        |
|       |                                     |        |
|       |                                     |        |
|       |                                     |        |
|       |                                     |        |
|       |                                     |        |
|       |                                     |        |
|       |                                     |        |
|       |                                     |        |
|       |                                     |        |
|       |                                     |        |
|       |                                     |        |
|       |                                     |        |

|    | Page 4   |
|----|--|
| 1  | P-R-O-C-E-E-D-I-N-G-S                                  |
| 2  | (11:38 a.m.)   |
| 3  | CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: We can get started.                 |
| 4  | We have I guess five commissioners and possibly one    |
| 5  | phantom commissioner. Operator, could you please       |
| б  | start the call, let the public in?                     |
| 7  | THE OPERATOR: Absolutely. Okay. Please                 |
| 8  | go ahead. The call may now begin.                      |
| 9  | CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Good morning.                 |
| 10 | This is Chairman Reynolds. It is 11:39 Eastern         |
| 11 | Daylight Time on October 30th, 2009. We are having a   |
| 12 | telephonic meeting with commissioners participating    |
| 13 | from different locations. I will call the name of      |
| 14 | each commissioner to determine if there is a quorum to |
| 15 | hold the meeting. Vice Chair Thernstrom? Vice Chair    |
| 16 | Thernstrom?  |
| 17 | (No response.)   |
| 18 | CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Gaziano?               |
| 19 | COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Here.                            |
| 20 | CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Kirsanow?              |
| 21 | COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Here.                           |
| 22 | CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Heriot?                |
| 23 | COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Here.                             |
| 24 | CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Melendez?              |
| 25 | (No response.)   |

Page 5 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Yaki 1 2 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Here. 3 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Taylor? COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: 4 Here. 5 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Is the Staff 6 Director present? 7 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: Yes, sir. 8 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Is the Court Reporter 9 on the line? 10 THE REPORTER: Present. 11 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Thank you. The meeting will come to order. To assist the Court 12 13 Reporter, please identify yourself before making a 14 statement. Whenever it is necessary to take a vote, I 15 will call each of your names. Please answer by saying, "Yea," "Nay," or "Abstain." 16 17 I. APPROVAL OF AGENDA 18 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: I move that we approve the agenda. Is there a second? 19 20 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Second. CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Discussion? 21 22 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Were there going to be some amendments to it? 23 24 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Yes. I have several. 25 I just wanted to see if anyone wanted to go first.

Page 6 Okay. Here are the amendments that I 1 2 would like to make. I would like to amend the agenda so that the discussion of the new Black Panther Party 3 4 project is the first item on the agenda and move the 5 approval of the minutes so that it is taken up after 6 our vote on a meeting calendar for 2010, making the 7 update on the Title IX project the last item. 8 Is there a second? 9 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Second. Gaziano. 10 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Any other changes? 11 (No response.) CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Discussion? 12 13 (No response.) 14 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Commissioner 15 Gaziano, how do you vote? 16 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Yes. CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Kirsanow? 17 18 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Yes. 19 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Heriot? 20 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes. 21 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Yaki? 22 COMMISSIONER YAKI: No. 23 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Taylor? 24 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: Yes. 25 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: And I also vote in the

Page 7 affirmative. Let the record reflect that Commissioner 1 2 Yaki voted against the motion. The remaining commissioners voted in favor of the motion. 3 The 4 motion passes. 5 PROGRAM PLANNING TV. 6 - UPDATE ON PROPOSED HEARINGS FOR 7 FY 2010 ENFORCEMENT REPORT 8 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Next up, we 9 will have an update on the proposed hearings for the 10 2010 enforcement report. Mr. Staff Director or the 11 General Counsel, will you please provide an update on 12 the progress of our enforcement report on the 13 of Justice's dismissal of Department voter 14 intimidation charges against members of the New Black 15 Panther Party? 16 MR. BLACKWOOD: Yes, this is David 17 Blackwood. Since --18 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Can you speak up a 19 little bit or get a little closer to the mike? 20 MR. BLACKWOOD: Yes. This is David 21 Blackwood. 22 COMMISSIONER YAKI: This is Commissioner 23 Yaki. I still can barely hear him. 24 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. David, we need 25 you to get close to the mike and speak up.

Page 8 MR. BLACKWOOD: I am trying a different 1 2 microphone. Can you hear me now? COMMISSIONER YAKI: This is Commissioner 3 That is not much better. 4 Yaki. 5 MR. BLACKWOOD: All I can tell you is the 6 microphone is now about an inch from my mouth. 7 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Well, project. 8 MR. BLACKWOOD: I will do my best. Since 9 our last meeting, I have interviewed by telephone 10 several witnesses who were present in Philadelphia. As a result of those interviews, it became clear, at 11 least in my mind, that I think there is a need to 12 13 change what I originally proposed and what was sent out as far as this meeting, the discovery plan and the 14 15 hearing proposal, in this way. 16 Many of the witnesses that were present in 17 Philadelphia were campaign workers who do not live in are they within 18 Philadelphia, 100 miles of nor 19 Philadelphia. Many seem to be from the New York or 20 Connecticut area. 21 As a result of the people I spoke with, it 22 seems to me and the fact that many of them expressed an intention to or willingness to come to Washington 23 24 to testify that I would suggest the following changes, 25 that: the discovery that takes place one, in

Philadelphia could be done in the form of depositions, specifically geared, most, at least at this stage, I would propose to you, geared, towards members of the New Black Panther Party as well as any other individuals that we identify who are only in the Philadelphia area.

1

2

3

4

5

6

Page 9

7 And by that, I would at this point say 8 that I have identified Mr. and Mrs. Counts, who were 9 actually within the polling place at the time as poll 10 watchers. There may be other individuals, however, 11 that I would identify who would testify at a 12 deposition in Philadelphia without a hearing.

What I would suggest to you makes at least more physical sense is to move the hearing that was originally out of the picture in Philadelphia to the Washington office. And we can either combine them with a DOJ hearing or treat them as separate hearings, but I would just suggest to you that we could move it to Washington.

20 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Any other items that21 you would like to update us on?

22 MR. BLACKWOOD: As far as there are some 23 individuals with whom we have not had any success 24 contacting yet. And that includes the videographer, 25 who took many of the videos, portions of the videos,

Page 10 that were on YouTube. He has made contact with us, 1 2 but we haven't actually met to go through or interview him. 3 4 Other individuals, we are searching for 5 addresses, but, even at this stage, we have sufficient 6 witnesses who have directly observed the incidents 7 that occurred in Philadelphia. 8 COMMISSIONER YAKI: This is Commissioner 9 Yaki. I have some questions for the General Counsel. 10 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Go ahead, Commissioner Yaki. 11 12 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I am a bit confused by 13 what you just said. I thought you said that the 14 Counts were people who were not poll watchers, but 15 your discovery plan says that they were poll watchers. 16 MR. BLACKWOOD: I must have misspoken. 17 The Counts were poll watchers. There are a variety of 18 distinctions. There are people that are roving poll 19 watchers. There are those who have certificates to 20 actually physically be within the polling place. 21 Those require someone to be a resident of 22 Philadelphia. Mr. and Mrs. Counts fall into that 23 latter category. 24 COMMISSIONER YAKI: And when you were 25 talking about you were interviewing witnesses, were

|    | Page 11   |
|----|---|
| 1  | they other poll watchers who were not situated within |
| 2  | the Philadelphia area? They would, therefore, be      |
| 3  | outside the 100-mile radius?                          |
| 4  | MR. BLACKWOOD: Generally they are with                |
| 5  | one exception. We have one poll watcher who was "a    |
| б  | roving poll watcher," who was a resident of           |
| 7  | Philadelphia, Mr. Chris Hill. He has indicated that   |
| 8  | he would be willing to come to Washington, D.C.       |
| 9  | The other individuals, though, were                   |
| 10 | campaign workers who showed up from out of state.     |
| 11 | They were outside the polling place but were not      |
| 12 | allowed in the polling place.                         |
| 13 | COMMISSIONER YAKI: Are you suggesting                 |
| 14 | that we basically cancel the Philadelphia hearing?    |
| 15 | MR. BLACKWOOD: No. What I am suggesting               |
| 16 | is shifting the Philadelphia hearing and we could     |
| 17 | actually stage it in Washington. As to those          |
| 18 | COMMISSIONER YAKI: Well, I have problems              |
| 19 | with the fact that shifting is based on basically     |
| 20 | self-referred discovery on the so are you saying      |
| 21 | that the members of the New Black Panther Party, you  |
| 22 | will simply interview them remotely through not       |
| 23 | remotely. You will go to Philadelphia and interview   |
| 24 | them via the deposition process? Is that what you     |
| 25 | were saying?  |

Page 12 MR. BLACKWOOD: That is how I would 1 2 propose the start-up. That time is spent on what we 3 learn at the depositions. 4 COMMISSIONER YAKI: But they would be 5 outside the 100-mile range if we were to have a 6 hearing only in Washington, D.C., wouldn't they? 7 MR. BLACKWOOD: That is correct. 8 COMMISSIONER YAKI: So the commissioners, 9 such as myself, would be deprived of the ability to 10 give questions and answers to those folks if their 11 only appearance is through the transcript of the interview. Is that correct? 12 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: You could attend 13 14 the deposition or they could come to a hearing 15 somewhere else. 16 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Commissioner Gaziano, 17 would you please allow Mr. Blackwood to answer the 18 question. 19 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: I'm sorry that I'm 20 not constrained by your idiotic moods, Mr. Yaki. 21 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Okay. Hold on, 22 folks. 23 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I'm sorry, Mr. Chair. 24 I would like that remark noted for its insane and 25 utterly --

Page 13 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: All right. He hit you 1 2 So get your shot in so we can move on. first. 3 COMMISSIONER YAKI: No. He --COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Then I get to get 4 5 my shot in. 6 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I am asking questions 7 of the General Counsel. Commissioner --8 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: And if you can't 9 have a civil conversation, Michael, if you can't have 10 a civil conversation without playing your little 11 childish games, then --12 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Gaziano, 13 he was speaking --14 COMMISSIONER YAKI: In keeping with his 15 heroes in the Congress who like to interrupt people at 16 any moment in time --17 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: I did not interrupt 18 you. I was supplying a response. 19 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Gaziano, 20 this is wasting time. Let's focus. COMMISSIONER YAKI: I am asking questions. 21 22 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Continue. 23 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I am asking the 24 General Counsel, are we basically limited, therefore, 25 to the transcript of those witnesses for a Washington

|    | Page 14  |
|----|--|
| 1  | hearing?   |
| 2  | CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: And the answer is?                  |
| 3  | MR. BLACKWOOD: This is David Blackwood.                |
| 4  | Commissioner Yaki, first, you would have the right to  |
| 5  | be at the deposition.                                  |
| 6  | COMMISSIONER YAKI: Would I I'm sorry.                  |
| 7  | Go ahead.  |
| 8  | MR. BLACKWOOD: Now, the way past practice              |
| 9  | has been, as I understand it, at the Commission, one,  |
| 10 | commissioners have a right to be at any deposition.    |
| 11 | Two, after I have finished my questions, commissioners |
| 12 | are allowed time to ask any questions that they have.  |
| 13 | So that is first.                                      |
| 14 | Second, depending on what happens at the               |
| 15 | deposition, yes, if we didn't shift the hearing to     |
| 16 | Washington, they would be outside the 100-mile range.  |
| 17 | It all depends in my mind what happens at the          |
| 18 | deposition.  |
| 19 | As we know, in the original litigation,                |
| 20 | these individuals did not even file a response. So I   |
| 21 | am somewhat frankly, I think it makes sense to         |
| 22 | proceed with depositions first to see if they will     |
| 23 | even respond to our subpoenas.                         |
| 24 | COMMISSIONER YAKI: Well, I have two                    |
| 25 | comments on that assuming Commissioner Gaziano doesn't |
|    |  |

Page 15 try and interrupt me. 1 2 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: You got your shot 3 already. COMMISSIONER YAKI: One is -- I am sorry, 4 5 I withdraw the remark. Mr. Chairman. 6 if you were going through the One, 7 deposition way, I would request that any dates, 8 proposed dates, that you schedule for this -- I am 9 giving notice that I have an interest in attending and 10 possibly asking questions, number one. So I would like any date to be coordinated so that it could 11 12 possibly work with my schedule, number one. Number two, I am still not sure whether or 13 14 not this is appropriate given the fact that the 15 limited discovery that we seem to have seems to be fed 16 to us by those who have an interest in reprosecuting 17 this case because, as far as I can see, every single 18 fact witness with the exception of anyone who happened 19 to be actually on the YouTube video of individuals 20 from the Republican Party -- and we have very few, if 21 any. 22 And I want to know what the discovery is 23 for that people from the affected precinct who were 24 actually voters as well as the fact that I think it is 25 important that the Election Day operations director,

Page 16 who is identified as John Giordano, also be part of 1 2 any Philadelphia-based process that is in place 3 because I am not comfortable reading the discovery 4 plan that there is any attempt to ascertain a complete 5 set of facts other than those with people who already 6 have a large axe to grind in an election that they 7 lost. 8 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Mr. Blackwood, Ι 9 assume that your efforts to secure witnesses has not 10 been biased by the political affiliations or ideologies of the individuals who were witnesses of 11 12 the incident that occurred in Philadelphia. Is that 13 right? 14 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Mr. Chairman, this is 15 Commissioner Yaki. Let me say I am not insinuating at 16 all. 17 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Well, I just --18 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I am simply saying he 19 is acting on information provided to him by others on the Commission. 20 21 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: I understand that. 22 COMMISSIONER YAKI: It seems to be rather 23 self-preferred. And I am wondering what we are doing 24 beyond this to contact a broader section of 25 individuals.

Page 17 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Well, Commissioner 1 2 Yaki, that is where my question was leading. 3 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I apologize. 4 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Mr. Blackwood, would 5 you care to respond? 6 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I didn't want to 7 insinuate that Mr. Blackwood was conducted any biased 8 interviews. 9 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Well, I just want to 10 put the issue squarely on the table. This is David Blackwood. 11 MR. BLACKWOOD: 12 I can tell you, Commissioner Yaki, you are correct in 13 that the leads tended to come from one party because 14 was the nature of the incident. that Ιt was 15 Republican operatives were showing up at poll watchers when we made the report. 16 17 That said, our plan is to, either myself 18 or other individuals from OGC, go to Philadelphia, 19 check some of the paper record with regard to other 20 individuals that were at the polling place. 21 Specifically we know for a fact that there 22 were Democratic poll watchers there. There should be records with the Board of Elections as to who these 23 24 individuals are. And it absolutely is part of our 25 plan to identify them and try to talk with them, but I

Page 18 couldn't give you a name because I don't know who it 1 2 is. We also know that on the video, in talking 3 to the witnesses, at one time there is a woman there 4 5 is identified by the other witnesses who as а 6 Democratic campaign worker. She was observed right 7 next to the or right behind the new Black Panther 8 individuals. Obviously we would like to talk to her. 9 But I don't have any contact information. 10 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Thank you. Thank you very much, Mr. Chair. And I would just simply urge 11 the General Counsel to continue those efforts in order 12 to ensure as much as possible that we have, again, the 13 14 complete set of facts. 15 To me, if we are going to do this, it 16 would seem odd that we not go to Philadelphia simply 17 because, one, our presence there alone may actually 18 encourage others to come forward and speak who we're 19 having trouble talking to; secondly, there may be some 20 logistical issues involved with what schedule there 21 may be for depositions. 22 Then, again, if, indeed, the fact that there may be more than just two or three individuals 23 24 potentially in Philadelphia we would wish to speak to 25 on the record, at some point we may reach a critical

Page 19 mass where a hearing is required. 1 2 And, again, I am referring to the fact 3 that I think that the Election Day operations director 4 -- I don't know if the Philadelphia police officers 5 generally have authority to travel to Washington, D.C. 6 And when you add those and when you start adding 7 potential other individuals, including voters who were 8 there at the time, I would not want us to just --9 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Yaki, we 10 are not going to vote on this matter yet. I am just 11 putting --12 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I just want to put 13 that out there. 14 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Yes. I understand. 15 Mr. Blackwood has made a recommendation. We will mull 16 it over. And we will have to raise this issue again. COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Mr. Chairman? 17 18 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Yes? 19 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: This is Todd 20 I would like to offer a motion at this time. Gaziano. 21 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Please go ahead. 22 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: It is the motion 23 that Ι circulated, but for the record, it is 24 relatively short. I suppose I should read it into the 25 record --

|    | Page 20  |
|----|--|
| 1  | CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Yes.                                |
| 2  | COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: unless there is                  |
| 3  | unanimous consent that we                              |
| 4  | CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Please read it into                 |
| 5  | the record.  |
| 6  | COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Okay. And then let               |
| 7  | me speak to the motion immediately afterward if it is  |
| 8  | seconded. Pursuant to the Commission's authority       |
| 9  | under 42 USC section 1975(a) and 45 CFR section 7024   |
| 10 | and in furtherance of our investigation of the         |
| 11 | implications of DOJ's actions in the new Black Panther |
| 12 | Party litigation for enforcement of section 11(b) of   |
| 13 | the Voting Rights Act, I move to authorize the         |
| 14 | Chairman to subpoena any of the individuals listed in  |
| 15 | the two draft hearing proposals prepared by the        |
| 16 | General Counsel dated October 21, 2009 and any other   |
| 17 | individuals the General Counsel and the Discovery      |
| 18 | Subcommittee identify who are similarly situated to    |
| 19 | the witnesses identified in the draft hearing          |
| 20 | proposals or who fall within one of the categories     |
| 21 | identified below to appear as specified in the         |
| 22 | subpoena to give deposition and/or hearing testimony   |
| 23 | and produce written or other matter called for in the  |
| 24 | subpoenas.   |
| 25 | The five categories are: one, former                   |

defendants in the New Black Panther 1 Party NBPP 2 litigation; two, individuals with information about the events in Philadelphia; three, former and current 3 4 DOJ personnel with knowledge of the NBPP litigation; 5 four, custodians of records at DOJ regarding past VRA 6 section 11(b) allegations, investigations, and related 7 documents; and, five, others with potential relevant information about the DOJ actions 8 in the NBPP 9 litigation.

Page 21

10CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS:This is Chairman11Reynolds. I second the motion.

Please continue, Commissioner Gaziano. COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: This is obviously a helpful step. It may have been already implicit in the votes that we have previously taken initiating this, but I think it is good for the record for the Commission to authorize you to issue the subpoenas.

And I think that I want to sort of second 18 19 the notion that the General Counsel just explained. 20 We have been working with him on some of the issues that would be involved and costly decisions to rent a 21 22 hotel, having a hearing in Philadelphia. It certainly makes more sense to find out what deposition evidence 23 24 there is and then for the rest of the Commission to be 25 informed by that and then make a decision on the

|    | Page 22   |
|----|---|
| 1  | hearing.  |
| 2  | CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Well                               |
| 3  | COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: But, regardless of              |
| 4  | the hearing issue, this is certainly a simple step to |
| 5  | further the investigation.                            |
| 6  | CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Additional comments?               |
| 7  | COMMISSIONER YAKI: This is Commissioner               |
| 8  | Yaki. One, I am not too sure about the cost issue     |
| 9  | because I am certain that there are going to be a     |
| 10 | number of commissioners who are going to want to      |
| 11 | attend any potential deposition in Philadelphia for   |
| 12 | CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Gentlemen, let's punt              |
| 13 | this particular issue. The location of the deposition |
| 14 | and the hearings, that issue is not on the table      |
| 15 | today. We have a recommendation. Once we have had an  |
| 16 | opportunity to give it some thought, we can put it on |
| 17 | the agenda and have a full-blown discussion.          |
| 18 | Right now we have a motion on the table.              |
| 19 | And I would like to stay focused on the motion.       |
| 20 | COMMISSIONER YAKI: I was just addressing              |
| 21 | one of the rationales for the motion. But, that being |
| 22 | the case, I find this motion extremely problematic. I |
| 23 | find that especially number five is just a scatter    |
| 24 | shot, carte blanche standard. I am not too sure       |
| 25 | whether it would pass any muster whatsoever in terms  |

of specificity.

1

| 2  | And my question actually is at the General             |
|----|--|
| 3  | Counsel, which is, have we had in the past such broad  |
| 4  | and rather vague authority granted for subpoenas or    |
| 5  | are we required under the statue or under any other    |
| б  | applicable law to be a little more specific in terms   |
| 7  | of determining the standard of what is potentially     |
| 8  | relevant information, what is "information," how are   |
| 9  | we going to identify that, and then how are we going   |
| 10 | to prioritize to whom these subpoenas are going to.    |
| 11 | MR. BLACKWOOD: This is General Counsel                 |
| 12 | again. In answer to your question, number one, as I    |
| 13 | understand the motion as adopted by reference, the     |
| 14 | list of witnesses that we have specifically identified |
| 15 | as to past practice, I can tell you that we have       |
| 16 | scoured the agency with regard to past practices. We   |
| 17 | haven't found anything with regard to this specific    |
| 18 | issue.   |
| 19 | In reviewing the motion yesterday, I did               |
| 20 | look at the statute in our CFRs. And I didn't see the  |
| 21 | issue, frankly, addressed. So I do believe the         |
| 22 | Commission has the authority and discretion to pass on |
| 23 | the authority of identifying it as they will.          |
| 24 | That said, obviously I will be working                 |
| 25 | with the subcommittee that was authorized by the       |

Page 24 Commission before any subpoenas would be issued. 1 2 COMMISSIONER YAKI: This is Commissioner 3 Yaki. Did I just understand you to say that this was 4 limited to people who have been identified so far? 5 MR. BLACKWOOD: wording No. The 6 obviously, what you just said, is broader than that, 7 but it did encompass as well the specific individuals identified. And there aren't any other individuals 8 9 that I am aware of currently. 10 I assume that part of the motion was that 11 we would not keep coming back and saying, "Now we have 12 another one given the timing or the --13 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Excuse me. But who is 14 going to determine the potentially relevant standard, 15 as stated in number 5 of Commissioner Gaziano's memo? 16 Ts it qoing to be you? Is it going be to Commissioner Gaziano? Who is it? 17 18 MR. BLACKWOOD: Well, as a practical 19 matter, first I would identify the individuals, the informal process. Obviously I would confirm that with 20 21 the Subcommittee that has been identified. And, 22 frankly, then the Chair also has the power because 23 only he can sign subpoenas. 24 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Any other comments? 25 COMMISSIONER YAKI: So what you are

Page 25 telling me, then, is that the Subcommittee and the 1 2 Chair have sole discretion to determine, not the Commission as a whole, what is potentially relevant? 3 MR. BLACKWOOD: I assume that is the 4 5 purpose of the motion as to whether the Commission is 6 delegating that authority. 7 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes. I don't think 8 there is anything out of the ordinary about delegating 9 such authority. I would call the question. 10 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Commissioner 11 Gaziano, how do you vote? 12 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Yes. CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Kirsanow? 13 14 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Yes. CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Heriot? 15 16 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes. CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Yaki? 17 18 COMMISSIONER YAKI: No. 19 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Taylor? 20 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: Yes. 21 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: And I vote yes also. 22 Commissioner Yaki voted against the motion. The remaining commissioners voted for it. The motion 23 24 passes. 25 MANAGEMENT AND OPERATIONS III.

Page 26 - APPROVAL OF CALENDAR OF 2010 COMMISSION MEETINGS 1 2 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Next up. On 3 October 9th, the Staff Director sent a list of 4 potential dates for Commission meetings during 2010. 5 He sent an updated list on October 22nd. That 6 includes teleconference dates, in addition to 7 in-person meeting dates. 8 As is our typical practice, in-person 9 meetings, business meetings, will start at 9:30 Eastern Standard Time. And teleconference will be 10 scheduled for 11:30 Eastern Standard Time. 11 12 Obviously selecting these meeting dates 13 does not preclude adjustments, additions, and 14 deletions of meeting dates throughout the year, as is 15 necessary to accommodate Commission business and other 16 projects. 17 I move to adopt the suggested dates for 18 phone and in-person Commission meetings for calendar Is there a second? 19 year 2010. 20 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Second. CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Discussion? 21 22 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Ι just do not 23 understand why we have these telephonic meetings and 24 we can't get our business done in a regular fashion. 25 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: The fact that you

|    | Page 27   |
|----|---|
| 1  | walk out on meetings to defeat a quorum has a lot to  |
| 2  | do with it.   |
| 3  | COMMISSIONER YAKI: I would just like to               |
| 4  |   |
| 5  | CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: All right, folks.                  |
| 6  | Let's let Commissioner Yaki continue.                 |
| 7  | COMMISSIONER YAKI: I am sorry.                        |
| 8  | Commissioner Heriot, were you referring perhaps to my |
| 9  | practice of attempting to use my own parliamentary    |
| 10 | procedure?  |
| 11 | I suppose that, you know, you would find              |
| 12 | it objectionable since it is against you, but I would |
| 13 | simply say that I don't believe that the schedule of  |
| 14 | telephonic meetings is necessary. I think that it is  |
| 15 | premature to require them.                            |
| 16 | And I think that what it does, it is a                |
| 17 | self-fulfilling prophecy in terms of our being or not |
| 18 | being able to get anything done at our normal         |
| 19 | meetings. I mean, if you want to talk about how our   |
| 20 | meetings are run, Commissioner Heriot, maybe we can   |
| 21 | talk about the fact that we still continue to get     |
| 22 | motions the day before Commission meetings, which     |
| 23 | gives some commissioners very little time in which to |
| 24 | thoroughly analyze them or not.                       |
| 25 | CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Yaki?                 |

Page 28 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I object to the --1 2 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: I understand that you 3 would prefer, that you have a strong preference, that 4 these teleconferences not take place. You have 5 expressed your views in prior meetings. And we 6 understand your position. 7 Commissioner Gaziano, how do you vote? 8 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Yes. 9 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Kirsanow? 10 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Yes. CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Heriot? 11 12 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes. CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Yaki? 13 14 COMMISSIONER YAKI: No. 15 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Taylor? COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: Yes. 16 17 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: I, too, vote in favor of the motion. So it is one vote against. That vote 18 is Commissioner Yaki's. 19 20 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Mr. Chair? CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Yes? 21 22 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I would like to make a motion from the floor, a very simple motion that has 23 24 been discussed before. 25 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Well --

Page 29 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I do not think that it 1 2 requires a great amount of intellectual disposition or 3 would cause any surprise to anyone. If we are going to go ahead and do this, it makes no sense whatsoever 4 5 for our special assistants to be put on the public 6 side of the call, rather than the commissioners' side 7 of the call. When you think about the fact that staff 8 in the meeting present in D.C. are on the 9 commissioners' side of the call as well and our staff 10 if they are present at that meeting are on the side of the call, why 11 commissioners' our staff 12 participating remotely cannot be on the commissioners' side of the call I think is unfair. 13 14 And I would ask that, going forward, 15 special assistants be allowed to participate on the commissioners' side of the call. 16 17 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Is there a second? 18 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Mr. Chairman, I 19 would be interested to hear the moving Commissioner's reasoning. Our staff, most of our special assistants 20 21 normally do not speak at meetings. They just listen, 22 regardless of where they sit. So I might depending on the rationale. 23 24 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Well, the rationale is 25 a) they are our special assistants; b) there that:

|    | Page 30  |
|----|--|
| 1  | are going to be times and perhaps it was before        |
| 2  | your time, Commissioner Gaziano, and before your time, |
| 3  | Commissioner Heriot where we will be on a remote       |
| 4  | phone call. And the question would be asked.           |
| 5  | And it is a heck of a lot easier to try                |
| б  | and clarify what may or may not have happened or get   |
| 7  | information to a special assistant than sit there and  |
| 8  | try to e-mail them separately, rather than simply say, |
| 9  | you know, blank, Joe, James, or whatever, "Did we do   |
| 10 | this? Do you have a record of that in your notes?      |
| 11 | Can you pull that out?" or whatever.                   |
| 12 | I mean, it just seems ridiculous that only             |
| 13 | by virtue of being in the D.C. office is a special     |
| 14 | assistant afforded an opportunity to be on the         |
| 15 | commissioners' side of the call.                       |
| 16 | And if we are going to be doing this more              |
| 17 | and more, the fact of the matter is that there are     |
| 18 | going to be times when someone is going to be asking   |
| 19 | their special assistant for some information.          |
| 20 | And, rather than go through 300 channels               |
| 21 | or if you are in a location where you only have access |
| 22 | by phone and your BlackBerry doesn't work, you may be  |
| 23 | in some remote location, where you are dialling in,    |
| 24 | and there is no other way to communicate with your     |
| 25 | special assistant, other than through the open phone   |

Page 31 lines. 1 2 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: I might support the 3 motion, but I just wonder if we could put it off to 4 the next meeting to think about it, discuss it. 5 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I would like to 6 consider these issues later, instead of right now. 7 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Consider what issues, Commissioner Heriot? You were the one who blocked my 8 9 special assistant from joining a meeting the other 10 day. 11 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Because we were 12 under the impression that special assistants were not 13 supposed to be on the call. 14 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I am not saying they 15 are going to be there --16 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: You seem to be 17 acknowledging it yourself. 18 COMMISSIONER YAKI: -- they're going to be 19 there speaking. They're there as a resource to us 20 should we need it. And I can tell you right now that there are times, there have been times when --21 22 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner --COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I know there are 23 24 times when you want your special assistant to be on 25 the call so they know about whether or not we are able

Page 32 to raise a quorum so you will know whether to get back 1 2 on the call. If we got --3 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner, can we 4 5 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: That is what your --6 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Heriot? 7 Okay, folks. Commissioner Yaki, at this point, it 8 appears as if you do have some support from 9 Commissioner Gaziano. He has asked whether you would 10 be willing to postpone this particular motion. Will 11 you postpone? COMMISSIONER HERIOT: You don't need to 12 13 ask him that. It hasn't been seconded. 14 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Commissioner Heriot, 15 you are such a bundle of charm in the morning. Ιt 16 really is --17 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Commissioner 18 Yaki, will you --COMMISSIONER YAKI: I would say I am 19 20 raising this as an issue. I would like it to be 21 placed on the agenda as a motion at the next in-person 22 meeting of the Commission. 23 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Very good. Mr. 24 Staff Director, please make sure that it is on the 25 agenda for the November 6th meeting.

Page 33 APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF SEPTEMBER 3, 1 TT. 2 SEPTEMBER 11, SEPTEMBER 24, OCTOBER 8, AND OCTOBER 16 MEETINGS 3 4 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. The next item 5 is the approval of the minutes of the meetings held on 6 September 3rd, September 11th, September 24th, October 7 8th, and October 16th of 2009. 8 I move that each set of these minutes be 9 approved. Is there a second? 10 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Second. I would like to make a minor amendment to one of them. 11 12 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Please allow me 13 to go first in terms of the amendments. I have 14 several. And it is possible that your concern will be 15 taken care of with my amendments. 16 The first item, I would like to make a 17 change to the September 3rd set of minutes. Kim listed as a commissioner assistant 18 Schuld is 19 participant in the second paragraph, but she reports 20 that she was not present for that meeting. So her 21 name should be deleted from the list. 22 Second, under the section titled "State Advisory Committee Issues, " on page 2, number 2, the 23 24 second paragraph, dealing with the Hawaii SAC 25 rechartering, I would like the first sentence of the

Page 34 second paragraph of that section to read as follows, 1 2 "The commissioners voted to table consideration of 3 Daphne Barbee-Wooten indefinitely unless she can 4 establish that the racially offense remarks that she 5 is reported in various news accounts to have made 6 called to our attention by Commissioner Gaziano are 7 inaccurate." 8 Furthermore, the third sentence of that 9 paragraph should be "The commissioners agree to 10 consider Ms. Barbee-Wooten's application at the 11 October 2009 meeting pending a response from Ms. 12 Barbee-Wooten regarding the news accounts of her 13 purported remarks." 14 Any other changes to the September 3rd set 15 of minutes? COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: That satisfies 16 No. 17 my concern. 18 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Commissioner 19 Gaziano, how do you vote? 20 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Yes. 21 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Kirsanow? 22 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Yes. CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Heriot? 23 24 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes. 25 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Yaki?

Page 35 Commissioner Yaki? 1 2 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Abstain. 3 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Taylor? 4 Commissioner Taylor? 5 (No response.) 6 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. We have four 7 votes in favor, one vote by Commissioner Yaki. It is 8 an abstention. The motion passes. 9 Okay. Next up. Next up are, let's see, 10 the September 11th meetings -- the minutes, rather. I 11 don't know why I keep making that mistake. Here are 12 the changes I would like to make. 13 In the paragraph under the approval of the 14 minutes of the August 7th, 2009 meeting, I would like 15 the first sentence revised to add an "s" to Panther 16 and include the words "voter intimidation" before "issue" and change the word "issue" to "case" towards 17 18 the first sentence in that paragraph. So that the 19 sentence would read as follows, "The Commission 20 language at page 2 to reflect that amended the 21 Commissioner Melendez abstained and Commissioner Yaki 22 was absent for the vote to send a letter to the Department of Justice on the Black Panthers voter 23 24 intimidation case." 25 Additionally, I believe the last sentence

|    | Page 36  |
|----|--|
| 1  | of this section, entitled "Staff Director's Report," |
| 2  | should be amended so it reads as follows,            |
| 3  | "Commissioner Melendez requested the formation of a  |
| 4  | subcommittee to deal with modifications to the 2010  |
| 5  | budget."   |
| 6  | Any additional changes, discussion with              |
| 7  | regard to the September 11th minutes?                |
| 8  | (No response.)                                       |
| 9  | CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Commissioner                |
| 10 | Gaziano, how do you vote?                            |
| 11 | COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Yes.                           |
| 12 | CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Kirsanow?            |
| 13 | COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Yes.                          |
| 14 | CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Heriot?              |
| 15 | COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes.                            |
| 16 | CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Yaki?                |
| 17 | COMMISSIONER YAKI: Abstain.                          |
| 18 | CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Taylor?              |
| 19 | (No response.)                                       |
| 20 | CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: I vote in favor of the            |
| 21 | motion. So Commissioner Yaki abstained. The          |
| 22 | remaining commissioners voted in favor. The motion   |
| 23 | passes.  |
| 24 | Next up, the   |
| 25 | COMMISSIONER YAKI: I would like to have a            |
|    |  |

Γ

Page 37 quorum call. 1 2 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Commissioner 3 Yaki? COMMISSIONER YAKI: Present. 4 5 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Heriot? 6 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Here. 7 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Kirsanow? 8 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Here. 9 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Gaziano? 10 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Here. 11 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Taylor? 12 (No response.) 13 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. We have a 14 quorum. COMMISSIONER YAKI: Commissioner Yaki is 15 16 leaving the conference. 17 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: I am not surprised. All right. Sudden business, Commissioner Yaki, or 18 19 parliamentary tactics? 20 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Do we have to ask? 21 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Let the record 22 reflect. What should the record reflect, Mr. 23 Chairman? 24 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Well --25 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: That as soon as

Page 38 Commissioner Yaki's presence or lack thereof would 1 2 deny us a quorum, he leaves. CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Well, it is well 3 4 within his right to engage in these type of tactics, 5 but it is also perfectly clear that it has a corrosive 6 effect on our relationship. And there are moments 7 where he would like the support for certain things 8 that he is doing. And these types of tactics do not 9 help his cause. 10 In any event --11 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: We can't, Ι 12 suppose, vote on any further minutes, but do you think we can continue the discussion if other commissioners 13 14 can stay on at least of the program planning for the 15 sex discrimination? 16 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: That is correct. We 17 will finish up the minutes at a later date since that 18 requires a vote. 19 IV. PROGRAM PLANNING (Continued) 20 - UPDATE ON FY 2010 PROJECT ON SEX DISCRIMINATION 21 IN HIGHER EDUCATION ADMISSIONS 22 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Mr. Staff Director, 23 would you please provide an update on the 2010 project 24 on sex discrimination in higher education admissions? 25 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: Thank you,

Mr. Chairman.

1

| 2  | Last evening I sent around a list that was             |
|----|--|
| 3  | prepared by Dr. Lerner regarding a sample of colleges  |
| 4  | and universities within a 100-mile radius of the       |
| 5  | Commission headquarters that we could seek information |
| 6  | from, also a broader list of the colleges and          |
| 7  | universities from which that sample was drawn.         |
| 8  | I would like to at this point ask Dr.                  |
| 9  | Lerner to elaborate on his methodology in choosing     |
| 10 | that sample and also about where he stands with        |
| 11 | gathering this information.                            |
| 12 | DR. LERNER: Thank you, Mr. Chairman, Mr.               |
| 13 | Staff Director. This is Robert Lerner.                 |
| 14 | Basically so I think the samples are                   |
| 15 | COMMISSIONER HERIOT: We can't hear you.                |
| 16 | STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: Can't hear.               |
| 17 | DR. LERNER: Sorry. I will try and do                   |
| 18 | this a little louder. Basically there are two          |
| 19 | strategies one can use is that better?                 |
| 20 | COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes.                              |
| 21 | DR. LERNER: Okay.                                      |
| 22 | in selecting a sample. One is what I                   |
| 23 | call a sampling strategy of discovery, which is to     |
| 24 | look for schools that might have some likelihood of    |
| 25 | discriminating against women admissions.               |

In effect, this is what we have done. And there are some reasons to do that. First of all, that was the procedure outlined in the concept paper as we interpreted it.

5 And, second of all, it was also our own 6 initial thought about the best way to proceed. Ιt 7 wasn't immediately obvious, for example, that all 8 institutions discriminate in their admissions policies 9 against women. So we want to try to see if we can 10 find someone. Some actually will do so obviously. Of 11 course, we don't know which ones until we actually get the data. 12

13 In any event, this is really a sampling 14 strategy of discovery used in response to the 15 question, can we find anything here at all? As I 16 said, samples are the things that the Staff Director 17 -- pieces of information that the Staff Director and staff -- that include the list of schools from which 18 19 sample and the actual sampling that we did we 20 yesterday of the schools that we would like to go on 21 and subpoena.

The second strategy, very briefly, is one of inference. This is where you think you have a reasonable hypothesis as to what types of schools are doing what in terms of actually discriminating and to

1 formally test that hypothesis.

2

3

4

5

6

For example, you might have a hypothesis that public schools are less likely to discriminate against women in private schools, or that less selective schools are likely to discriminate, and so on.

7 What this sampling strategy would do is 8 require, to use the technical, stratification, because 9 schools of each type would be explicitly included in 10 the design.

11 Without going into great detail, we decided not to do this because our reading of the 12 13 original intent was, in fact, that we should pick those schools as a matter for discovery, schools that 14 15 we thought were most likely to discriminate. And 16 that's why the simplest way to do that is to follow 17 the strategy, as I said, of discovery. So this is what we did. 18

Now, perhaps in selecting the sample,
there are essentially two parts. The first part is to
have the Staff Director indicate the design, list the
schools from which the selection will be made. The
second part is to actually select the schools.
The design, this is the list. It is sort
of an unusual list sustained by the fact that, of

Page 42 course, we planned on institutions that are four-year 1 2 and it contained four-year undergraduate colleges or are four-year undergraduate colleges. I mean, there 3 are institutions that have to be located within our 4 5 subpoena range. Of course, that is within 100 miles 6 of the Commission's headquarters. This is a little 7 bit tricky. 8 We were able to determine this by 9 measuring the distance from our Zip Code to the 10 institutions' Zip Codes using a device on the 11 Department of Education's website called the College 12 Navigator database, which gave us an initial list of institutions. 13 From this list, we -- this is a very large 14 15 So from this list, we came up with the main list. 16 institutions that we believed would be unsuitable for 17 the project. first five institutions that 18 The we 19 eliminated were those that were listed Peterson's 20 Guide to Colleges, which, incidentally, our basic source for school selectivity that were in a sense 21 22 noncompetitive. If school colleges are out of --23 essentially based on the admissions policies, we don't 24 want them. 25 eliminated all religious Second, we

Page 43 seminaries. When I say, "seminaries," I 1 mean 2 specifically institutions that are designed to train 3 clergy, like seminaries for priests or for Orthodox 4 rabbis. We do not mean religious schools governed by 5 a religious group these are included in the sample 6 list. If you can't speak to us, we have included them. 7 Third, we eliminated all institutions that 8 enroll under 1,000 students. The thought here is 9 simply that if you're talking about 250 students per class and 125 students. How will you do this? 10 You also wind up pretty much eliminating 11 12 the last category of schools, which are private, for-profit institutions, which there are quite a few 13 14 in the area. Most of them are nonselective or 15 minimally selective. All of them are very small. 16 And this gave us the list of institutions from which we made the selection. That was the Excel 17 charts, the one without lines in it and the one that 18 19 we sent you last night. 20 Now, how do we select the schools? Here 21 we follow again the strategy that was outlined in the 22 concept paper. We cite the selected schools within the following categories: 23 HBCUs since that was 24 mentioned; private, non-religious, moderately 25 selective colleges since that was specifically

1 mentioned; public moderately selective colleges; 2 private moderately selective religious institutions; 3 and, finally, last but not least, highly selective 4 private institutions. That gave us five categories. 5 We draw these institutions from this list that you 6 have in front of you.

Basically, we selected the individual schools that you see in front of us. We decided we couldn't have a category for simply one institution. So we take the two private HBCUs and selected two public ones to go along with it given what I listed before.

We selected, of course, all the three most highly selective, private schools that were on the initial sampling list. Those are listed again in the categories.

We selected four public schools. And those we got from the larger list, a list of those schools on a random basis for non-religious private schools, also on a random basis; and, last but not least, the private religious schools.

As I said, those that were not specifically were all done on a random basis before bias or selectivity using SPSS statistical software which actually produces a random selection. And that

> Neal R. Gross & Co., Inc. 202-234-4433

#### Page 44

Page 45 is how we wound up with the sample. 1 2 I just have it in my oral summary. I do have it, but I wasn't able to finish it in time to 3 4 send it. So you can actually contemplate that as you 5 are going to the lists. 6 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Ouestions, 7 comments? 8 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes. T have a 9 question. Why was the University of Richmond not 10 selected given that it is the school that public accusations have been made about? 11 12 DR. LERNER: Only because the strategy 13 have adopted adding institutions that we for 14 categories. We just take them at random. And if it 15 would show up, we selected it. And it turned out that 16 Catholic University did show up. So they picked them. 17 It doesn't mean we couldn't edit. Ιt 18 would be perfectly reasonable to do so. 19 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes, I would be 20 inclined to add the University of Richmond since it is 21 the institution that has been publicly accused of 22 this. DR. LERNER: Well, once they do that --23 24 and, as I said, it is perfectly legitimate to do so. 25 But that is what we are acknowledging that we are

Page 46 That I think will be --1 doing. 2 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Oh, yes, yes. Т 3 mean, that is why I want to do it. 4 DR. LERNER: From a technical point of 5 view, I have a problem with that. There was no 6 conspiracy. Ιt just happened to be the way 7 randomization turned out. I thought in general 8 randomization was a good way to deal with it because 9 it would reduced bias. But I think it is perfect 10 reasonable to make the suggestions you did. 11 Given that our approach is what I call a 12 sampling strategy of discovery and suggested enough 13 information about those particular institutions. So I 14 am perfectly agreeable to doing what you suggest. 15 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Okay. Then I would move to do that if we had a quorum. 16 Do we need to 17 move to do that or is that something that just can 18 done informally. 19 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: We didn't vote on the 20 original battle plan that Dr. Lerner just described. 21 So I don't believe that we need a vote to change as 22 long as there are no objections. COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes. 23 If we could 24 entertain a motion to delete them next time? 25 Yes, yes. CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: I mean, it

Page 47 1 2 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I doubt anyone will 3 have any strong feelings. 4 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Sure. For what it 5 is worth, I second Gail's reasoning, including 6 University of Richmond. 7 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Any other questions or 8 comments? 9 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: This is the 10 Staff Director. The concept paper spoke to private 11 HBCUs. And we only found two private HBCUs that were in this 100-mile radius. So we took those two and 12 13 then did a random selection on the -- I believe there 14 were six public HBCUs. And we did a random selection 15 and got two more of those. 16 So I just wanted to get a sense of whether 17 that is something that the commissioners think is a 18 good way to go. 19 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: That sounds fine to 20 me. 21 STAFF DIRECTOR DANNENFELSER: And then 22 with the elite institutions, the highly selective, 23 there were only three. There were exactly three, 24 which were Johns Hopkins, Georgetown, and Gettysburg 25 College. So we just took those three.

|    | Page 48  |
|----|--|
| 1  | CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. If there are no       |
| 2  | other questions, were will adjourn. Thank you. |
| 3  | (Whereupon, the foregoing matter was           |
| 4  | concluded at 12:28 p.m.)                       |
| 5  |  |
| 6  |  |
| 7  |  |
| 8  |  |
| 9  |  |
| 10 |  |
| 11 |  |
| 12 |  |
| 13 |  |
| 14 |  |
| 15 |  |
| 16 |  |
| 17 |  |
| 18 |  |
| 19 |  |
| 20 |  |
| 21 |  |
| 22 |  |
| 23 |  |
| 24 |  |
| 25 |  |

|                         | <b>6 1 20 7</b>          |   | 1   | 12 02 11 110          |
|-------------------------|--------------------------|---|---|-----------------------|
| A                       | afterward 20:7           | assist 5:12                                     | <b>bias</b> 44:24 46:9                        | 43:23 44:4,16         |
| ability 12:9            | <b>agency</b> 23:16      | assistant 30:7,14                               | <b>biased</b> 16:10 17:7                      | 45:14                 |
| <b>able</b> 27:18 31:25 | <b>agenda</b> 3:2,3 5:17 | 30:19,25 31:9,24                                | <b>bit</b> 7:19 10:12 42:7                    | category 10:23        |
| 42:8 45:3               | 5:19 6:2,4 22:17         | 33:18   | Black 6:3 7:14 9:4                            | 43:12 44:9            |
| absent 35:22            | 32:21,25                 | assistants 2:7 29:5                             | 11:21 18:7 20:11                              | <b>Catholic</b> 45:16 |
| absolutely 4:7          | agree 34:9               | 29:15,20,25 31:12                               | 21:1 35:23                                    | cause 29:3 38:9       |
| 17:24                   | agreeable 46:14          | Asst 2:3  | BlackBerry 30:22                              | certain 22:9 38:7     |
| Abstain 5:16 35:2       | ahead 4:8 10:10          | assume 16:9 24:10                               | Blackwood 2:2                                 | certainly 21:22       |
| 36:17                   | 14:7 19:21 29:4          | 25:4  | 7:16,17,20,21 8:1                             | 22:4                  |
| abstained 35:21         | ALISON 2:10              | assuming 14:25                                  | 8:5,8 9:22 10:16                              | certificates 10:19    |
| 36:21                   | allegations 21:6         | attempt 16:4                                    | 11:4,15 12:1,7,17                             | <b>CFR</b> 20:9       |
| abstention 35:8         | <b>allow</b> 12:17 33:12 | attempting 27:9                                 | 14:3,3,8 16:8 17:4                            | <b>CFRs</b> 23:20     |
| access 30:21            | allowed 11:12            | attend 12:13 22:11                              | 17:7,11,11 19:15                              | <b>Chair</b> 4:15,15  |
| accommodate             | 14:12 29:15              | attending 15:9                                  | 23:11 24:5,18                                 | 12:23 18:11 24:22     |
| 26:15                   | amend 6:2                | attention 34:6                                  | 25:4  | 25:2 28:20            |
| accounts 34:5,12        | amended 35:20            | AUDREY 2:6                                      | blanche 22:24                                 | Chairman 1:8,10       |
| accusations 45:11       | 36:2                     | August 35:14                                    | blank 30:9                                    | 4:3,9,10,18,20,22     |
| accused 45:21           | amendment 33:11          | <b>authority</b> 19:5 20:8                      | blocked 31:8                                  | 4:24 5:1,3,5,8,11     |
| acknowledging           | amendments 5:23          | 23:4,22,23 25:6,9                               | <b>Board</b> 17:23                            | 5:18,21,24 6:10       |
| 31:17 45:25             | 6:1 33:13,15             | authorize 20:13                                 | briefly 40:22                                 | 6:12,14,17,19,21      |
| Act 20:13               | amount 29:2              | 21:17   | broad 23:3                                    | 6:23,25 7:8,24 8:7    |
| acting 16:19            | analyze 27:24            | authorized 23:25                                | <b>broader</b> 16:24 24:6                     | 9:20 10:10 12:21      |
| actions 20:11 21:8      | and/or 20:22             | aware 24:9                                      | 39:6  | 13:1,12,19,22         |
| actual 40:19            | answer 5:15 12:17        | <b>axe</b> 16:6                                 | budget 36:5                                   | 14:2 15:2,5 16:8      |
| add 19:6 35:15          | 14:2 23:12               | <b>a.m</b> 1:7 4:2                              | bundle 32:15                                  | 16:14,17,21 17:1      |
| 45:20                   | answers 12:10            | <u> </u>  | <b>business</b> 26:9,15,24                    | 17:4,9 19:9,14,17     |
| adding 19:6 45:13       | apologize 17:3           |   | 37:18   | 19:18,21 20:1,4       |
| addition 26:6           | appear 20:21             | <b>b</b> 29:25                                  | BYRNES 2:2                                    | 20:14 21:10,10        |
| additional 22:6         | appearance 12:11         | back 24:11 32:1                                 | <u> </u>                                      | 22:2,6,12 24:24       |
| 36:6                    | appears 32:8             | Barbee-Wooten                                   |   | 25:10,13,15,17,19     |
| Additionally 35:25      | applicable 23:6          | 34:3,12   | <b>calendar</b> 3:6 6:6                       | 25:21 26:2,21         |
| additions 26:13         | application 34:10        | Barbee-Wooten's                                 | 26:1,18                                       | 27:5,25 28:2,9,11     |
| addressed 23:21         | approach 46:11           | 34:10   | <b>call</b> 4:6,8,13 5:15                     | 28:13,15,17,21,25     |
| addresses 10:5          | appropriate 15:14        | barely 7:23                                     | 25:9 29:6,7,9,11                              | 29:17,18 31:22        |
| addressing 22:20        | <b>approval</b> 3:3,4,6  | <b>based</b> 11:19 42:23<br><b>basic</b> 42:20  | 29:13,16 30:4,15                              | 32:3,6,17,23 33:4     |
| adjourn 48:2            | 5:17 6:5 26:1            |   | 31:13,25 32:2                                 | 33:12 34:18,21,23     |
| adjustments 26:13       | 33:1,5 35:13             | <b>basically</b> 11:14,19                       | 37:1 39:23 46:11<br>called 20:23 34:6         | 34:25 35:3,6 36:9     |
| admissions 3:10         | approve 5:18             | 13:24 39:14,18                                  | 42:11   | 36:12,14,16,18,20     |
| 38:21,24 39:25          | approved 33:9            | 44:7  |   | 37:2,5,7,9,11,13      |
| 40:8 42:23              | area 8:20 9:6 11:2       | <b>basis</b> 44:19,20,23                        | <b>campaign</b> 8:17<br>11:10 18:6            | 37:17,23,24 38:3      |
| <b>adopt</b> 26:17      | 43:14                    | <b>battle</b> 46:20                             |   | 38:16,22 39:1,12      |
| adopted 23:13           | ASCD 2:3                 | <b>believe</b> 23:21 27:13<br>35:25 46:21 47:13 | <b>cancel</b> 11:14<br><b>care</b> 17:5 33:15 | 45:6 46:19,25         |
| 45:13                   | ascertain 16:4           |   | carte 22:24                                   | 47:7 48:1             |
| Advisory 33:23          | <b>ASHLEY</b> 1:12       | <b>believed</b> 42:16                           | carte 22:24<br>case 15:17 22:22               | change 8:13 33:17     |
| affiliations 16:10      | asked 30:4 32:9          | <b>best</b> 8:8 40:6                            |   | 35:17 46:21           |
| affirmative 7:1         | asking 13:6,21,23        | <b>better</b> 8:4 39:19                         | 35:17,24                                      | changes 6:10 8:24     |
| afforded 30:14          | 15:10 30:18              | <b>beyond</b> 16:24                             | categories 20:20,25                           | 34:14 35:12 36:6      |
|                         | l                        |   | l   |                       |

Neal R. Gross & Co., Inc. 202-234-4433

# Page 49

|                             | _                  | _                         | _                          | _                   |
|-----------------------------|--------------------|---------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------|
| channels 30:20              | 6:14,16,17,18,19   | 29:19                     | 21:19 23:3,11              | 11:24 12:14 14:5    |
| charges 7:14                | 6:20,21,22,23,24   | <b>Commission's</b> 20:8  | <b>Counts</b> 9:8 10:14    | 14:10,15,18 15:7    |
| <b>charm</b> 32:15          | 7:1,18,22,22 8:3,3 | 42:6                      | 10:17,22                   | 20:22 21:23 22:11   |
| <b>charts</b> 43:18         | 10:8,8,10,12,24    | Committee 33:23           | <b>course</b> 40:11 42:1,5 | 22:13               |
| <b>check</b> 17:19          | 11:13,18 12:4,8    | communicate               | 44:13                      | depositions 9:1     |
| Chief 2:3                   | 12:13,16,16,19,23  | 30:24                     | <b>Court</b> 5:8,12        | 12:3 14:22 18:21    |
| <b>childish</b> 13:11       | 13:3,4,6,7,8,12,14 | complete 16:4             | critical 18:25             | deprived 12:9       |
| choosing 39:9               | 13:17,19,21,23     | 18:14                     | current 21:3               | described 46:20     |
| <b>Chris</b> 11:7           | 14:4,6,24,25 15:4  | <b>concept</b> 40:3 43:22 | currently 24:9             | design 41:10,21,24  |
| CHRISTOPHER                 | 16:14,15,18,22     | 47:10                     | custodians 21:5            | designed 43:2       |
| 2:2                         | 17:1,3,6,12 18:10  | <b>concern</b> 33:14      |                            | detail 41:11        |
| circulated 19:23            | 19:9,12,17,19,22   | 34:17                     | D                          | determine 4:14      |
| <b>cite</b> 43:22           | 20:2,6 21:12,13    | concluded 48:4            | DANNENFELS                 | 24:14 25:2 42:8     |
| <b>civil</b> 1:1 13:9,10    | 22:3,7,7,20 24:2,2 | conducted 17:7            | 1:14 5:7 38:25             | determining 23:7    |
| clarify 30:6                | 24:13,15,17,25     | conference 37:16          | 39:16 47:9,21              | <b>device</b> 42:10 |
| <b>class</b> 43:10          | 25:7,10,12,13,14   | <b>confirm</b> 24:20      | Daphne 34:3                | dialling 30:23      |
| <b>clear</b> 8:11 38:5      | 25:15,16,17,18,19  | confused 10:12            | <b>data</b> 40:12          | different 4:13 8:1  |
| clergy 43:3                 | 25:20,22 26:20,22  | Congress 13:15            | database 42:12             | directly 10:6       |
| <b>close</b> 7:25           | 26:25 27:3,6,7,8   | Connecticut 8:20          | date 15:11 38:17           | director 1:14 2:3   |
| <b>closer</b> 7:19          | 27:20,25 28:1,7,8  | consent 20:3              | <b>dated</b> 20:16         | 5:6,7 7:10 15:25    |
| <b>Code</b> 42:9            | 28:9,10,11,12,13   | consider 31:6,7           | <b>dates</b> 15:7,8 26:4,6 | 19:3 26:3 32:24     |
| <b>Codes</b> 42:10          | 28:14,15,16,19,20  | 34:10                     | 26:7,12,14,17              | 38:22,25 39:13,16   |
| <b>College</b> 42:11        | 28:22 29:1,18,24   | consideration 34:2        | <b>David</b> 2:2 7:16,20   | 40:16,17 41:21      |
| 47:25                       | 30:2,3 31:2,5,7,8  | conspiracy 46:6           | 7:24 14:3 17:11            | 47:9,10,21          |
| <b>colleges</b> 39:3,6 42:2 | 31:11,14,16,18,22  | constrained 12:20         | <b>day</b> 15:25 19:3      | Director's 36:1     |
| 42:3,20,22 43:25            | 31:23 32:3,5,6,7,9 | contact 10:1 16:24        | 27:22 31:10                | discovery 8:14,25   |
| 44:1                        | 32:12,14,14,17,19  | 18:9                      | Daylight 1:7 4:11          | 10:15 11:20 15:15   |
| <b>combine</b> 9:16         | 33:10,18 34:6,16   | contacting 9:24           | <b>deal</b> 36:4 46:8      | 15:22 16:3 20:17    |
| <b>come</b> 5:12 8:23       | 34:18,20,21,22,23  | contained 42:2            | dealing 33:24              | 39:23 40:14 41:14   |
| 11:8 12:14 17:13            | 34:24,25 35:1,2,3  | contemplate 45:4          | <b>decided</b> 41:12 44:8  | 41:17 46:12         |
| 18:18                       | 35:4,7,21,21 36:3  | CONTENTS 3:1              | decision 21:25             | discretion 23:22    |
| comfortable 16:3            | 36:9,11,12,13,14   | continue 13:22            | decisions 21:21            | 25:2                |
| <b>coming</b> 24:11         | 36:15,16,17,18,21  | 18:12 21:12 27:6          | defeat 27:1                | discriminate 40:8   |
| comments 14:25              | 36:25 37:2,4,5,6,7 | 27:21 38:13               | defendants 21:1            | 41:3,5,15           |
| 22:6 24:24 45:7             | 37:8,9,10,11,15    | Continued 38:19           | delegating 25:6,8          | discriminating      |
| 47:8                        | 37:15,18,20,21,25  | convened 1:7              | <b>delete</b> 46:24        | 39:25 40:25         |
| <b>Commission</b> 1:1,7     | 38:1,11 39:15,20   | conversation 13:9         | deleted 33:21              | discrimination      |
| 3:7 14:9 16:20              | 45:8,19 46:2,15    | 13:10                     | deletions 26:14            | 3:10 38:15,20,24    |
| 21:17,24 23:22              | 46:23 47:2,4,19    | coordinated 15:11         | Democratic 17:22           | discuss 31:4        |
| 24:1 25:3,5 26:1,4          | commissioners 4:4  | <b>correct</b> 12:7,12    | 18:6                       | discussed 28:24     |
| 26:15,18 27:22              | 4:12 7:3 12:8      | 17:12 38:16               | deny 38:2                  | discussion 5:21 6:3 |
| 32:22 35:19 39:5            | 14:10,11 22:10     | corrosive 38:5            | <b>Department</b> 7:13     | 6:12 22:17 26:21    |
| commissioner 1:11           | 25:23 27:23 29:6   | <b>cost</b> 22:8          | 35:23 42:11                | 36:6 38:13          |
| 1:11,12,12,13 2:7           | 29:9,11,12,16      | costly 21:21              | depending 14:14            | dismissal 7:13      |
| 4:5,14,18,19,20             | 30:15 34:2,9       | Counsel 2:2 7:11          | 29:22                      | disposition 29:2    |
| 4:21,22,23,24 5:1           | 36:22 38:13 47:17  | 10:9 13:7,24              | depends 14:17              | distance 42:9       |
| 5:2,3,4,20,22 6:9           | Commissioner's     | 18:12 20:16,17            | deposition 9:12            | distinctions 10:18  |
|                             | l                  |                           |                            |                     |

|                           |                            |                           |                            | I                   |
|---------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------|
| documents 21:7            | especially 22:23           | 33:13,16,25 35:15         | 14:25 19:17,19,20          | <b>group</b> 43:5   |
| <b>doing</b> 16:23 30:16  | essentially 41:20          | 35:18 40:2 41:20          | 19:22 20:2,6               | guess 4:4           |
| 38:8 40:25 46:1           | 42:23                      | 42:18                     | 21:12,13 22:3              | <b>Guide</b> 42:20  |
| 46:14                     | establish 34:4             | five 4:4 20:25 21:7       | 24:17 25:11,12             |                     |
| <b>DOJ</b> 9:17 21:4,5,8  | evening 39:2               | 22:23 42:18 44:4          | 28:7,8 29:18 30:2          | <u> </u>            |
| <b>DOJ's</b> 20:11        | event 38:10 40:13          | <b>floor</b> 28:23        | 31:2 32:9 33:10            | happened 15:18      |
| <b>DOMINIQUE</b> 2:9      | events 21:3                | focus 13:20               | 34:6,16,19,20              | 30:6 46:6           |
| <b>doubt</b> 47:2         | evidence 21:23             | focused 22:19             | 36:10,11 37:9,10           | happens 14:14,17    |
| <b>Dr</b> 39:3,8,12,17,21 | exactly 47:23              | folks 12:10,22 27:5       | 37:21,25 38:11             | <b>Hawaii</b> 33:24 |
| 45:12,23 46:4,20          | example 40:7 41:2          | 32:7                      | 47:4                       | HBCUs 43:23         |
| draft 20:15,19            | <b>Excel</b> 43:17         | follow 41:16 43:21        | Gaziano's 24:15            | 44:10 47:11,11,14   |
| <b>draw</b> 44:5          | exception 11:5             | following 8:24            | geared 9:2,3               | headquarters 39:5   |
| <b>drawn</b> 39:7         | 15:18                      | 43:23                     | general 2:2 7:11           | 42:6                |
| <b>DUNSTON</b> 2:3        | <b>Excuse</b> 24:13        | follows 34:1 35:19        | 10:9 13:7,24               | hear 7:23 8:2 29:19 |
| <b>D.C</b> 11:8 12:6 19:5 | explained 21:19            | 36:2                      | 18:12 20:16,17             | 39:15,16            |
| 29:8 30:13                | explicitly 41:9            | foregoing 48:3            | 21:19 23:2,11              | hearing 8:15 9:12   |
|                           | expressed 8:22             | <b>form</b> 9:1           | 46:7                       | 9:14,17 11:14,16    |
| E                         | 28:5                       | formally 41:1             | generally 11:4 19:5        | 12:6,14 14:1,15     |
| easier 30:5               | extremely 22:22            | formation 36:3            | Gentlemen 22:12            | 19:1 20:15,19,22    |
| Eastern 1:7 4:10          | <b>e-mail</b> 30:8         | former 20:25 21:3         | Georgetown 47:24           | 21:22 22:1,4        |
| 26:10,11                  |                            | forward 18:18             | <b>GERALD</b> 1:7,10       | hearings 3:8 7:6,9  |
| edit 45:17                | F                          | 29:14                     | Gettysburg 47:24           | 9:17 22:14          |
| education 3:10            | <b>F</b> 1:11              | for-profit 43:13          | <b>Giordano</b> 16:1       | heck 30:5           |
| 38:21,24                  | fact 8:22 11:19            | found 23:17 47:11         | give 12:10 18:1            | held 33:5           |
| Education's 42:11         | 15:14,18,24 17:21          | four 21:5 35:6            | 20:22 22:16                | help 38:9           |
| effect 38:6 40:1          | 18:22 19:2 26:25           | 44:17                     | given 15:14 24:12          | helpful 21:14       |
| efforts 16:9 18:12        | 27:21 29:7 30:17           | four-year 42:1,2,3        | 44:11 45:10 46:11          | Heriot 1:11 4:22,23 |
| EILEEN 2:5                | 41:13,25                   | frankly 14:21             | gives 27:23                | 6:19,20 25:7,15     |
| either 9:16 17:17         | facts 16:5 18:14           | 23:21 24:22               | giving 15:9                | 25:16 26:20,25      |
| elaborate 39:9            | fall 10:22 20:20           | FRIDAY 1:5                | <b>go</b> 4:8 5:25 10:2,10 | 27:8,20 28:11,12    |
| election 15:25 16:6       | far 8:14 9:22 15:17        | <b>front</b> 44:6,8       | 11:23 14:7 17:18           | 30:3 31:5,8,11,16   |
| 19:3                      | 24:4                       | full-blown 22:17          | 18:16 19:21 29:4           | 31:23 32:5,6,12     |
| Elections 17:23           | fashion 26:24              | further 22:5 38:12        | 30:20 33:13 40:20          | 32:14 34:23,24      |
| eliminated 42:19          | favor 7:3 28:17            | furtherance 20:10         | 44:11 47:18                | 36:14,15 37:5,6     |
| 42:25 43:7                | 35:7 36:20,22              | <b>Furthermore</b> 34:8   | going 5:22 15:6            | 37:20 39:15,20      |
| eliminating 43:11         | <b>FAY</b> 2:8             | <b>FY</b> 3:9,9 7:7 38:20 | 18:15 19:10 22:9           | 45:8,19 46:2,15     |
| elite 47:22               | fed 15:15                  |                           | 22:10 23:9,9,10            | 46:23 47:2,19       |
| <b>EMMA</b> 2:4           | feelings 47:3              | G                         | 24:14,16,16 29:3           | heroes 13:15        |
| encompass 24:7            | <b>file</b> 14:20          | <b>GAIL</b> 1:11          | 29:14 30:1,16,18           | higher 3:10 38:21   |
| encourage 18:18           | finally 44:3               | Gail's 47:5               | 30:18 31:15,18             | 38:24               |
| enforcement 3:9           | <b>find</b> 21:23 22:22,23 | games 13:11               | 41:11 45:5                 | highly 44:3,14      |
| 7:7,10,12 20:12           | 27:11 40:10,15             | gathering 39:11           | good 4:9 21:16             | 47:22               |
| engage 38:4               | <b>fine</b> 47:19          | Gaziano 1:11 4:18         | 32:23 46:8 47:18           | Hill 11:7           |
| enroll 43:8               | finish 38:17 45:3          | 4:19 5:20,22 6:9,9        | governed 43:4              | hit 13:1            |
| <b>ensure</b> 18:13       | finished 14:11             | 6:15,16 7:18              | granted 23:4               | hold 4:15 12:21     |
| entertain 46:24           | first 5:25 6:4 13:2        | 12:13,16,19 13:4          | great 29:2 41:11           | Hopkins 47:24       |
| entitled 36:1             | 14:4,13,22 24:19           | 13:8,12,17,19             | grind 16:6                 | <b>hotel</b> 21:22  |
|                           |                            |                           | 8                          |                     |
|                           | I                          | I                         | I                          | 1                   |

| $ \begin{array}{ c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c$  | hypothesis 40:24          | informally 46:18          | issues 18:20 21:20 | LENORE 2:5               | 2:10                                  |
|--|---------------------------|---------------------------|--------------------|--------------------------|---------------------------------------|
| $\begin{array}{ c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c$   | 41:1,2                    |                           | -                  | ,                        |                                       |
| $ \begin{array}{ c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c$  |                           |                           | ,                  |                          |                                       |
| $\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $   |                           |                           |                    |                          |                                       |
| $\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $   |                           |                           |                    |                          |                                       |
| $\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $   |                           |                           |                    |                          |                                       |
| $\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $   |                           |                           | <b>IX</b> 6:7      |                          |                                       |
| $\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $   |                           |                           |                    |                          | · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · |
| $\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $   |                           |                           |                    |                          | 0                                     |
| $\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $   |                           |                           |                    |                          | 0                                     |
| $\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $   |                           |                           |                    |                          | 4:15 5:12 6:6 8:9                     |
| $ \begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $  | U U                       | insinuating 16:15         |                    | <b>lines</b> 31:1 43:18  | 8:14 26:7,12,14                       |
| $\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $   |                           | institution 44:9          |                    | <b>list</b> 23:14 26:3,5 | 29:8,10 31:4,9                        |
| $\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $   |                           | 45:21                     | •                  | 33:21 39:2,6             | 32:22,25 33:20                        |
| $\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $   |                           | institutions 40:8         |                    | 40:18 41:21,24,25        | 34:11 35:14                           |
| $\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $   |                           | 42:1,4,10,13,16           |                    | 42:12,14,15,15           | meetings 3:5,7 26:1                   |
| $\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $   |                           | 42:18 43:2,7,13           | Justice's 7:13     | 43:6,16 44:5,15          | 26:4,9,9,18,23                        |
| Important 15:25       intellectual 29:2       interview 10:2       interview 8:9       interview 8:9       interview 8:11       interview 8:12       interview 9:23:10:4       interview 9:23:20       interview 9:25:10       interview 9:2   |                           | 43:16 44:2,4,5            |                    | 44:18,18                 | 27:1,14,19,20,22                      |
| $\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $   | -                         | 45:13 46:13 47:22         |                    | listed 20:14 33:18       | 28:5 29:21 33:3,5                     |
| $ \begin{array}{c} \mbox{Interv} 11.9 \\ \mbox{interv} 11.9 \\ \mbox{interv} 11.9 \\ \mbox{interv} 11.9 \\ \mbox{interv} 12.1 \\ \mbox{interv} 13.15,17 \\ \mbox{incidents} 10.6 \\ \mbox{incidents} 13.15,17 \\ \mbox{incidents} 13.15,17 \\ \mbox{incidents} 13.16 \\ in$ |                           | intellectual 29:2         | -                  | 42:19 44:11,15           | 35:10                                 |
| $ \begin{array}{ c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c$  | -                         | <b>intent</b> 41:13       |                    | <b>listen</b> 29:21      | Melendez 4:24                         |
| $\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $   |                           | intention 8:23            |                    | <b>lists</b> 45:5        | 35:21 36:3                            |
| $\begin{array}{ c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c$   |                           | interest 15:9,16          | · · · · · ·        | litigation 14:19         | members 7:14 9:3                      |
| $\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $   |                           | interested 29:19          |                    | 20:12 21:2,4,9           | 11:21                                 |
| $\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $   |                           | interpreted 40:4          | , , ,              | little 7:19,19 13:10     | memo 24:15                            |
| 11:1:1:1:1:1:1:1:1:1:1:1:1:1:1:1:1:1:1   | incidentally 42:20        | <b>interrupt</b> 13:15,17 |                    | 23:6 27:23 39:18         | mentioned 43:24                       |
| $\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $   | incidents 10:6            | 15:1                      |                    | 42:6                     | 44:1                                  |
| $\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $   | inclined 45:20            | interview 10:2            | -                  | <b>live</b> 8:17         | <b>met</b> 10:2                       |
| $\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $   |                           | 11:22,23 12:12            |                    | located 42:4             | methodology 39:9                      |
| $\begin{array}{llllllllllllllllllllllllllllllllllll$   | 40:18                     | interviewed 8:9           |                    | location 22:13           |                                       |
| $\begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$  | <b>included</b> 41:9 43:5 | interviewing 10:25        |                    | 30:21,23                 | microphone 8:2,6                      |
| Including 19:7 47:5       intimidation 7:14       knowledge 21:4       logistical 18:20       mines 8:18 42:5         indicate 41:21       intimidation 7:14       35:16,24       investigation 20:10       22:5       long 46:22       long 46:22       long 46:22       long 46:22       look 23:20 39:24       mines 8:18 42:15         indicate 41:21       investigations 20:10       22:5       lock 38:1       lock 23:20 39:24       lost 16:7       look 23:20 39:24       look 23:20 39:24       look 23:10 43:15       mines 3:4 6:5       33:1,5,8,17 34:15         individuals 9:5,10       21:21       investigations 21:6       language 35:20       large 16:6 42:14       louder 39:18       LUDVIGSON 2:9       35:10,14 36:7       35:10,14 36:7       35:10,14 36:7       35:10,14 36:7       35:10,14 36:7       35:11       misspoken 10:16       misspoken 10:16       35:11       moderately 43:24       44:1,2       44:1,2       44:1,2       44:1,2       44:1,2       44:1,2       44:1,2       44:1,2       modifications 36:4       44:1,2       modifications 36:4       44:1,2       44:1,2       modifications 36:4       44:1,2       44:1,2       modifications 36:4       44:1,2       modifications 36:4       44:1,2       44:1,2       modifications 36:4       44:1,2       44:1,2       modifications 36:4       44:1,2       modifications 3   |                           | U                         |                    | locations 4:13           |                                       |
| including 19:7 47:5       intimidation 7:14       knowledge 21:4       long 46:22       mind 8:12 14:17         indicate 41:21       investigation 20:10       1:111,12       look 23:20 39:24       mind 8:12 14:17         indicate 41:21       investigation 20:10       2:5       look 23:20 39:24       mind 8:12 14:17         individual 44:7       investigations 21:6       involved 18:20       21:21       louder 39:18       louder 39:18       33:1,5,8,17 34:15         9:23 10:4 11:9       14:20 15:19 16:11       in-person 26:7,8,18       large 16:6 42:14       large 14:64 42:14       misspoken 10:16         18:8,23 19:7       22:14 23:18,21       32:21       leading 17:2       leading 17:2       leading 17:2       leading 17:13       leaves 38:2       35:11       moderately 43:24         16:25 17:18,20,24       32:20 35:17,17       issue 17:10 19:16       leaves 38:2       leaving 37:16       35:11       moderately 43:24  | includes 9:24 26:6        | 17:8                      |                    | logistical 18:20         | miles 8:18 42:5                       |
| indefinitely 34:3       35:16,24       investigation 20:10       L       L       look 23:20 39:24       minimally 43:15         indicate 41:21       investigation 20:10       22:5       investigations 21:6       integer 44:18       integer 44:18       integer 44:18       investigation 10:16       instake 35:11       instake 35:11       instake 35:11       instake 35:11       instake 35:11       instake 35:11       indefinitely 43:24       instake 35:11       indefinitely 43:24       instake 35:11       instake 35:11       indefinitely 43:24       instake 35:11       indefinitely 43:24       instake 35:11       instake 35:11  | including 19:7 47:5       | intimidation 7:14         | knowledge 21:4     |                          |                                       |
| $\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $   | indefinitely 34:3         | 35:16,24                  |                    | 0                        | minimally 43:15                       |
| indicated 11:7       22:5       individual 44:7       investigations 21:6       investiga  | indicate 41:21            | -                         |                    |                          |                                       |
| individual 44:7       investigations 21:6       lack 38:1       louder 39:18       33:1,5,8,17 34:15         individuals 9:5,10       9:23 10:4 11:9       21:21       large 16:6 42:14       large 16:6 42:14       large 16:6 42:14       33:1,5,8,17 34:15         14:20 15:19 16:11       in-person 26:7,8,18       large 16:6 42:14       large 16:6 42:14       large 16:6 42:14       38:12,17         16:25 17:18,20,24       32:21       issue 17:10 19:16       law 23:6       leading 17:2       leading 17:2       leads 17:13       leads 17:13       leads 17:13       learn 12:3       leaves 38:2       35:11       modifications 36:4         inference 40:23       32:20 35:17,17       issue 24:1       issue 24:1       leaving 37:16       MARTIN 1:14       moment 13:16   | indicated 11:7            | 0                         | ,                  |                          | minutes 3:4 6:5                       |
| individuals 9:5,10       involved 18:20       language 35:20         9:23 10:4 11:9       21:21       large 16:6 42:14       large 16:6 42:14         14:20 15:19 16:11       in-person 26:7,8,18       large 44:18       large 44:18       law 23:6         18:8,23 19:7       22:14 23:18,21       issue 17:10 19:16       leading 17:2       leading 17:2       leading 5:13 6:6         24:7,8,19       22:14 23:18,21       32:20 35:17,17       leaves 38:2       leaves 38:2       leaving 37:16       modifications 36:4   | individual 44:7           |                           |                    |                          |                                       |
| 9:23 10:4 11:9       21:21       arge 16:6 42:14       38:12,17         14:20 15:19 16:11       in-person 26:7,8,18       arge 44:18       arge 44:18       misspoken 10:16         16:25 17:18,20,24       32:21       issue 17:10 19:16       leading 17:2       making 5:13 6:6       mistake 35:11         20:14,17 21:2       21:17 22:4,8,13       22:14 23:18,21       leaves 38:2       modifications 36:4         inference 40:23       32:20 35:17,17       issue 24:1       Marge 16:6 42:14       Marge 16:6 42:14   | individuals 9:5,10        |                           | 0 0                |                          |                                       |
| M       misspoken 10:16         16:25 17:18,20,24       32:21         18:8,23 19:7       issue 17:10 19:16         20:14,17 21:2       21:17 22:4,8,13         24:7,8,19       22:14 23:18,21         inference 40:23       32:20 35:17,17         informal 24:20       issue 24:1   | 9:23 10:4 11:9            |                           | 0                  |                          | ,                                     |
| 16:25 17:18,20,24       32:21         18:8,23 19:7       issue 17:10 19:16         20:14,17 21:2       21:17 22:4,8,13         24:7,8,19       22:14 23:18,21         inference 40:23       32:20 35:17,17         informal 24:20       issued 24:1  | 14:20 15:19 16:11         |                           | 0                  | M                        |                                       |
| 18:8,23 19:7       issue 17:10 19:16       leading 17:2       making 5:13 6:6       moderately 43:24         20:14,17 21:2       21:17 22:4,8,13       leads 17:13       leads 17:13       assue 17:10       heading 17:2         24:7,8,19       22:14 23:18,21       leaves 38:2       leaves 38:2       moderately 43:24       heading 17:2         inference 40:23       32:20 35:17,17       leaving 37:16       MARTIN 1:14       moderately 43:24   | 16:25 17:18,20,24         | -                         |                    | main 42:15               | -                                     |
| 20:14,17 21:2       21:17 22:4,8,13       leads 17:13       35:11       44:1,2         24:7,8,19       22:14 23:18,21       leaves 38:2       35:20 35:17,17       modifications 36:4         informal 24:20       issued 24:1       leaving 37:16       MARTIN 1:14       moment 3:6  | 18:8,23 19:7              |                           | -                  | making 5:13 6:6          |                                       |
| 24:7,8,19       22:14 23:18,21       learn 12:3       Management 3:6       modifications 36:4         inference 40:23       32:20 35:17,17       leaves 38:2       25:25       moment 13:16         informal 24:20       issued 24:1       leaving 37:16       MARTIN 1:14       moments 38:6  | 20:14,17 21:2             |                           |                    | 35:11                    | •                                     |
| inference 40:23         32:20 35:17,17         leaves 38:2         25:25         moment 13:16           informal 24:20         issued 24:1         leaving 37:16         MARTIN 1:14         moments 38:6  | 24:7,8,19                 |                           |                    | Management 3:6           | · ·                                   |
| informal 24:20 issued 24:1 leaving 37:16 MARTIN 1:14 moments 38:6  | inference 40:23           | · · · · ·                 |                    |                          |                                       |
| legitimate 45:24   | informal 24:20            | · · · · ·                 | 8                  | <b>MARTIN</b> 1:14       |                                       |
|  |                           |                           | legitimate 45:24   |                          |                                       |

|                            |                           |                         |                         | -                   |
|----------------------------|---------------------------|-------------------------|-------------------------|---------------------|
| MONROIG 2:4                | noted 12:24               | <b>Operator</b> 4:5,7   | people 8:21 10:14       | poll 9:9 10:14,15   |
| moods 12:20                | notes 30:10               | opportunity 22:16       | 10:18 13:15 15:23       | 10:17,18 11:1,5,6   |
| morning 4:9 32:15          | <b>notice</b> 15:9        | 30:14                   | 16:5 24:4               | 17:15,22            |
| <b>motion</b> 7:2,3,4      | notion 21:19              | oral 45:2               | perfect 46:9            | polling 9:9 10:20   |
| 19:20,22 20:7              | November 32:25            | order 5:12 18:12        | perfectly 38:5          | 11:11,12 17:20      |
| 21:11 22:18,19,21          | number 15:10,12           | ordinary 25:8           | 45:18,24 46:14          | portions 9:25       |
| 22:22 23:13,19             | 15:13 22:10,23            | original 14:19          | personnel 21:4          | position 28:6       |
| 24:10 25:5,22,23           | 23:12 24:15 33:23         | 41:13 46:20             | <b>PETER</b> 1:12       | possible 18:13      |
| 28:18,23,23 31:3           |                           | originally 8:13         | Peterson's 42:19        | 33:14               |
| 32:10,21 35:8              | 0                         | 9:15                    | phantom 4:5             | possibly 4:4 15:10  |
| 36:21,22 46:24             | <b>object</b> 28:1        | Orthodox 43:3           | Philadelphia 8:10       | 15:12               |
| <b>motions</b> 27:22       | objectionable             | <b>OSTROWSKY</b> 2:5    | 8:17,18,19 9:1,6        | postpone 32:10,11   |
| <b>mouth</b> 8:6           | 27:12                     | outlined 40:3 43:21     | 9:12,15 10:7,22         | potential 19:7 21:7 |
| move 5:18 6:4 9:14         | objections 46:22          | outside 11:3,11         | 11:2,7,14,16,23         | 22:11 26:4          |
| 9:18 13:2 20:13            | <b>observed</b> 10:6 18:6 | 12:5 14:16              | 16:12 17:18 18:16       | potentially 18:24   |
| 26:17 33:8 46:16           | <b>obvious</b> 40:7       |                         | 18:24 19:4 21:3         | 23:7 24:14 25:3     |
| 46:17                      | obviously 18:8            | P                       | 21:22 22:11             | <b>power</b> 24:22  |
| moving 29:19               | 21:13 23:24 24:6          | page 3:2 33:23          | Philadelphia-bas        | practical 24:18     |
| <b>mull</b> 19:15          | 24:20 26:12 40:10         | 35:20                   | 16:2                    | practice 14:8 23:15 |
| <b>muster</b> 22:25        | occurred 10:7             | PAMELA 2:3              | <b>phone</b> 26:18 30:4 | 26:8 27:9           |
|                            | 16:12                     | <b>Panther</b> 6:3 7:15 | 30:22,25                | practices 23:16     |
| N                          | <b>OCRE</b> 2:4           | 9:4 11:21 18:7          | physical 9:14           | precinct 15:23      |
| <b>N</b> 1:12              | <b>October</b> 1:5 3:5,5  | 20:11 21:1 35:15        | physically 10:20        | preclude 26:13      |
| name 4:13 18:1             | 4:11 20:16 26:3,5         | Panthers 35:23          | <b>pick</b> 41:13       | prefer 28:3         |
| 33:21                      | 33:2,3,6,7 34:11          | paper 17:19 40:3        | picked 45:16            | preference 28:3     |
| names 5:15                 | odd 18:16                 | 43:22 47:10             | picture 9:15            | premature 27:15     |
| nature 17:14               | offense 34:4              | paragraph 33:19         | <b>pieces</b> 40:17     | prepared 20:15      |
| Navigator 42:12            | <b>offer</b> 19:20        | 33:24 34:1,9            | place 8:25 9:9          | 39:3                |
| <b>Nay</b> 5:16            | office 9:16 30:13         | 35:13,18                | 10:20 11:11,12          | presence 18:17      |
| <b>NBPP</b> 21:1,4,8       | officers 19:4             | parliamentary           | 16:2 17:20 28:4         | 38:1                |
| necessary 5:14             | OGC 2:2 17:18             | 27:9 37:19              | placed 32:21            | present 1:9 2:1,7   |
| 26:15 27:14                | <b>Oh</b> 46:2            | part 16:1 17:24         | <b>plan</b> 8:14 10:15  | 5:6,10 8:10,16      |
| need 7:24 8:12             | <b>Okay</b> 4:7,9 5:5 6:1 | 24:10 41:20,23          | 16:4 17:17,25           | 29:8,10 33:20       |
| 31:20 32:12 46:16          | 6:14 7:8,24 8:7           | participant 33:19       | 46:20                   | 37:4                |
| 46:21                      | 12:21,21 13:22            | participate 29:15       | planned 42:1            | presiding 1:8       |
| <b>new</b> 6:3 7:14 8:19   | 20:6 25:10 26:2           | participating 4:12      | planning 3:8 7:5        | <b>pretty</b> 43:11 |
| 9:4 11:21 18:7             | 32:7,17,23 33:4           | 29:12                   | 38:14,19                | previously 21:15    |
| 20:11 21:1                 | 33:12 34:18 35:6          | particular 22:13        | playing 13:10           | priests 43:3        |
| news 34:5,12               | 35:9 36:9 37:2,13         | 32:10 46:13             | please 4:5,7 5:13       | <b>prior</b> 28:5   |
| <b>night</b> 43:19         | 39:21 45:6 46:15          | parts 41:20             | 5:15 7:11 12:17         | prioritize 23:10    |
| noncompetitive             | 48:1                      | party 6:3 7:15 9:4      | 19:21 20:4 21:12        | private 41:4 43:12  |
| 42:22                      | once 22:15 45:23          | 11:21 15:20 17:13       | 32:24 33:12 38:23       | 43:24 44:2,4,10     |
| nonselective 43:14         | ones 40:11 44:11          | 20:12 21:1              | point 9:7 18:25         | 44:14,19,21 47:10   |
| <b>non-religious</b> 43:24 | open 30:25                | pass 22:25 23:22        | 32:7 39:8 46:4          | 47:11               |
| 44:19                      | operations 3:6            | passes 7:4 25:24        | police 19:4             | problem 46:5        |
| normal 27:18               | 15:25 19:3 25:25          | 35:8 36:23              | policies 40:8 42:23     | problematic 22:22   |
| normally 29:21             | operatives 17:15          | <b>pending</b> 34:11    | political 16:10         | problems 11:18      |
|                            |                           |                         | l                       |                     |

| procedure 27:10             | <b>quorum</b> 4:14 27:1         | 34:12 39:3   | 4:3,9,10,18,20,22               | 40:13,19 41:7                               |
|-----------------------------|---------------------------------|--|---------------------------------|---|
| 40:3                        | 32:1 37:1,14 38:2               | regardless 22:3  | 4:24 5:1,3,5,8,11               | 44:15 46:12                                 |
| proceed 14:22 40:6          | 46:16                           | 29:22  | 5:18,21,24 6:10                 | satisfies 34:16                             |
| process 11:24 16:2          | R                               | <b>regular</b> 26:24                                     | 6:12,14,17,19,21                | saying 5:16 11:20                           |
| 24:20                       |                                 | related 21:6   | 6:23,25 7:8,24 8:7              | 11:25 16:18 24:11                           |
| <b>produce</b> 20:23        | rabbis 43:4                     | relationship 38:6  | 9:20 10:10 12:21                | 31:14                                       |
| produces 44:25              | <b>racially</b> 34:4            | relatively 19:24   | 13:1,12,19,22                   | says 10:15                                  |
| <b>program</b> 3:8 7:5      | <b>radius</b> 11:3 39:4         | relevant 21:7 23:8                                       | 14:2 15:2 16:8,17               | scatter 22:23                               |
| 38:14,19                    | 47:12<br>raise 19:16 32:1       | 24:14 25:3   | 16:21 17:1,4,9                  | <b>schedule</b> 15:8,12                     |
| progress 7:12               |                                 | religious 42:25  | 19:9,14,18,21                   | 18:20 27:13                                 |
| <b>project</b> 3:9 6:4,7    | raising 32:20                   | 43:4,5 44:2,21   | 20:1,4 21:10,11                 | scheduled 26:11                             |
| 8:7 38:20,23                | random 44:19,20                 | remaining 7:2  | 22:2,6,12 24:24                 | SCHMAUCH 2:10                               |
| 42:17                       | 44:23,25 45:14                  | 25:23 36:22  | 25:10,13,15,17,19               | school 42:21,22                             |
| projects 26:16              | 47:13,14<br>randomization       | remark 12:24 15:5  | 25:21 26:2,21                   | 45:10                                       |
| prophecy 27:17              |                                 | remarks 34:4,13  | 27:5,25 28:2,9,11               | schools 39:24 40:18                         |
| proposal 8:15               | 46:7,8                          | remote 30:3,23   | 28:13,15,17,21,25               | 40:20,24 41:3,4,5                           |
| proposals 20:15,20          | <b>range</b> 12:5 14:16<br>42:5 | remotely 11:22,23  | 29:17 31:22 32:3                | 41:9,14,14,22,23                            |
| <b>propose</b> 9:3 12:2     | 42:5<br>rationale 29:23,24      | 29:12  | 32:6,17,23 33:4                 | 43:4,12,20,22                               |
| <b>proposed</b> 3:8 7:6,9   | rationales 22:21                | rent 21:21   | 33:12 34:18,21,23               | 44:8,14,17,19,20                            |
| 8:13 15:8                   | rationales 22.21<br>reach 18:25 | <b>report</b> 3:9 7:7,10                                 | 34:25 35:3,6 36:9               | 44:21                                       |
| <b>provide</b> 7:11 38:23   | read 19:24 20:4                 | 7:12 17:16 36:1  | 36:12,14,16,18,20               | Schuld 2:9 33:18                            |
| <b>provided</b> 16:19       | 34:1 35:19                      | <b>reported</b> 34:5                                     | 37:2,5,7,9,11,13                | scoured 23:16                               |
| <b>public</b> 4:6 29:5      | reading 16:3 41:12              | <b>Reporter</b> 5:8,10,13                                | 37:17,24 38:3,16                | searching 10:4                              |
| 41:3 44:1,11,17             | reads 36:2                      | reports 33:19  | 38:22 45:6 46:19                | second 5:19,20 6:8                          |
| 45:10 47:14                 | really 32:16 40:13              | reprosecuting  | 46:25 47:7 48:1                 | 6:9 14:14 21:11                             |
| <b>publicly</b> 45:21       | reasonable 40:24                | 15:16  | <b>Richmond</b> 45:9,20         | 21:18 26:19,20                              |
| <b>pull</b> 30:11           | 45:18 46:10                     | Republican 15:20   | 47:6                            | 29:17 33:9,10,19                            |
| punt 22:12                  | reasoning 29:20                 | 17:15  | <b>ridiculous</b> 30:12         | 33:22,24 34:1                               |
| purported 34:13             | 47:5                            | request 15:7   | <b>right</b> 13:1 14:4,10       | 40:5,22 41:23                               |
| purpose 25:5                | reasons 40:2                    | requested 36:3   | 16:13 18:6,7                    | 42:25 47:5                                  |
| <b>Pursuant</b> 20:8        | rechartering 33:25              | <b>require</b> 10:21                                     | 22:18 27:5 31:6                 | seconded 20:8                               |
| <b>put</b> 17:10 19:12      | recommendation                  | 27:15 41:8   | 31:20 37:18 38:4                | 32:13                                       |
| 22:16 29:5 31:3             | 19:15 22:15                     | required 19:1 23:5                                       | <b>Rights</b> 1:1 20:13         | secondly 18:19                              |
| putting 19:11               | record 7:1 17:19                | <b>requires</b> 29:2 38:18<br><b>resident</b> 10:21 11:6 | <b>Robert</b> 2:3 39:13         | section 16:24 20:9                          |
| <b>P-R-O-C-E-E-D</b><br>4:1 | 18:25 19:23,25                  | resource 31:19   | roving 10:18 11:6<br>RUDERT 2:5 | 20:9,12 21:6<br>33:22 34:1 36:1             |
|                             | 20:5 21:16 30:10                |  | run 27:20                       |   |
| <b>p.m</b> 48:4             | 37:21,22                        | <b>respond</b> 14:23 17:5<br><b>response</b> 4:17,25     | 1 ull 27.20                     | <b>secure</b> 16:9<br><b>see</b> 5:25 14:22 |
| 0                           | records 17:23 21:5              | 6:11,13 13:18  | S                               | 15:17 23:20 35:9                            |
| question 12:18              | reduced 46:9                    | 14:20 34:11 35:5   | <b>s</b> 35:15                  | 40:9 44:8                                   |
| 17:2 23:2,12 25:9           | reference 23:13                 | 36:8,19 37:12  | SAC 33:24                       | seek 39:5                                   |
| 30:4 40:15 45:9             | referring 19:2 27:8             | 40:14  | sample 39:3,7,10                | select 41:23 43:20                          |
| questions 10:9              | reflect 7:1 35:20               | rest 21:24   | 39:22 40:19 41:19               | selected 43:22 44:7                         |
| 12:10 13:6,21               | 37:22,22                        | result 8:11,21   | 43:5 45:1                       | 44:10,13,17 45:10                           |
| 14:11,12 15:10              | regard 17:19 23:16              | reviewing 23:19  | samples 39:14                   | 45:15                                       |
| 45:6 47:7 48:2              | 23:17 36:7                      | revised 35:15  | 40:16                           | <b>selecting</b> 26:12                      |
| quite 43:13                 | regarding 21:5                  | <b>Reynolds</b> 1:7,10                                   | sampling 39:23                  | 39:22 41:19                                 |
|                             | 0 0 0                           | 1.1,10   |                                 | 57.22 11.17                                 |
| L                           |                                 |  | 1                               | 1   |

#### **single** 15:17 stands 39:10 21:18 25:7 27:14 selection 41:22 surprised 37:17 43:17 44:25 47:13 start 4:6 19:6 26:9 sustained 41:25 **sir** 5:7 27:16 29:1.7.13 sit 29:22 30:7 47:14 started 4:3 31:4 38:12 39:14 Т **selective** 41:5 43:15 situated 11:1 20:18 start-up 12:2 40:23 46:1,9 table 3:1 17:10 state 11:10 33:22 47:17 43:25 44:1,2,3,14 six 47:14 22:14,18 34:2 small 43:15 47:22 stated 24:15 third 34:8 43:7 tactics 37:19 38:4,8 selectivity 42:21 software 44:24 statement 5:14 thoroughly 27:24 take 5:14 28:4 44:24 **sole** 25:2 statistical 44:24 **thought** 10:13 44:10 45:14 self-fulfilling 27:17 Solicitor 2:4 statue 23:5 22:16 40:6 41:15 taken 6:5 21:15 self-preferred somewhat 14:21 statute 23:20 43:8 46:7 33:15 16:23 soon 37:25 stav 22:19 38:14 three 18:23 21:3 takes 8:25 self-referred 11:20 sorry 12:19,23 14:6 step 21:14 22:4 44:13 47:23,23,25 talk 17:25 18:8 seminaries 43:1.1.3 15:4 27:7 39:17 strategies 39:19 **TIM** 2:8 27:19.21 send 35:22 45:4 sort 21:18 41:24 strategy 39:23 **time** 1:7 4:11 9:9 talking 10:25 18:3 sense 9:14 14:21 sounds 47:19 40:14,22 41:7,17 12:2 13:16,20 18:19 43:9 14:12 18:4 19:8 21:23 29:4 42:21 43:21 45:12 46:12 **source** 42:21 **Taylor** 1:12 5:3,4 47:16 speak 7:18,25 stratification 41:8 19:20 26:10,11 6:23,24 25:19,20 sent 8:13 26:3,5 18:18,24 20:7 strong 28:3 47:3 27:23 30:2,2 45:3 28:15,16 35:3,4 39:2 43:19 29:21 43:6 **students** 43:8,9,10 46:24 36:18 37:11 sentence 33:25 speaking 13:13 subcommittee times 30:1.18 31:21 **technical** 41:8 46:4 34:8 35:15,18,19 31:19 20:18 23:25 24:21 31:21.24 teleconference 26:6 **special** 29:5,15,20 25:1 36:4 **timing** 24:12 35:25 26:10 separate 9:17 29:25 30:7,13,19 **subpoena** 20:14,22 **Title** 6:7 teleconferences 30:25 31:9,12,24 40:21 42:5 **titled** 33:22 separately 30:8 28:4 **specific** 23:6,17 **September** 3:4,4,4 subpoenas 14:23 today 22:15 telephone 8:9 33:1,2,2,6,6,6,17 24:7 20:24 21:17 23:4 **Todd** 1:11 19:19 telephonic 1:3 4:12 34:14 35:10 36:7 specifically 9:2 23:10 24:1,23 **TOLHURST** 2:6 26:23 27:14 17:21 23:14 43:2 **set** 16:5 18:14 33:8 success 9:23 **train** 43:2 telephonically 1:7 33:17 34:14 43:25 44:23 **Sudden** 37:18 transcript 12:11 **tell** 8:5 17:12 23:15 sex 3:9 38:15,20,24 specificity 23:1 sufficient 10:5 13:25 31:20 suggest 8:24 9:13 **shift** 14:15 specified 20:21 travel 19:5 telling 25:1 **shifting** 11:16,19 **spent** 12:2 9:18 46:14 **treat** 9:17 tended 17:13 **short** 19:24 **spoke** 8:21 47:10 suggested 26:17 **tricky** 42:7 terms 22:25 23:6 **shot** 13:2,5 15:2 **SPSS** 44:24 **trouble** 18:19 46:12 27:17 33:13 40:25 22:24 squarely 17:10 suggesting 11:13 **try** 15:1 17:25 30:5 test 41:1 staff 1:14 2:1,3 5:5 30:8 39:17 40:9 **show** 45:15.16 11:15 testify 8:24 9:11 5:7 7:10 26:3 suggestions 46:10 trying 8:1 **showed** 11:10 testimony 20:22 29:7,9,11.20 showing 17:15 summary 45:2 **turned** 45:15 46:7 **Thank** 5:11 18:10 **side** 29:6,6,9,11,13 32:24 36:1 38:22 supplying 13:18 **two** 14:11,24 15:13 18:10 38:25 39:12 29:16 30:15 38:25 39:13.16 support 31:2 32:8 18:23 20:15 21:2 48:2 **sign** 24:23 40:16,17,18 41:21 38:7 39:18 41:20 44:10 thereof 38:1 similarly 20:18 47:9,10,21 **suppose** 19:24 44:10 47:11,12,15 **Thernstrom** 4:15 **simple** 22:4 28:23 stage 9:2 10:5 27:11 38:12 type 38:4 41:9 4:16 simplest 41:16 11:17 supposed 31:13 **types** 38:8 40:24 **things** 38:7 40:16 **simply** 11:22 16:18 standard 22:24 sure 15:13 22:8,24 typical 26:8 think 8:12 14:21 18:11.16 27:13 23:7 24:14 26:10 32:24 47:4 U 15:24 19:3 21:16

Neal R. Gross & Co., Inc. 202-234-4433

surprise 29:3

30:8 43:9 44:9

26:11

#### Page 55

| Page | 5 | 6 |
|------|---|---|
|------|---|---|

|                            | 1                  | 1   | 1                                |                   |
|----------------------------|--------------------|---|----------------------------------|-------------------|
| unanimous 20:3             | walk 27:1          | worth 47:5  | <b>11:30</b> 1:7 26:11           | <b>8</b> 3:5 33:2 |
| undergraduate              | want 15:22 17:6,9  | wouldn't 12:6                                     | <b>11:38</b> 4:2                 | <b>8th</b> 33:7   |
| 42:2,3                     | 19:8,12 21:18      | wound 45:1  | <b>11:39</b> 4:10                |                   |
| understand 14:9            | 22:10 27:19 31:24  | WRIGHT 2:6  | <b>12:28</b> 48:4                | 9                 |
| 16:21 19:14 23:13          | 40:9 42:24 46:3    | written 20:23                                     | <b>125</b> 43:10                 | <b>9th</b> 26:3   |
| 24:3 26:23 28:2,6          | wanted 5:25,25     |   | <b>16</b> 3:5 33:3               | <b>9:30</b> 26:9  |
| <b>unfair</b> 29:13        | 47:16              | Y   | <b>16th</b> 33:7                 |                   |
| universities 39:4,7        | Washington 8:23    | <b>Yaki</b> 1:13 5:1,2                            | <b>1975(a)</b> 20:9              |                   |
| University 45:9,16         | 9:16,19 11:8,17    | 6:21,22 7:2,22,23                                 |                                  |                   |
| 45:20 47:6                 | 12:6 13:25 14:16   | 8:3,4 10:8,9,11,12                                | 2                                |                   |
| unsuitable 42:16           | 19:5               | 10:24 11:13,18                                    | <b>2</b> 33:23,23 35:20          |                   |
| unusual 41:25              | wasn't 40:7 45:3   | 12:4,8,16,20,23                                   | <b>2009</b> 1:5 4:11 20:16       |                   |
| update 3:8,9 6:7           | wasting 13:20      | 13:3,6,14,21,23                                   | 33:7 34:11 35:14                 |                   |
| 7:6,9,11 9:21              | watcher 11:5,6     | 14:4,6,24 15:4                                    | <b>2010</b> 3:6,9,9 6:6 7:7      |                   |
| 38:20,23                   | watchers 9:10      | 16:14,15,18,22                                    | 7:10 26:1,4,19                   |                   |
| updated 26:5               | 10:14,15,17,19     | 17:2,3,6,12 18:10                                 | 36:4 38:20,23                    |                   |
| <b>urge</b> 18:11          | 11:1 17:15,22      | 19:9,12 22:7,8,20                                 | <b>21</b> 20:16                  |                   |
| <b>USC</b> 20:9            | way 8:15 14:8 15:7 | 24:2,3,13,25                                      | <b>22nd</b> 26:5                 |                   |
| <b>use</b> 27:9 39:19 41:8 | 30:24 40:6 41:16   | 25:17,18,22 26:22                                 | <b>24</b> 3:4 33:2               |                   |
| utterly 12:25              | 46:6,8 47:18       | 27:3,6,7,25 28:1                                  | <b>24th</b> 33:6                 |                   |
| <b>U.S</b> 1:1             | website 42:11      | 28:13,14,20,22                                    | <b>250</b> 43:9                  |                   |
|                            | <b>we're</b> 18:18 | 29:1,24 31:7,14                                   | <b>26</b> 3:6                    |                   |
| V                          | whatsoever 22:25   | 31:18 32:7,14,18                                  |                                  |                   |
| <b>vague</b> 23:4          | 29:4               | 32:19 34:25 35:1                                  | 3                                |                   |
| <b>variety</b> 10:17       | willing 11:8 32:10 | 35:2,7,21 36:16                                   | <b>3</b> 3:4 33:1                |                   |
| various 34:5               | willingness 8:23   | 36:17,21,25 37:3                                  | <b>3rd</b> 33:6,17 34:14         |                   |
| <b>Vice</b> 4:15,15        | wind 43:11         | 37:4,15,15,18                                     | <b>30</b> 1:5                    |                   |
| video 15:19 18:3           | <b>wish</b> 18:24  | Yaki's 28:19 38:1                                 | <b>30th</b> 4:11                 |                   |
| videographer 9:24          | withdraw 15:5      | <b>Yea</b> 5:16                                   | <b>300</b> 30:20                 |                   |
| <b>videos</b> 9:25,25      | witness 15:18      | <b>year</b> 26:14,19                              | <b>33</b> 3:4                    |                   |
| <b>view</b> 46:5           | witnesses 8:10,16  | yesterday 23:19                                   | <b>38</b> 3:9                    |                   |
| <b>views</b> 28:5          | 10:6,25 13:25      | 40:20   | 4                                |                   |
| <b>virtue</b> 30:13        | 16:9,11 18:4,5     | <b>York</b> 8:19                                  | <b>42</b> 20:9                   |                   |
| <b>vote</b> 5:14 6:6,15,25 | 20:19 23:14        | <b>YouTube</b> 10:1                               | <b>42</b> 20.9<br><b>45</b> 20:9 |                   |
| 19:10 25:11,21             | <b>woman</b> 18:4  | 15:19   | 45 20.9                          |                   |
| 28:7,17,18,18              | women 39:25 40:9   | Z   | 5                                |                   |
| 34:19 35:7,22              | 41:4               |   | <b>5</b> 3:3 24:15               |                   |
| 36:10,20 38:12,18          | <b>wonder</b> 31:3 | <b>Zip</b> 42:9,10                                |                                  |                   |
| 46:19,21                   | wondering 16:23    | 1   | 6                                |                   |
| voted 7:2,3 25:22          | word 35:17         | <b>1,000</b> 43:8                                 | <b>6th</b> 32:25                 |                   |
| 25:23 34:2 36:22           | wording 24:5       | <b>100</b> 8:18 42:5                              |                                  |                   |
| voter 7:13 35:16,23        | words 35:16        | <b>100</b> 8.18 42.5<br><b>100-mile</b> 11:3 12:5 | 7                                |                   |
| voters 15:24 19:7          | work 15:12 30:22   | 14:16 39:4 47:12                                  | 7 3:8,8                          |                   |
| <b>votes</b> 21:15 35:7    | <b>worker</b> 18:6 | <b>11</b> 3:4 33:2                                | <b>7th</b> 35:14                 |                   |
| <b>Voting</b> 20:13        | workers 8:17 11:10 | <b>11</b> 5.4 55.2<br><b>11th</b> 33:6 35:10      | <b>7024</b> 20:9                 |                   |
| <b>VRA</b> 21:5            | working 21:20      | 36:7  | 8                                |                   |
| W                          | 23:24              | <b>11(b)</b> 20:12 21:6                           | ð                                |                   |
|                            |                    | (0) 20.12 21.0                                    |                                  |                   |